# **Housing Element**

# TUSTIN TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

October 1, 2013 Adopted by Resolution No. 13-86 This page intentionally left blank.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section	Page
INTRODUCTION	1
STATE LAW AND GENERAL PLAN GUIDELINES	1
SOURCES OF INFORMATION	5
SUMMARY OF HOUSING ISSUES, NEEDS, OPPORTUNITIES, AND CONSTRA	INTS 6
HOUSING NEEDS ASSESSMENT	8
POPULATION/EMPLOYMENT TRENDS	8
HOUSEHOLD CHARACTERISTICS	13
HOUSING STOCK CHARACTERISTICS	27
ASSISTED HOUSING PRESERVATION ANALYSIS	35
CONSTRAINTS TO THE DEVELOPMENT, IMPROVEMENT AND	
MAINTENANCE OF HOUSING	45
GOVERNMENTAL CONSTRAINTS	45
MARKET CONSTRAINTS	63
ENERGY CONSERVATION	67
SUMMARY OF PREVIOUS HOUSING ELEMENT PROGRAMS	69
PROGRESS IN IMPLEMENTING THE 1989 GOALS AND OBJECTIVES	69
REVIEW OF PAST PERFORMANCE	70
APPENDICES:	
A. AFFORDABILITY GAP ANALYSIS	
B. REFERENCES	
C. MAJOR EMPLOYERS IN TUSTIN	

# LIST OF TABLES

	Page
TABLE HTM- 1: Population Growth 2000 - 2012 City of Tustin, Nearby Jurisdictions and Orange County	9
TABLE HTM- 1A: Population Projections 2015 - 2035	10
TABLE HTM- 2: Age Trends 2000-2011 City of Tustin	10
TABLE HTM- 3: Race and Ethnicity: 1990, 2000, 2010 City of Tustin	11
TABLE HTM- 4: Employment by Occupation 2011 City of Tustin	12
TABLE HTM- 5: Employment by Industry 2011 City of Tustin	12
TABLE HTM- 6: Household Type: 1990 – 2011 City of Tustin	13
TABLE HTM- 7: Household Size 1990 Through 2011 City of Tustin	14
TABLE HTM- 8: Households in Overcrowded Conditions 2011 City of Tustin	15
TABLE HTM- 9: Median Household Income: Tustin and Surrounding Areas 2011	15
TABLE HTM- 10: Household Income Distribution City of Tustin 2011	16
TABLE HTM- 11: Household Income Distribution by Household Tenure 2011	17
TABLE HTM- 12: Households Overpaying for Shelter 2011 City of Tustin	18
TABLE HTM- 13: Household Size Distribution City of Tustin 2011	21
TABLE HTM- 14: Households with Five or More Persons City of Tustin 2011	22
TABLE HTM- 15: Summary of Homeless Accomodation Zoning Regulations	25
TABLE HTM- 16: Emergency Shelter/Transitional Housing Facilities 2013	26
TABLE HTM- 17: Housing Growth Trends 1990 – 2010 Tustin and Surrounding Areas	27
TABLE HTM- 18: Tustin Residential Unit Mix City of Tustin 1990 - 2013	28
TABLE HTM- 19: Vacancy Rates 2000-2013 City of Tustin	28
TABLE HTM- 20: Tenure 1990 and 2011 City of Tustin	29
TABLE HTM- 21: Age of Housing Stock City of Tustin	30
TABLE HTM- 22: New and Resale Price of Homes and Condominiums Tustin and Neighboring Jurisdictions 2012	31
TABLE HTM- 23: Average Rental Rates, 2013 - 1st Quarter City of Tustin	32
TABLE HTM- 24: Affordable Net Rents 2013 City of Tustin	33

TABLE HTM- 25: 2014-2021 Housing Needs City of Tustin	34
TABLE HTM- 26: At Risk For Conversion in 2006-2014 City of Tustin	36
TABLE HTM- 27: Assisted Housing Inventory	37
TABLE HTM- 28: 2013 Fair Market Rents, Orange County	43
TABLE HTM- 29: Affordable Rents, City of Tustin 2013	43
TABLE HTM- 30: Cost of Providing Rental Subsidy for Very Low Income Households	44
TABLE HTM- 31: General Plan Residential Land Use Categories City of Tustin	46
TABLE HTM- 32: Summary of Residential Zoning Regulations City of Tustin	49
TABLE HTM- 33: Summary of Homeless Accomodation Zoning Regulation	56
TABLE HTM- 34: Summary Table: Effectiveness of Housing Element Programs, 2006-2014	69
TABLE HTM- 35: Effectiveness of Housing Element Programs 2006-2014	71
TABLE HTM- 36: Progress Towards Objectives 2006-2014 City of Tustin	113

This page intentionally left blank.

# INTRODUCTION

This memorandum is a reference document intended to provide background data that will serve as a partial basis for policies and programs in the Housing Element. In accordance with State law, a significant amount of data is required in this memorandum. Where possible, the data has been summarized in graphic form for easy reference. The reader is urged to use the table of contents at the front of this document as a guide. Once the Housing Element has been completed, the Technical Memorandum will be incorporated therein.

State law largely determines the content of this Technical Memorandum. Five sections follow the introduction. The Summary of Housing Issues, Conditions, Opportunities and Constraints provides an overview of the key issues facing the City, which are addressed by the goals, policies and programs of the Housing Element. The Housing Needs Assessment section addresses housing needs. More specifically, it discusses how the population has grown and changed, how households are changing (i.e., size, composition), and how the housing supply is changing. This section also analyzes the potential loss of assisted lower income housing units in the City.

