

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE
HELD AT FOLLATON HOUSE, TOTNES, ON WEDNESDAY, 23 JUNE 2004**

MEMBERS

* Cllr G J Fielden - Chairman

* Cllr I Longrigg - Vice-Chairman

* Cllr N A Barnes	∅ Cllr E T Mitchell
∅ Cllr H D Bastone	* Cllr J T Pennington
* Cllr B F Cane	* Cllr M A Roadknight
∅ Cllr B E Carson	* Cllr R Rowe
∅ Cllr R J Carter	* Cllr J W Squire
* Cllr B C Evans	* Cllr I P Steer
* Cllr S M Fairman	* Cllr D W S Thorning
* Cllr R W Hallett	* Cllr R J Tucker
* Cllr V A Harvey	* Cllr A R Vale
* Cllr J D Hawkins	* Cllr A Ward
* Cllr P W Hitchins	* Cllr J A Westacott
∅ Cllr D W May	

* Denotes attendance

∅ Denotes apology for absence

Also in attendance but not participating:
Cllr J Brazil

DC.8/04 **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 26 May 2004 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

DC.9/04 **CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The Chairman advised Members that this meeting would be the first to be serviced by the Member Support Officer, Darryl White and welcomed him to the meeting. The Chairman also announced that on behalf of the Members, he had thanked Mark Evans for his dedication and hard work. Mark had recently left his position as Area Planning Officer at the Council to take up a post with Plymouth City Council.

DC.10/04 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Members were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered during the course of the meeting. These were recorded as follows:-

Cllrs V A Harvey, P W Hitchens and I P Steer declared a prejudicial interest in application number 14/2146/03/F (Demolition of garage blocks and construction of 3 no. dwellings and associated car parking facilities – Tolchers Vineyard, Dartington, Totnes, TQ9 6HN) by virtue of their membership on Tor Homes Board, and left the meeting during consideration of this item;

Cllr A R Vale declared a prejudicial interest in application number 44/0858/04/F (Erection of single storey dining/café centre and two storey student accommodation block Slapton Ley Field Centre, Slapton Road, Slapton, Kingsbridge, TQ7 2QP) by virtue of his former employment at the centre and his friendship with the applicant, and left the meeting during consideration of this item.

DC.11/04 **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

The Chairman announced that the following members of the public had registered their wish to speak at the meeting:-

- 30/2154/03/F – Agent – Dr John Grimes
Replacement of stone sea defence with associated works – Inverdart Boathouse, Beacon Lane, Kingswear, Dartmouth, TQ6 0BT;
- 39/0216/04/LB & 39/0217/04/F – Objector – Mrs Patricia Lauren
Listed Building Consent for the installation of glazed roof over rear courtyard and erection of front porch – Michaelmas Cottage, Marley House, Rattery, TQ10 9JX;
- 58/0587/04/F – Objector – Mr Roy Fairclough
Erection of dwelling and associated landscape/parking provisions – Swiss Cottage, Andurn Estate, Down Thomas, Plymouth, PL9 0AT;
- 14/0715/04/F – Supporter – Mrs Kate Price
Conversion of redundant farm building to dwelling – Coxlake, Westcombe, Dartington, Totnes;
- 41/0799/04/F – Objector – Mr Gledhill
Alterations and extension – Treetops, Bonfire Hill, Salcombe, TQ8 8EE;
- 21&57/0833/04/CU – Objector – Mr John Trentham
Field at Ludbrook Gate, Ermington, Ivybridge PL21 0LL – Change of use of land to mixed use for the keeping of horses and agricultural use;
- 05/0840/04/F – Applicant – Mrs Shine
Erection of summerhouse for leisure and storing garden tools – Jubilee House, Easton House, Bigbury, Kingsbridge, TQ7 4AN;

- 59/0850/04/F –Applicant – Mr Stevenson
Alteration and extension to dwelling – Midships, West Alvington, Kingsbridge, TQ7 3PG;
- 44/0858/04/F – Objector – Mrs Dabbs; Applicant – Mr Keith Chell
Erection of single storey dining/café centre and two storey student accommodation block – Slapton Ley Field Centre, Slapton, Kingsbridge, TQ7 2QP;
- 09/0887/04/F – Objector – Mr Hoggart; Applicant – Mrs G Hart
Erection of dwelling, associated landscaping and parking facilities – Charleton Court, West Charleton, Kingsbridge, TQ7 2AE.

