

#### STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov BETTY T. YEE First District, San Francisco

SEN. GEORGE RUNNER (RET.) Second District, Lancaster

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JEROME E. HORTON Fourth District, Los Angeles

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

KRISTINE CAZADD Executive Director

## STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 5901 Green Valley Circle, Room 207, Culver City April 24-26, 2012

#### PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTIONS

Tuesday, April 24, 2012

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the April 24-26, 2012, Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Claudia Madrigal at 916-324-8261 or e-mail: Claudia.Madrigal@boe.ca.gov. Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

#### **Board Meeting**

A. Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Hearings There are no items for this matter.

## B. Corporate Franchise and Personal Income Tax Hearings

B1. James J. Martin, 574254

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination. The	Mr. Horton	Yes
Board ordered that the appeal be	Ms. Steel	Yes
submitted for decision, granting the appellant 30 days to submit	Mr. Runner	Yes
supporting documents, the	Ms. Yee	Yes
Franchise Tax Board 30 days to respond, and the Appeals Division 30 days thereafter to review the parties' submissions and provide its recommendation to the Board.	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

# B2. Applied Companies, 526527

# B3. Shirley A. Tolela, 522393

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's appeal granted.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	No

# B4. Michael Zapara and Gina Zapara, 252128

## B5. Michael B. Lozada, 578331 – Waived Appearance

20: 11101140: 2: 202444; 0: 000: 11411104: 1.p.04141100		
<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's appeal denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

# C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

# C1. Chomsik Pak, 516137 (AS)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Mr. Horton	No
granted/denied.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	No

# C2. Heartbeat, Inc., 417580 (AC) – Waived Appearance

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
Approved staff recommendation.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C3. Ike Reuben Chukwudi, 505067 (EH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
The Board directed staff to inform	Ms. Steel	Yes
the taxpayer of the Offer in	Mr. Runner	Yes
Compromise program.	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C4. Rodrigo Moreno Incorporated, 432710 (EH)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Mr. Horton	Yes
granted/denied.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	No

C5. Niknejad, Inc., 487383 (AS)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's claim denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	No
	Mr. Runner	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

# D. Special Taxes Appeals Hearings

These items are scheduled for Thursday, April 26, 2012.

E. Property Tax Appeals Hearings
There are no items for this matter.

#### F. Public Hearings

- F1. Property Taxes State Assessees' Presentations on the Valuation of State-Assessed Properties
- F2. Business Taxpayers' Bill of Rights Hearings
- F3. Property Taxpayers' Bill of Rights Hearings

## G. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters – Consent

G1. Legal Appeals Matters

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

- ➤ Hearing Notices Sent No Response
  - 1a. Chief Red Cloud, LLC, 298286 (EA)
  - 1b. Arleen Dauber and Gerald Patrick Robeson, 298276 (EA)
  - 2. D and L Wireless, Inc., 535814 (EA)
  - 3. Michael C. Hamaker, 394900, 421467 (UT)
  - 4. Hubbard Iron Doors, Inc., 491571 (AA)
  - 5. Rivkah, Inc., 459053 (AS)
  - 6. T.K.O. Lighting, Inc., 469451 (FH)
  - 7. White Skin Care & More, Inc., 489645 (AS)
- Hearing Notice Sent Appearance Waived
  - 8. BMR Group, Inc., 326194, 340599, 353337, 353339 (EH)
- Petitions for Release of Seized Property
  - 9. QM Corporation, 600252 (ET)
  - 10. Fuad Naji Saeed and Waleed Saeed Ben Saeed, 601282 (ET)
  - 11. Yong Soo Kim and Mihyun Kim, 600350 (ET)
  - 12. Steven Nguyen, 602382 (ET)
  - 13. Clarity World, Inc., 600246 (ET)

#### G2. Franchise and Income Tax Matters

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

#### Decisions

- 1. Dawn C. Almanzor, 537241
- 2. Patrick Amott, 570245
- 3. Maxine L. Angell, 567797
- 4. Ronald P. Cox and Chen Li, 537134
- 5. Paola M. Figueroa, 562808
- 6. Gauss Institute, Inc., 554193
- 7. Kevin G. Guerin and Deborah T. Connie, 439525
- 8. Donald Iwanski and Denise Iwanski, 529421
- 9. Douglas B. Lewis and Beverly C. Lewis, 522871
- 10. Lisa MacCarty, 557915
- 11. James Roy Mick, Jr., 574311
- 12. Nathan Porter, 578777
- 13. Christine J. Riddle, 558199
- 14. Monica Trejos, 565924
- 15. Chigoziem Uzoigwe, 547523
- 16. Denise A. Willson, 554481
- Petitions for Rehearing
  - 17. Brian David Black and Carol A. Black, 529472
  - 18. H&H Marine Center, Inc., 490565
  - 19. Marie R. Sanders, 522825
- G3. Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Matters There are no items for this matter.