The third section addresses governmental and non-governmental constraints, such as market condition, and natural environment, to housing development. The fourth section addresses energy conservation. Finally, the fifth section summarizes the housing issues, opportunities, and constraints that have emerged through background research and public meetings and which must be addressed in the Housing Element.

# STATE LAW AND GENERAL PLAN GUIDELINES

The State of California provides very specific requirements and guidelines for preparing Housing Elements. This section describes those requirements and explains the relationship between this element and the rest of the General Plan.

The State of California requires that each jurisdiction prepare and adopt a Housing Element. The State Requirements for Housing Elements are far stricter and more detailed than for any other General Plan Element.

State Planning law requires local governments to review their housing elements as frequently as appropriate and to revise the elements as appropriate, not less than every eight years. The fifth revision date for jurisdictions within the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) is October 15, 2013.

The planning period for the Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) as prepared by SCAG, is from January 1, 2014 to October 1, 2021, a seven and three

quarter year period. The implementation period covered by this element is October 2013 to October 2021.

# Organization of the Housing Element

Under the provisions of Section 65583 of the Government Code, the Housing Element shall generally consist of an identification and analysis of existing and projected housing needs and a statement of goals, policies, quantified objectives, and scheduled programs for the preservation, improvement, and development of housing. The Housing Element shall identify adequate sites for housing, including rental housing, factory-built housing, and mobile homes, and shall make adequate provision for the existing and projected needs of all economic segments of the community. More specifically, the Housing Element must meet the requirements outlined below.

- A. An assessment of housing needs and an inventory of resources and constraints relevant to meeting these needs. The assessment and inventory shall include the following:
  - Analysis of population and employment trends and documentation of the locality's existing and projected housing needs for all income levels. These existing and projected needs shall include the locality's share of the regional housing needs in accordance with Section 65584.
  - Analysis and documentation of household characteristics, including level of payment compared to ability to pay, housing characteristics, including overcrowding, and housing stock condition.
  - An inventory of land suitable for residential development, including vacant sites and sites having potential for redevelopment, and an analysis of the relationship of zoning and public facilities and services to these sites.
  - Identification of a zone or zones where emergency shelters are allowed as a permitted use
  - Analysis of potential and actual governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, or development of housing for all income levels, including land use controls, building codes and their enforcement, site improvements, fees and other exactions required of developers, and local processing and permit procedures.
  - Analysis of potential and actual non-governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement, development of housing for all income levels, including the availability of financing, the price of land, and the cost of construction.
  - Analysis of any special housing needs, such as those of, persons with disabilities (including developmental disabilities), the elderly, large families,

farm workers, families with female heads of households, and families and persons in need of emergency shelter.

- Analysis of opportunities for energy conservation with respect to residential development.
- Analysis of existing assisted housing developments that are eligible to change from low-income housing uses during the next 10 years.
- B. A statement of the community's goals, quantified objectives, and policies relative to the maintenance, preservation, improvement, and development of housing.

It is recognized that the total housing needs identified pursuant to Section 65583(a) may exceed available resources and the community's ability to satisfy this need within the content of the general plan requirements. Under these circumstances, the quantified objectives need not be identical to the identified existing housing needs, but should establish the maximum number of housing units that can be constructed, rehabilitated, and conserved over a five-year time frame.

- C. A program which sets forth a schedule of actions over the implementation period that the local government is undertaking or intends to undertake in order to implement the policies and achieve the goals and objectives of the housing element through the administration of land use development controls, provision of regulatory concessions and incentives, and the utilization of appropriate federal and state financing and subsidy programs when available. In order to make adequate provision for the housing needs of all economic segments of the community, the program will incorporate the following:
  - Identify adequate sites which will be made available through appropriate zoning and development standards and with public services and facilities needed to facilitate and encourage the development of a variety of types of housing, factory-built housing, mobile homes, emergency shelters and transitional housing in order to meet the community's housing goals.
  - Assist in the development of adequate housing to meet the needs of extremely low, very low, low- and moderate-income households.
  - Address and, where appropriate and legally possible, remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing.
  - Conserve and improve the condition of the existing affordable housing stock.

Promote housing opportunities for all persons regardless of race, religion, sex, marital status, ancestry, national origin, or color. The program shall include an identification of the agencies and officials responsible for the implementation of the

various actions and the means by which consistency will be achieved with other general plan elements and community goals. The local government shall make a diligent effort to achieve public participation of all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element, and the program shall describe this effort.

In addition, an amendment to housing element law (Chapter 1451, Statutes of 1989) requires all housing elements to include additional need analyses and programs to address the potential conversion of all Federal, State and locally assisted housing developments that are eligible to convert to market rate use during the next ten-year period. Such units are considered to be "at risk" of being lost as part of the affordable housing stock.

# **Relationship to Other General Plan Elements**

The preparation of the City's Housing Element must conform to Section 65580 of the California Government Code. The Legislature has established a policy that the availability of housing in a suitable environment is of vital statewide importance, and a priority of the highest order. State policy requires local governments to address the housing needs of all economic segments, while considering the economic, environmental and fiscal factors and community goals set forth in the General Plan.

While a city must consider housing needs for all economic segments, it must also maintain internal consistency among the various elements of the General Plan. Neither the Housing Element nor any other element may supersede any other required element of the Tustin General Plan.

The Housing Element relates to other elements in a variety of ways. The Land Use Element directly relates to the Housing Element by designating areas of the City in which a variety of residential types and densities may exist.