DC.12/04 **SITE INSPECTIONS**

(a) **Applications deferred at this meeting**

RESOLVED

That a Site Inspection Group comprising the Chairman and Cllrs Evans, Fairman, Hitchins and Rowe be appointed to consider applications deferred at this meeting for that purpose.

DC.13/04 **PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

The Planning and Building Control Manager submitted details of planning applications as indicated in Appendix A to these minutes.

During discussion of these planning applications, the following motions were **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote were either **CARRIED** or **LOST**:-

- (a) In respect of application numbers 39/0216/04/LB and 39/0217/04/F, (Listed Building Consent for the installation of glazed roof over rear courtyard and erection of front porch – Michaelmas Cottage, Marley House, Rattery, TQ10 9JX), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED**, and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED**:-

“That a site inspection be undertaken”;

- (b) In respect of application number 58/0587/04/F, (Erection of dwelling and associated landscape/parking provisions – Swiss Cottage, Andurn Estate, Down Thomas, Plymouth, PL9 0AT), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED**, and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED**:-

“That a site inspection be undertaken”;

- (c) In respect of application number 41/0799/04/F, (Alterations and extension – Treetops, Bonfire Hill, Salcombe, TQ8 8EE), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED**, and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED**:-

“That a site inspection be undertaken”;

- (d) In respect of application number 21&57/0833/04/CU, (Field at Ludbrook Gate, Ermington, Ivybridge, PL21 0LL – Change of use of land to mixed use for the keeping of horses and agricultural use), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED**, and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED**:-

“That a site inspection be undertaken”;

- (e) In respect of application number 05/0840/04/F, (Erection of summerhouse for leisure and storing garden tools – Jubilee House, Easton House, Bigbury, Kingsbridge, TQ7 4AN), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED**:-

“That planning permission be approved on the grounds that the application was not visually prominent.”

- (f) In respect of application number 59/0850/04/F, (Alteration and extension to dwelling – Midships, West Alvington, Kingsbridge, TQ7 3PG), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **LOST**:-

“That planning permission be approved”;

The following matters were reported and noted by the Committee during consideration of DC.13/04 and Appendix A:-

- (i) 30/2154/03/F, (Replacement of stone sea defence with associated works – Inverdart Boathouse, Beacon Lane, Kingswear, Dartmouth, TQ6 0BT):

The inclusion of additional conditions: “accordance with plans and facing stone not collected from beach”;

- (ii) 09/0887/04/F, (Erection of dwelling, associated landscaping and parking facilities – Charleton Court, West Charleton, Kingsbridge, TQ7 2AE):

The inclusion of an additional condition: “screening”.

RESOLVED

That the planning applications considered at this meeting be determined as indicated in Appendix A to these minutes.

DC.14/04 **WITHDRAWN APPLICATION**

The Committee noted that application number 49/0881/04/F, (Demolition of existing garages and stables, construction of a detached house with parking spaces for Stable Cottage, Land adj. Stable Cottage, 2 Mount Pleasant, Venton, Plymouth, PL7 5DU) had been withdrawn by the applicant prior to the start of the meeting.

(Meeting commenced at 2.00 pm and concluded at 5.40 pm).

Chairman

DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE – WEDNESDAY, 23 JUNE 2004

The following matters were reported to and noted by the Committee during consideration of DC.12/04 and Appendix A:-

30/2154/03/F	Letters circulated	4 of objection 2 of comment 3 of concern 1 of support
39/0216/04/LB & 39/0217/04/F	Letters circulated	9 of objection 3 of comment 1 of concern 2 of support
22/0575/04/F	Letters circulated	1 of comment
58/0587/04/F	Letters circulated	9 of objection 1 of comment 3 of concern 1 of support
14/0715/04/F	Letters circulated	12 of support
41/0799/04/F	Letters circulated	8 of objection 1 of comment
21 & 57/0833/04/CU	Letters circulated	5 of objection 1 of comment 1 of concern
05/0840/04/F	Letters circulated	3 of support
59/0850/04/F	Letters circulated	1 of concern 2 of support
44/0858/04/F	Letters circulated	10 of objection (and one petition of 71 signatories) 5 of comment 2 of support
09/0887/04/F	Letters circulated	6 of objection 1 of comment 3 of concern 5 of support