#### G4. Sales and Use Taxes Matters

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

#### Redeterminations

- 1. Castec, Inc., 435825 (AC)
- 2. Tenet Healthsystem Hospitals, Inc., 571351 (AA)
- 3. The Boeing Company, 434143 (OH)
- 4. McKesson Medical Surgical, Inc., 493770 (OH)

- 5. Olympus America, Inc., 570959 (OH)
- 6. Casa De Carlos, Inc., 472423 (AC)
- 7. ADAC Research & Mfg., Inc., 507469 (GH)
- 8. Easy Fuel, Inc., 444640 (GH)
- 9. Extreme Networks, Inc., 571359 (GH)
- Denials of Claims for Refund
  - 10. CNET Networks, Inc., 531039 (BH)
  - 11. Modern Finance Company, 574940 (AC)
  - 12. Credit One Corporation, 565984 (EA)

# G5. Sales and Use Taxes Matters – Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes – except not participating in sub-item 7.
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

- Credits and Cancellations
  - 1. Jalidat Incorporated, 600410 (AC)
  - 2. Jose Vargas Galvan, 597289 (BH)
- Refunds
  - 3. Chevron U.S.A., Inc., 598182 (BH)
  - 4. Coherent, Inc., 597920 (GH)
  - 5. Raytheon Technical Services Company, 504862 (OH)
  - 6. US Airways, Inc., 564708 (OH)
  - 7. ConocoPhillips Company, 561903 (OH)
  - 8. Cymer, Inc., 533167 (FH)
  - 9. APC Sales & Service Corp., 564713 (OH)
  - 10. VFS Financing, Inc., 483160 (OH)
  - 11. Witron Integrated Logistics, Inc., 600411 (OH)
  - A & A Amalgated Printing Enterprises, Inc., 351026 (AS)
  - 13. Harris Salinas Rebar, Inc., 577235 (OH)
  - 14. CNET Networks, Inc., 531039 (BH)
  - 15. Americredit Financial Service, Inc., 588262 (OH)
  - 16. Lobel Financial Corporation, 593154 (EA)
  - 17. Modern Finance Company, 574940 (AC)
  - 18. Credit One Corporation, 565984 (EA)
  - 19. Jag Footwear Accessories & Retail, 597917 (OH)
  - 20. Sun Community Federal Credit Union, 589949 (FH)
  - 21. GMAC Automotive Bank, 525120 (OH)
  - 22. The Nautilus Group, Inc., 602996 (OH)
  - 23. Backstage Web, Inc., 597514 (AS)
  - 24. Chrysler Financial Services America, LLC, 358805 (OH)
  - 25. Cureline, Inc., 565990 (BH)

G6. Special Taxes Matters

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Not Participating

- Relief of Penalty
  - 1. Health Plan of San Mateo, 600012 (ET) 'CF'
  - 2. Health Net Life Insurance Company, 600044 (ET) 'CF'

There are no items for the following matters:

- G7. Special Taxes Matters Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds
- G8. Property Tax Matters
- G9. Cigarette License Fee Matters
- G10. Legal Appeals Property Tax Matters
- H. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters Adjudicatory There are no items for this matter.

#### I. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters

- Property Taxes Matters
   There are no items for this matter.
- 12. Offer in Compromise Recommendation

1. Thomas Horrell Ray

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

13. Local Tax Reallocation Matters
There are no items for this matter.

#### **Chief Counsel Matters**

There are no items for the following matters:

- J. Rulemaking
- K. Business Taxes
- L. Property Taxes
- M. Other Chief Counsel Matters

#### **Administrative Session**

#### N. Consent Agenda

This item is scheduled for Thursday, April 26, 2012.

O. Adoption of Board Committee Reports and Approval of Committee Actions
There are no items for this matter.

#### P. Other Administrative Matters

This item is scheduled for Thursday, April 26, 2012.

#### Q. Closed Session

These items are scheduled for Wednesday, April 25, 2012.



#### STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov BETTY T. YEE First District, San Francisco

SEN. GEORGE RUNNER (RET.) Second District, Lancaster

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JEROME E. HORTON Fourth District, Los Angeles

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

KRISTINE CAZADD Executive Director

## STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 5901 Green Valley Circle, Room 207, Culver City April 24-26, 2012

#### PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTIONS

Wednesday, April 25, 2012

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the April 24-26, 2012, Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Claudia Madrigal at 916-324-8261 or e-mail: Claudia.Madrigal@boe.ca.gov. Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

#### **Board Meeting**

#### C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C6. Sanitech Corporation, 477146 (OH)

C7. Kamal Noorzady, 509930 (EH) – Waived Appearance

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
Approved staff recommendation.	Ms. Steel	Yes
The Board directed staff to inform	Mr. Runner	Yes
the taxpayer of the Offer in	Ms. Yee	Yes
Compromise program.	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

# C8. Omar Manzor Motawakel and Farzan Farmani, 519058 (AC)

# C9. Guillermo Memo Estrada, 437729 (AR)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination. The	Mr. Horton	Yes
Board ordered that the petition be	Ms. Steel	Yes
submitted for decision, granting the petitioner 30 days to file supporting	Mr. Runner	Yes
documents, the Department	Ms. Yee	Yes
30 days to respond, and the	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes
Appeals Division 30 days		
thereafter to review the parties' submissions and provide its		
recommendation to the Board.		