The Housing Element's relationship to the Conservation, Open Space, and Recreation Element is conditioned by the need to serve a growing population's recreational needs, especially in the areas of the City with the highest density.

The Circulation Element attempts to provide an efficient and well-balanced circulation system. This system must be designed to accommodate allowed land uses, including residential uses, and the intensity of allowable uses must not exceed the ultimate capacity of the circulation system.

The Safety Element relates to the Housing Element by designating areas that are deemed unsafe for development, such as the Alquist-Priolo Zones and floodplains.

Similar to the Safety Element, the Noise Element relates to the Housing Element by addressing a health related issue area. Techniques for reducing noise often involve buffers between land uses to reduce noise.

The Growth Management Element overlaps the issues raised in the Housing Element in its efforts to ensure that the planning, management, and implementation of traffic improvements and public facilities are adequate to meet the current and projected needs of Orange County.

# **SOURCES OF INFORMATION**

A variety of sources were used to prepare this Technical Memorandum. The most recent source of population and housing counts is the State Department of Finance (DOF) population and housing estimates for January 2013. The population, household and employment statistics are taken from the 2010 Census and the American Community Survey. Other estimates of population characteristics are provided by the Center for Demographic Research at California State University, Fullerton.

The 2012 Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) provided information regarding existing needs and projections regarding future housing needs. Data regarding housing costs have been obtained from local newspapers, local developers, and financial institutions. Other data sources are listed in the Reference section of this document.

# SUMMARY OF HOUSING ISSUES, NEEDS, OPPORTUNITIES, AND CONSTRAINTS

The following issues, needs, opportunities, and constraints have been identified in Tustin.

- ° Tenure. The City contains disproportionately large amounts of multi-family housing units when compared to nearby jurisdictions and the County overall.
- o Historic Resources. Tustin features numerous historic homes that add character and charm to the City but may be in need of ongoing maintenance and rehabilitation.
- ° *Home Ownership Affordability Gap.* Ownership housing costs are increasingly beyond the reach of the City's lower- and moderate-income households.
- Or Housing Condition. Many owner- and renter-occupied units in the City need rehabilitation, including minor and major repairs. Landlords and owners of these units may need financial assistance in order to make necessary repairs.
- Ounits at Risk of Conversion to Market Rate. By State law, the City must document and develop programs to address affordable housing units in the City that are at risk of converting to market rate housing between 2013-2021. For the 2014-2021 RHNA planning period, the Regional Housing Needs Assessment indicates that there are 100 assisted units at risk of conversion to market rate housing.
- Large Households. Large households comprised approximately 15.4 percent of all Tustin households (owner and renter) in 2011. Large families and households are a population of concern due to both the difficulty of finding adequately sized housing units and the high costs associated with these larger units.
- Overcrowding. According to the California Department of Finance, the average number of persons per household in the City was 3.02 in 2013. The American Community Survey 2007-2011 data indicates that a total of2, 508, or 10%, of all households were suffering from overcrowding.
- ° *Rental Affordability Gap.* Based upon a review of rental units, it is difficult to find apartments in the City with more than two bedrooms, and those that are available are beyond the price range of low-income households. Therefore, large families with low incomes (less than \$83,250 for a family of five) would have difficulty finding affordable housing in Tustin.

- Observed that there were 12,462 overpaying households, of which 36.8 percent had an annual household income of less than \$35,000, which was about 48 percent of Tustin area median income.
- ° Elderly. As the City's population ages, the number of elderly persons will increase. This underscores an increasing need to address the special housing needs of the elderly.
- Age of Housing Stock. Even though the City's housing stock is relatively young and in good condition, by year 2020, approximately 62 percent of the City's housing stock will be over 30 years old-the age at which housing typically begins to require major repairs.

# HOUSING NEEDS ASSESSMENT

Since the 1960s, the City's population has soared from about 2,000 persons to 77,983 in 2013. Thus, the vast majority of the City's housing stock has been constructed within the last 50 years.

Unlike most of Orange County, where about half of the housing stock consists of single-family detached homes, nearly two-thirds of Tustin's housing stock is multifamily or single-family attached (i.e., condominiums/townhouses). Tustin also has a proportionately higher percentage of renters compared to Orange County as a whole.

Over the last two decades, the City's population has been impacted by many of the same trends observed regionally: a substantial increase in minority populations, especially Latinos; an increase in the average size of households; and, a surge in housing costs. As the City continues to grow and change, its housing policies must be re-examined in light of these changes.

This chapter examines the important demographic changes that have occurred in the City since 2000 that affect housing needs. The chapter includes four main sections: population/employment trends, household characteristics, housing characteristics, and assisted housing preservation. The Population/Employment Trends section analyzes how the population has grown and explores resident employment patterns. The Household Characteristics section looks at changes in household size and composition, examines income and overcrowding, and evaluates housing affordability and special housing needs groups. The Housing Stock Characteristics section examines changes in the housing stock, particularly the number of units, condition, and type.

The fourth section concerning assisted housing preservation responds to State legislation that requires local jurisdictions to prepare an inventory and implement programs to promote the preservation and/or replacement of government-assisted lower- income housing.

# POPULATION/EMPLOYMENT TRENDS

This section examines population growth, age characteristics, racial/ethnic composition, and employment characteristics of Tustin's population.