APPENDIX A

14/2146/03/F

Demolition of garage blocks and construction of 3 No dwellings and associated car parking facilities – Tolchers Vineyard, Dartington, Totnes, Devon, TQ9 6HN – Tor Homes

DARTINGTON

Parish Councils' Views – No objections with concerns

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional approval with additional condition imposed

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions:

Standard Time Limit

Revised Plans

Materials

Rooflights

Garaging/Car Parking

Full Details Flues etc

30/2154/03/F

Replacement of stone sea defence with associated works – Inverdart Boathouse, Beacon Lane, Kingswear, Dartmouth, Devon, TQ6 0BT

KINGSWEAR

Parish Councils' Views – No objections – suggest that the “local masonry” should not be sourced from the beach

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions:

Standard

Revised Plans

Stonework

Pump Siting

No infilling behind wall

Stone facing not to be retrieved from beach

39/0216/04/LB & 39/0217/04/F

39/0216/04/LB – Listed Building Consent for the installation of glazed roof over rear courtyard and erection of front porch and 39/0217/04/F – Installation of glazed roof over rear courtyard and erection of front porch – Michaelmas Cottage, Marley House, Rattery, Devon, TQ10 9JX – Dr & Ms K Thompson

RATTERY

Parish Councils' Views – Views awaited

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional approval both applications

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

22/0575/04/F

Retrospective application for erection of 2m timber garden fence – Hlothran, Church Street, Halwell, Totnes, Devon, TQ9 7JB – Mr C Heap

HALWELL

Parish Councils' Views – No objection

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Refusal and enforcement authorised (refer to Committee report)

Reasons for Refusal:

- 1 The proposed development is detrimental to the visual amenities of the locality and is not locally distinctive. The development, by reason of the close proximity to the road, size and materials used in the reflective boards attached to the fence, harmfully affect the character and appearance of the streetscene. Such development is contrary to the provisions of Structure Plan Policies C2, C9, emerging Structure Plan Policy C01, South Hams Local Plan Policies SHDC1, SHDC15; emerging Local Plan Policies DS3, DEV2 DEV23, and relevant Central Government Guidance.

- 2 The proposed development is contrary to Structure Plan Policy T19, South Hams Local Plan Policy SHDC1 and Local Plan Review Policy DS3 in that it would cause interference with the free flow of traffic, and thereby prejudice the safety of all other road users.

58/0587/04/F

Erection of dwelling and associated landscape/parking provisions – Swiss Cottage, Andurn Estate, Down Thomas, Plymouth, Devon, PL9 0AT – Mr N Philpott

WEMBURY

Parish Councils' Views – No objections but concern

Officer Update – 8 additional letters of representation; outcome of negotiations on siting and design reported

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

14/0715/04/F

Conversion of redundant farm building to dwelling – Coxlake, Westcombe, Dartington, Totnes, Devon – Mr & Mrs P Dunster

DARTINGTON

Parish Councils' Views – No objection

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Refusal

Reasons for Refusal:

- 1 The proposal comprises development in the countryside divorced from and unrelated to any settlement nucleus. Such development is contrary to policies C2, C11, H4, SHDC3, SHDC4, SHDC15, SHDC19, DEV2, DEV23, ENV12, HO11 and EMP4 contained in the County Structure Plan, the South

Hams Local Plan and the South Hams Local Plan Review. Conversion of an existing building can be acceptable in certain circumstances as an exception to these policies. In this instance the proposal is not considered to be acceptable. The conversion of the building to a residential use, would, in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, introduce a residential character which would significantly change the existing character and appearance of the building to the detriment of the locality. It would involve changes to the fabric of the building and introduce modern domestic elements to the building by way of the introduction of modern window units, new window openings at both ground floor and upper floor level, the infilling of the derelict east gable with large domestic window units and the re-roofing of the building. Whilst the internal features have historic merit, the building is not a listed building, and although the application would integrate internal features of historic interest, the merits of retaining such historic features does not offset the harmful changes to the building.