C10. LR Auto, Inc., 511001, 539222 (EA) - Waived Appearance

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition and claim	Mr. Horton	Yes
denied. Approved staff	Ms. Steel	Yes
recommendation.	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C11. Highline Specialist Corp., 468309 (EA)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Mr. Horton	Yes
granted/denied.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C12. David Bryan Royal, 515517 (AC)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
The Board directed staff to inform	Ms. Steel	Yes
the taxpayer of the Offer in	Mr. Runner	Yes
Compromise program.	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C13a. Randolph Hope Bruce Murad, 404667 (FH) C13b. Michelle Pauline Murad, 404668 (FH)

C14. John M. Young, 446018 (UT)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's claim denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	No
	Mr. Runner	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C15. HK Cuisine, Inc., 522224 (EH)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Mr. Horton	Yes
granted/denied.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C16. Tim Finnell, Inc., 521823, 577253 (EH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Postponed to next available Culver	Mr. Horton	
City Board Meeting.	Ms. Steel	
	Mr. Runner	
	Ms. Yee	
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	

# Q. Closed Session



#### STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov BETTY T. YEE First District, San Francisco

SEN. GEORGE RUNNER (RET.) Second District, Lancaster

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JEROME E. HORTON Fourth District, Los Angeles

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

KRISTINE CAZADD Executive Director

## STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 5901 Green Valley Circle, Room 207, Culver City April 24-26, 2012

## PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTIONS

Thursday, April 26, 2012

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the April 24-26, 2012, Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Claudia Madrigal at 916-324-8261 or e-mail: Claudia.Madrigal@boe.ca.gov. Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

#### **Board Meeting**

#### C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C17. Zoba International Corp., 434591 (EH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination. The Board ordered that the petition be submitted for decision, granting the petitioner 30 days to file supporting documents, the Department 30 days to respond, and the Appeals Division 30 days thereafter to review the parties' submissions and provide its recommendation to the Board	Mr. Horton Ms. Steel Mr. Runner Ms. Yee Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes

C18. East Coast Foods, Inc., 444779 (AS)

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
No final determination.	Mr. Horton	Yes
The Board directed staff to conduct	Ms. Steel	Yes
a reaudit.	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C19. James Eugene Goldstein, 442332 (AC)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
The matter was deferred pending	Mr. Horton	Yes
settlement of related case.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C20. Union Outlet, Inc., 547465 (AS)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final determination.	Mr. Horton	Yes
The Board directed staff to conduct	Ms. Steel	Yes
a reaudit.	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

# C21. Stefano Jean Louigi Raspi, 309546 (AS)

C22. Jay Newman, 519365, 571504 (AC)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition and claim	Mr. Horton	Yes
granted.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C23a. M & Y Safar Brothers, Inc., 466345 (AS) – Waived Appearance C23b. M & Y Safar Brothers, Inc., 467762 (AS) – Waived Appearance

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petitions denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
Approved staff recommendation.	Ms. Steel	No
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C24. Biz Source, Inc., 493796 (EH)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Mr. Horton	Yes
granted/denied.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	No

# D. Special Taxes Appeals Hearings

D1. Loh Sun International, Inc., Kent La, Nancy La, and John La, 480987, 480989, 506428 (ET)

, , ,		
DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	No
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

#### D2. Ashraf Alfonose Youssef, 358704 (ET)

#### **Petition for Release of Seized Property**

D3. Mairaj Ali, 562696 (ET) – Waived Appearance

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Mr. Horton	Yes
Approved staff recommendation.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

#### **Administrative Session**

N. Consent Agenda

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Mr. Horton	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Mr. Runner	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

- N1. Approval of 2012/13 Tobacco Products Tax Rate
- N2. Readjustment to the Prepayment Rate of Sales Tax on Diesel Fuel

#### P. Other Administrative Matters

- P1. Executive Director's Report
  - CROS Project Update and Actions

There are no items for the following matters:

- P2. Chief Counsel Report
- P3. Sales and Use Tax Deputy Director's Report
- P4. Property and Special Taxes Deputy Director's Report
- P5. Administration Deputy Director's Report
- P6. Technology Deputy Director's Report
- P7. External Affairs Deputy Director's Report