#### **Population Growth**

As shown in Table HTM-1, between 2000 and 2010 the City's population grew from 67,504 to 75,540, an increase of approximately 11.9 percent. Between 2010 and 2012, population growth slowed significantly, falling 41.2 percent from the yearly average of 1.2 percent between 2000 and 2010 to .7 percent over the past 2 years. The City of Tustin's growth rate between 2010 and 2012 was slightly slower than the County

growth rate but faster than the nearby cities of Garden Grove, Orange, and Santa Ana. Recent projections released by the Center for Demographic Research, CSUF (Orange County Projections 2010 Modified, January 26, 2012), indicate that Tustin's population will increase by an annual rate of approximately 0.7 percent during this implementation period, bringing the total population to 83,534 by the year 2025. Table HTM-1 compares the City's growth rate between 2000 and 2012 with other Orange County cities and the County as a whole.

A large percentage of Tustin's population growth can be attributed to annexations that have occurred since 1980. The remainder can be attributed to a variety of other factors, including shifts in family structures from smaller to larger families, redevelopment of existing developed areas, infill development, and residential construction in East Tustin. Substantial population and housing growth will continue during this planning period with the continued development at Tustin Legacy (former Marine Corps Air Station [MCAS] Tustin).

TABLE HTM-1
Population Growth 2000-2012
City of Tustin, Nearby Jurisdictions and Orange County

		<del> </del>			
Jurisdiction	2000	2010	2012	Percent Growth	
				2000-2010	2010-2012
Tustin	67,504	75,540	76,567	11.9%	1.4%
Anaheim	328,014	336,265	343,793	2.5%	2.2%
Garden Grove	165,196	170,883	172,648	3.4%	1.0%
Irvine	143,072	212,375	223,729	48.4%	5.3%
Orange	128,821	136,416	138,010	5.9%	1.2%
Santa Ana	337,977	324,528	327,731	-4.0%	1.0%
Orange County	2,846,289	3,010,232	3,055,792	5.8%	1.5%

Sources: <sup>1</sup> 2000 U.S. Census <sup>2</sup> 2010 U.S. Census

<sup>3</sup> Department of Finance estimates 2012

Population projections are shown in Table HTM-1A. According to Orange County Projections (OCP) 2012 data, the population in the City of Tustin is expected to

increase by approximately 6.3 percent from 77,965 persons in 2015 to 82,878 persons by the year 2035, after a peak population of 83,944 in 2030. The decrease in the last five years of the projections is attributed to general countywide demographic characteristics, such as the age structure of the population, declining fertility rates, low housing growth, and declining immigration.

TABLE HTM-1A Population Projections 2015-2035

	2015	2020	2025	2030	2035	Percent Change (2015- 2035)
Tustin	77,965	81,310	83,534	83,944	82,878	6.30%

Source: OCP 2010 Modified, January 26, 2012

# **Age Characteristics**

Table HTM-2 shows the proportions of the City's population represented by age groups in 2000 and 2011. The table shows that the proportions of the population in each age group have begun to transition over time. Like the rest of Orange County, Tustin has begun to experience an aging of the population. The 25-34 age group has fallen almost 5 percentage points, while the 55+ age group have increased by a total of 3.8 percentage points. With the significant loss of residents in the 25-34 age group Tustin has seen a 1.4 percentage point fall in the 0-4 age group.

## TABLE HTM- 2 AGE TRENDS 2000 - 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

Age Group	2000	% Total	2011	% Total
0-4	5,815	8.6%	5,401	7.2%
5-14	9,916	14.7%	10,940	14.6%
15-24	8,685	12.8%	10,792	14.4%
25-34	13,798	20.4%	11,785	15.8%
35-54	19,710	29.2%	22,343	29.9%
55-64	4,776	7.1%	6,873	9.3%
65-74	2,745	4.1%	3,806	5.1%
75+	2,059	3.1%	2,715	3.7%
Total	67,504	100.0%	74,625	100.0%

Sources: U.S Bureau of Census, 2000, 2007-2011 American Community Survey.

#### Race and Ethnicity

The City's racial and ethnic composition has changed significantly since 1980. The trends experienced in the 1990's have continued through the early 2000's, though at a less rapid rate. As shown in Table HTM-3, minority populations in the City have

grown significantly. The Hispanic population increased about 30 percent between 2000 and 2010, becoming the dominant population in the City accounting for almost 40 percent of the total population. Asian/Pacific Islanders and Blacks comprised about 20.4 percent and 2.0 percent of the population in 2010, respectively.

These shifts in racial and ethnic composition may have important implications in terms of household characteristics and income. For example, Hispanic households are typically larger than other households; therefore, an increase in the number of Hispanic households may indicate a need for larger housing units. Also, to the extent that minority populations tend to have lower incomes than their Caucasian counterparts, there may be a greater need for affordable housing for these groups.

# TABLE HTM- 3 RACE AND ETHNICITY: 1990, 2000, 2010 CITY OF TUSTIN

	1990 <sup>1</sup>		2000 <sup>2</sup>		<b>2010</b> <sup>3</sup>	
		%		%		%
Race and Ethnicity	Population	Total	Population	Total	Population	Total
White	37,127	73.2%	30,264	44.8%	26,317	34.8%
Black	2,895	5.7%	1,785	2.6%	1,535	2%
American Indian and	274	0.5%	199	.3%	142	.2%
Alaska Native						
Asian/Pacific Islander	5,260	10.4%	10,194	15.1%	15,391	20.4%
Other	5,133	10.1%	1,952	2.9%	2,131	2.8%
Hispanic <sup>4</sup>	(10,508)	(20.7%)	23,110	34.2%	30,024	39.7%
Total	50,689	100%	67,504	100%	75,540	100%

<sup>1 1990</sup> Census

# **Employment**

According to 2007-2011 American Community Survey data, the City of Tustin had 41,761 residents in the labor force, of which 38,308 (91.7 percent) were in the labor market. Of these, 83.7 percent were private wages and salary workers. Table HTM-4 shows the number of employees by occupation.