- 2 The proposal would harm the setting of the building which would be detrimental to the rural character of the area. The building stands apart from any other buildings and occupies an isolated roadside position in the landscape, which is a designated AGLV. It is clearly visible on passing and the changes proposed not only to the building, but also to the area immediately surrounding the building, would have a harmful effect on the existing character and appearance of the landscape protected area. For these reasons the development is considered contrary to Development Plan Policies C2, C6, SHDC3, DS4, DEV23 and ENV3.
- 3 The supporting information submitted with the application implies an agricultural need for the proposed residential accommodation, however, full details of the need have not been submitted. Even if an agricultural need was established, the details of the current application do not satisfy the relevant policies relating to conversion and, therefore, despite the agricultural need implications, the proposal would be contrary to Development Plan Policies C11, H4, SHDC4, SHDC19, ENV12, HO11 and EMP4.
- 4 On the basis of the information submitted, the Local Planning Authority has not been informed whether the proposal will affect any protected species. Mindful of the presence of bats in the locality and the potential that bats may use the existing building for roosting, and the absence of any submitted ecological/wildlife survey of the application site, there is no guarantee that the proposal will not have an adverse effect on protected species. Therefore the Local Planning Authority considers it reasonable to issue a holding reason for refusal on the basis of Development Plan Policies C17 and ENV8 and relevant Central Government guidance.
- 5 The proposal is considered contrary to Devon Structure Plan Policies T2 and T19 and the advice contained in PPG13, in that it is situated at a non-sustainable location where there is no practical alternative means of transport to the private car and the roads serving the site are unsuitable to cater for the additional traffic movements that would result from the conversion of the barn to a residential unit.

41/0799/04/F

Alterations and extension – Treetops, Bonfire Hill, Salcombe, Devon, TQ8 8EE – Mr & Mrs M Vaissiere

SALCOMBE

Town Councils' Views – Refusal

Officer Update – Applicant letter reported

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

21&57/0833/04/CU

Change of use of land to mixed use for the keeping of horses and agricultural use – Field at Ludbrook Gate, Ermington, Ivybridge, Devon, PL21 0LL – Mr & Mrs J E Knapman

ERMINGTON/UGBOROUGH

Parish Councils' Views – Ugborough: objection road safety and inappropriate site;
Ermington: see letter

Officer Update – Correction to neighbouring properties

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

05/0840/04/F

Erection of summerhouse for leisure use and storing garden tools – Jubilee House, Easton House, Bigbury, Kingsbridge, Devon, TQ7 4AN – Mr & Mrs A J Shine

BIGBURY

Parish Councils' Views – No objection

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions:
Standard Time Limit

59/0850/04/F

Alteration and extension to dwelling – Midships, West Alvington, Kingsbridge, Devon, TQ7 3PG – Mr J Stevenson

WEST ALVINGTON

Parish Councils' Views – Views awaited

Officer Update – 2 letters support reported

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Refusal

Reasons for Refusal:

- 1 The proposed development, by virtue of its form, scale, design and prominence, would adversely affect the appearance and character of the West Alvington Conservation Area. Such development, if permitted, would conflict with the objectives of Government Planning Guidance and Development Plan Policies C4 , C11, SHDC1, SHDC15 and SHDC18.
-

44/0858/04/F

Erection of single storey dining/café centre and two storey student accommodation block – Slapton Ley Field Centre, Sands Road, Slapton, Kingsbridge, Devon, TQ7 2QP – Mr K Chell

SLAPTON

Parish Councils' Views – Views awaited – No objection, but note that noise is an issue

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions:

Standard Time Limit

Accord with Plans

Tree Protection & Details

Tree Protection Works

Tree Retention

Roofing Materials

Construction Access

No Increase in Student Numbers

49/0881/04/F

Demolition of existing garages and stables, construction of a detached house with parking spaces for Stable Cottage – Land adj. Stable Cottage, 2 Mount Pleasant, Venton, Plymouth, Devon, PL7 5DU – Mr R Sweeting

SPARKWELL

Parish Councils' Views – Objection

Officer Update – N/A

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – N/A – Withdrawn

WITHDRAWN

09/0887/04/F

Erection of dwelling, associated landscaping and parking facilities – Charleton Court, West Charleton, Kingsbridge, Devon, TQ7 2AE – Mr & Mrs Hart

CHARLETON

Parish Councils' Views – Refusal (see letter)

Officer Update – 1 letter support and applicant's statement reported and extra condition requested

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions:

Standard Time Limit
Accord with Revised Plans
Natural Slate
Timber Cladding
Windows and Doors
Landscaping
Protection of Trees
Drainage

Parking
Access Improvements
Stonework
Retaining Wall Details
Patio Screen