In 2011, the largest occupational category was management, business, science and arts occupations, in which a total of 15,698 were employed. The second largest category was the sales and office occupations, employing 10,214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 2000 Census

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 2010 Census

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Census contains a separate question related to whether the householder was of Spanish/Hispanic "origin". Origin is defined as the ancestry, nationality group, lineage, or country in which the person's ancestors were born prior to their arrival to the United States. Persons of Spanish origin could be of any of the five racial categories.

# TABLE HTM- 4 EMPLOYMENT BY OCCUPATION 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

Occupational Category	Number	%
Management, business, science, and arts occupations	15,698	41.0%
Service occupations	6,429	16.8%
Sales and office occupations	10,214	26.7%
Natural resources, construction, and maintenance occupations	2,189	5.7%
Production, transportation, and material moving occupations	3,778	9.9%
Total	34,906	100.0%

Source: U.S. Census: 2007-2011 American Community Survey

In terms of industry, the Educational services, and health care and social assistance, and Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and waste management services sectors employed the largest number of persons with 6,947 (18.1 percent) and 5,606 (14.6 percent) employees, respectively. Table HTM-5 is a summary of the number of employees by industry.

Due to its favorable location, demographics, and business environment, Tustin is home to several large employers. Appendix C lists major employers in the City of Tustin. The City's top ten employers include: Young's Market Co. LLC, Tustin Unified School District, Lamppost Pizza Corp., Ricoh Electronics Inc., Toshiba America Medical Systems, Rockwell Collins Inc., Costco, Cherokee International Inc., City of Tustin, and Raj Manufacturing Inc.

# TABLE HTM- 5 EMPLOYMENT BY INDUSTRY 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

Industry	Number	0/0
Agriculture, forestry, fishing and hunting, and mining	224	0.60%
Construction	1,999	5.20%
Manufacturing	4,907	12.80%
Wholesale trade	1,116	2.90%
Retail trade	4,842	12.60%
Transportation and warehousing, and utilities	1,174	3.10%
Information	777	2.00%
Finance and insurance, and real estate and rental and leasing	3,985	10.40%
Professional, scientific, and management, and administrative and		
waste management services	5,606	14.60%
Educational services, and health care and social assistance	6,947	18.10%
Arts, entertainment, and recreation, and accommodation and		
food services	3,842	10.00%
Other services, except public administration	1,777	4.60%
Public administration	1,112	2.9%
TOTAL	38,308	100.0%
Source: U.S. Census: 2007-2011 American Community Survey		

# HOUSEHOLD CHARACTERISTICS

This section addresses household composition, size, overcrowding, income, affordability, and special needs groups.

#### **Definitions**

The Census Bureau uses several terms with respect to housing which are important to understand. A *housing unit* is defined as a house, apartment, mobile home or trailer, group of rooms, or single room occupied or intended for occupancy as separate living quarters. A *household* is an occupied housing unit. Households are further broken down into *family* households and *non-family* households. A family household is a household shared by two or more persons related by birth, marriage or adoption. A non-family household is one consisting of a single individual or unrelated persons living together.

# **Household Composition**

According to the U.S. Census, the City of Tustin contained 25,203 households in 2010. From 2000 to 2011, census data shows that the number of households increased by 2,114, representing an increase of approximately 8.8%.

TABLE HTM- 6					
HOUSEHOLD TYPE: 1990 - 2011					
CITY OF TUSTIN					

	1990 <sup>1</sup>		2000 <sup>2</sup>		2011 <sup>3</sup>	
	No. of % of		No. of	% of	No. of	% of
Household Type	Households	Total	Households	Total	Households	Total
Family	12,317	67.2%	16,055	67.4%	17,529	67.6%
Non-Family	6,015	32.8%	7,776	32.6%	8,416	32.4%
Total	18,332	100%	23,831	100%	25,945	100%

U.S. Dept. of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 1990 Census.

Table HTM-6 shows that 12,317, or about 67%, of the City's households were classified as family households in 1990. The percentage of family households remained relatively the same in 2000 and 2011. Moreover, as shown in Table HTM-7, the average household size in Tustin has increased from 2.66 persons per household in 1990 to an estimated 2.82 persons per household in 2000 and 2.97 persons per household in 2011. This increase may be attributed to a variety of factors, including: more doubling-up, or sharing, of units in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> U.S. Dept. of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 2000 Census

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> U.S. Census, 2007-2011 American Community Survey

order to defray increased housing costs; and, an increase in the supply of larger units, especially new units in East Tustin and Tustin Legacy.

# TABLE HTM- 7 HOUSEHOLD SIZE 1990 THROUGH 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

Jurisdiction	1990 <sup>1</sup>	2000 2	<b>2011</b> <sup>3</sup>
Tustin	2.66	2.82	2.97
Orange County	2.87	3.00	2.99

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> U.S. Dept. of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 1990 Census Report.

#### Overcrowding

HUD defines overcrowding as more than one person per room, excluding bathrooms and kitchens. For example, a one-bedroom apartment with living room, kitchen, and bathroom would be considered overcrowded if more than two persons occupied it.

The 2007-2011 American Community Survey data showed 2,508 (10 percent) households living in overcrowded conditions. Of the households living in such conditions, 78 percent were renters. Overall renter households had a significantly higher incidence of overcrowding than owner households: 16.5 percent of renter and 4.2 percent of owner households were overcrowded. Table HTM-8 illustrates the numbers of all Tustin households living in overcrowded conditions.

It should be noted that there are no federal or California State legal standards for overcrowding. In a reasonable effort to allocate scarce financial resources for affordable housing, housing programs typically use occupancy standards, which allow for up to "two persons per bedroom plus one" (e.g., five persons in a two-bedroom unit). The California Health and Safety Code standard is one person per bedroom plus one (e.g., three persons in a two-bedroom unit).

Overcrowding is often reflective of one of three conditions: 1) either a family or household is living in a dwelling that is too small; 2) a family chooses to house extended family members (i.e., grandparents or grown children and their families living with parents, termed doubling); or 3) a family is renting living space to non-family members.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> U.S. Dept. of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 2000 Census Report.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> U.S. Census, <u>2007-2011</u> American Community Survey

# TABLE HTM- 8 HOUSEHOLDS IN OVERCROWDED CONDITIONS 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

Tenure	Total Overcrowded	Total All Households
Owner	553	13,112
Renter	1,955	11,833
Total	2,508	24,945

Source: U.S. Census: 2007-2011 American Community Survey

#### Income

Household income is an important determinant of housing affordability. While upper income households have more discretionary income to spend on housing, low and moderate income households are more limited in the range of housing they can afford. The presence of a large number of low and moderate income households in a region where housing costs are high is likely to result in many households paying more than they can afford for housing.

According to 2011 American Community Survey data, the median household income for the City of Tustin was \$73,231. Table HTM-9 compares median household and family incomes between the City of Tustin and nearby jurisdictions, counties, and the State of California. In 2011, the City's median household income was about 3% lower than the median household income for the County as a whole (\$75,762). Table HTM-9 demonstrates that at \$80,963, Tustin's 2011 median family income was also below the Orange County median (\$85,009). This trend was consistent as well for median family income in the above-mentioned jurisdictions.

# TABLE HTM- 9 MEDIAN HOUSEHOLD INCOME: TUSTIN AND SURROUNDING AREAS 2011

				Percent
	Median	Percent	Median	Above/Below
	Household	Above/Below	Family	County
Jurisdiction	Income	County Median	Income	Median
Tustin	\$73,231	-3.3%	\$80,963	-4.8%
Anaheim	\$59,330	-21.7%	\$63,180	-25.7%
Garden Grove	\$60,036	-20.8%	\$62,820	-26.1%
Irvine	\$92,599	22.2%	\$109,762	29.1%
Santa Ana	\$54,399	-28.2%	\$53,111	-37.5%
Orange County	\$75,762	-	\$85,009	-
State of California	\$61,632	-18.7%	\$70,231	<b>-17.4</b> %

Source: U.S. Bureau of Census, 2007-2011 American Community Survey

As shown in Table HTM 10, an estimated 6.8 percent of Tustin's households had incomes of less than \$15,000 in the year 2011. Another 7.2 percent had incomes of

between \$15,000 and \$34,999. In addition, 29.6 percent had incomes between \$35,000 and \$74,999, and 48.9 percent had incomes of \$75,000 or more.

# TABLE HTM- 10 HOUSEHOLD INCOME DISTRIBUTION CITY OF TUSTIN 2011

Income Range	# Households1	% Households <sup>2</sup>	% Cumulative
Less than \$14,999	1,696	6.8%	6.8%
\$15,000 to \$24,999	1,796	7.2%	14.0%
\$25,000 to \$34,999	1,921	7.7%	21.7%
\$35,000 to \$49,999	3,068	12.3%	34.0%
\$50,000 to \$74,999	4,315	17.3%	51.3%
\$75,000 to \$99,999	3,617	14.5%	78.7%
More than \$100,000	8,581	34.4%	100.2%
TOTAL	24,945	100.0%	
Median Household Income,	\$73,231		_
City of Tustin			
Median Household Income,	\$75,762		
Orange County			

Derived by applying the percentage of households by income level from S1901 to total number of households shown as 24,945.

SOURCE: U.S. Census: 2007-2011 American Community Survey

Owner households had higher incomes than did renter households in 2011, as shown in HTM-11. Approximately 31.4 percent of the renter households earned less than \$35,000 annually, compared to only 12.9 percent of owner households. Furthermore, 48.6 percent of renters earned less than \$50,000 in 2011, compared to only 20.7 percent of owners. While a higher proportion of renter households (19.4 percent) than owner households (15.4 percent) earned between \$50,000 and \$74,999, only 32 percent of renter households had incomes of more than \$75,000 annually, compared to 64.0 percent of owner households.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Due to rounding in census data percentages, the total of percent households equals 100.2 percent.

# TABLE HTM- 11 HOUSEHOLD INCOME DISTRIBUTION BY HOUSEHOLD TENURE CITY OF TUSTIN 2011

Tenure/Income Range	Number <sup>1</sup>	Percent	Cumulative %
RENTER HOUSEHOLDS			
Less Than \$10,000	651	5.5%	5.5%
\$10,000 to \$19,999	1,027	8.7%	14.20%
\$20,000 to \$34,999	2,036	17.2%	31.40%
\$35,000 to \$49,999	2,040	17.2%	48.60%
\$50,000 to \$74,999	2,294	19.4%	68.00%
\$75,000 to \$99,999	1,554	13.1%	81.10%
\$100,000 or More	2,234	18.9%	100.0%
<b>Total Renters</b>	11,833	100.0%	
OWNER HOUSEHOLDS	224	2 = 0/	0.70/
Less Than \$10,000	326	2.5%	2.5%
\$10,000 to \$19,999	485	3.7%	6.20%
\$20,000 to \$34,999	876	6.7%	12.90%
\$35,000 to \$49,999	1,017	7.8%	20.70%
\$50,000 to \$74,999	2,017	15.4%	36.10%
\$75,000 to \$99,999	2,059	15.7%	51.80%
\$100,000 to \$149,999	2,554	19.5%	71.30%
\$150,000 or More	3,778	28.8%	100.0%
Total Owners	13,112	100.0%	

<sup>1</sup> Derived by applying the percentage of household tenure by household income from to 2011 ACS 5 year file B25118 total number of renter households shown as 11,883 and owner households as 13,112.

Sources: U.S. Census: 2007-2011 American Community Survey

## **Housing Affordability**

The U. S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) defines the threshold of overpayment for housing as 30% or more of household income. That is, when households pay more than 30% of their income for housing, they have insufficient remaining funds for other necessities such as food, clothing, utilities and health care. HUD recognizes, however, that upper income households are generally

capable of paying a larger proportion of their income for housing, and therefore estimates of housing overpayment generally focus on lower income groups<sup>1</sup>.

Table HTM-12 reflects 2011 5-year American Community Survey data, which estimates that there were 12,462 overpaying households, of which 36.8 percent had an annual household income of less than \$35,000, about 48 percent of Tustin area median income. While these extremely low income households are currently housed, they are in a precarious position, particularly those overpaying for housing in light of the current housing market, and could face the threat of homelessness.

Table HTM-12 also distinguishes between owner and renter households overpaying for housing. This distinction is important because while homeowners may overextend themselves financially to afford the option of home purchase, the owner maintains the option to sell at market rate; on the other hand, renters are limited to the rental market and are generally required to pay the rent established in that market. The table shows that among households making less than \$50,000, or 68.3 percent of median household income in the City overpaying for housing, 5,170 or 73.4 percent were renters.

# TABLE HTM- 12 HOUSEHOLDS OVERPAYING FOR SHELTER 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

	Less than \$35,000		\$35,000 to \$49,999		\$50,000 to \$74,999		\$50,000 to \$74,999		\$50,000 to \$74,999		\$75,000 (	or more	Total	
	Over-		Over-		Over-				Over-	Total All				
Tenure	pay	Total	pay	Total	pay	Total	Overpay	Total	pay	Households				
Owner	1,217	1,612	648	1,017	1,230	2,017	2,750	8,391	5,845	13,112				
Renter	3,368	3,445	1,802	2,028	986	2,272	461	3,743	6,617	11,833				
Total	4,585	5,057	2,450	3,045	2,216	4,289	3,211	12,134	12,462	24,945				

Source: U.S. Census: 2007-2011 American Community Survey.

#### **Special Needs**

State Housing Law requires that the special needs of certain disadvantaged groups be addressed. The needs of the elderly, persons with disabilities (including developmental disabilities), large families, female heads of household with children, homeless persons, and farm workers are important in relation to overall community

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Some agencies and organizations consider Moderate Income households to be overpaying when housing costs exceed 35 percent of gross income, with the maximum income representing 110% of the median county income. Under these assumptions, overpayment occurs in fewer households in the City of Tustin when compared to figures presented in this document that are based upon State and Federal standards. Source: *Strategies for Planning and Development: California Affordable Housing Handbook*, California Redevelopment Association, 2000.

health. These groups may maintain special needs related to housing construction and location.

The Elderly: As noted previously (Table HTM-2), in 2011, 6,521 persons or 8.8% of the total population in Tustin were 65 years of age or older. In addition, senior households represented 15.7percent (3,910) of total households in Tustin. . According to the American Community Survey, approximately 14 percent of elderly households in Tustin earned less than \$25,000 annually or about 37 percent of AMI for a household of two persons in 2011. Although the senior population may often be living in a single-family home too large for their needs, with little or no mortgage payment, selling the home and buying a smaller unit may be too expensive. Thus, this population needs housing that is both affordable and located in close proximity to public services and transportation.

The Disabled: Physical and developmental disabilities can hinder access to housing units of traditional design as well as limit an individual's ability to earn an adequate income. According to the 2009-2011 ACS, a total of 2,192 persons in Tustin between 18 and 65 years of age reported a disability. In addition, 1,745 persons over age 65 reported a disability in 2011.

Disabled persons often require specially designed dwelling units to permit access not only within the dwelling unit, but also to and from the unit. Special modifications to permit free access are very important in maintaining independence and dignity. California Administrative Code Title 24 Requirements set forth access and adaptability requirements for the physically disabled. These regulations apply to public buildings such as motels, and require that ramp ways, door widths, restroom modifications, etc., be designed to enable free access to the handicapped. While such standards do not apply to new single-family residential construction, they do apply to new multi-family residential construction.

Most existing housing units in Tustin have not been designed with consideration for these requirements of adaptability and access. The majority of housing units are either single-family or two-story apartments with no elevator access.

The adaptability of units to meet the needs of disabled persons remains a challenge for Tustin and other communities. However, as additional housing units are provided in the Tustin Legacy area, accessibility is considered as part of a project's design as required by law. Additionally, as units in multiple-family areas are rehabilitated, units may be retrofitted to accommodate the handicapped.

New construction may offer some relief because the mandatory requirements are evenly applied to all projects. The use of mixed development types and higher density limits at Tustin Legacy area will further require development of even more handicapped-accessible units.

**Persons with Developmental Disabilities:** As defined by federal law, "developmental disability" means a severe, chronic disability of an individual that:

- Is attributable to a mental or physical impairment or combination of mental and physical impairments;
- Is manifested before the individual attains age 22;
- Is likely to continue indefinitely;
- Results in substantial functional limitations in three or more of the following
  areas of major life activity: a) self-care; b) receptive and expressive language;
  c) learning; d) mobility; e) self-direction; f) capacity for independent living;
  or g) economic self-sufficiency;
- Reflects the individual's need for a combination and sequence of special, interdisciplinary, or generic services, individualized supports, or other forms of assistance that are of lifelong or extended duration and are individually planned and coordinated.

The U.S. Census Bureau does not record developmental disabilities. According to the U.S. Administration on Developmental Disabilities, an accepted estimate of the percentage of the population that can be defined as developmentally disabled is 1.5 percent. Many developmentally disabled persons can live and work independently within a conventional housing environment. More severely disabled individuals require a group living environment where supervision is provided. The most severely affected individuals may require an institutional environment where medical attention and physical therapy are provided. Because developmental disabilities exist before adulthood, the first issue in supportive housing for the developmentally disabled is the transition from the person's living situation as a child to an appropriate level of independence as an adult.

The State Department of Developmental Services (DDS) currently provides community-based services to approximately 243,000 persons with developmental disabilities and their families through a statewide system of 21 regional centers, four developmental centers, and two community-based facilities. The **Regional Center of Orange County (RCOC)** is one of 21 regional centers in California that provides point of entry to services for people with developmental disabilities. The RCOC is a private, non-profit community agency that contracts with local businesses to offer a wide range of services to individuals with developmental disabilities and their families.

Any resident of Orange County who has a developmental disability that originated before age 18 is eligible for services. Services are offered to people with developmental disabilities based on Individual Program Plans and may include:

Adult day programs; advocacy; assessment/consultation; behavior management programs; diagnosis and evaluation; independent living services; infant development programs; information and referrals; mobility training; prenatal diagnosis; residential care; respite care; physical and occupational therapy; transportation; consumer, family vendor training; and vocational training. RCOC also coordinates the state-mandated Early Start program, which provides services for children under age three who have or are at substantial risk of having a developmental disability. According to the RCOC February 2010 Facts and Statistics data, the RCOC currently serves approximately 16,728 individuals.

Large Families: Under Census Bureau guidelines, a family household containing five or more persons is considered a large family. Large family households generally require larger dwelling units with more bedrooms to meet their housing needs. But family households with five or more persons often face limitations in being below national poverty levels, and often experience difficulty securing adequate housing suitable for their expanded needs. Thus, large families typically suffer disproportionately from both overcrowding and inability to pay. Moreover, because multifamily rental units are typically smaller than single-family units, larger families who are also renters face more difficulties in securing housing large enough to accommodate all members of the household.

Table HTM-13 is a summary of Tustin's household size. The 2011 data shows 15.4% of Tustin households had five or more persons residing in a unit.

# TABLE HTM-13 HOUSEHOLD SIZE DISTRIBUTION CITY OF TUSTIN 2011

Household Size	Number of Households	% of Total Households
1 Person	5,792	23.2%
2 Persons	6,787	27.2%
3 Persons	4,461	17.9%
4 Persons	4,053	16.2%
5 Persons	2,019	8.1%
6 Persons	1,128	4.5%
7 or more Persons	705	2.8%
Total Households	24,945	100.0%

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2007-2011 ACS.

Table HTM-14 shows the number of households with five or more persons in Tustin according to the 2007-2011 ACS. There were 1,835 owner households with five or more persons, representing 14 percent of all owner households. Tustin also had 2,017 renter households with five or more persons, representing 17 percent of all

renter households. Overall, large households comprised approximately 15.4 percent of all Tustin households in 2011.

# TABLE HTM- 14 Households with Five or More Persons City of Tustin 2011

	Number of Households	% of Total Renter or Owner Households
Owners	1,835	14% of Owner Households
Renters	2,017	17% of Renter Households
Total Households	3,852	15.4% of Total Households

Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2007-2011 ACS.

The primary need of large families is to provide enough rooms for each member of the family to avoid overcrowding. According to the American Community Survey, in 2011, 21% of the City's housing units contained four or more bedrooms. Of owner-occupied housing units, 37% contained four or more bedrooms. Renter-occupied units accounted for 8% of units with four or more bedrooms. Taking into account that much of Tustin's housing stock consists of apartments, and that the majority of Tustin's large families are renters, this there is a need for more spacious apartment units to accommodate such families.

**Female-Headed Parent Households:** Single-parent families tend to have low incomes, limiting their ability to find affordable housing. These families also have a large need for affordable child care. For these households, ideal housing is severely restricted. Due to financial constraints, the family is often not able to find housing that is close to needed services, schools, and public transportation. As of the 2010 U.S. Census there were 2,120 female-headed households with children under 18 living at home. These households represented 20.5 percent of all families with children under 18 in Tustin in 2010.

The Homeless: Measuring the extent of the homeless population specifically in Tustin remains a challenge for community leaders. To complicate the challenge of meeting homeless persons' needs, the issue of homelessness is considered regional in nature. Nomadic tendencies of homeless persons make it difficult to assess the population accurately on a citywide basis; therefore, homelessness should be addressed on a countywide basis, in conjunction with cities and local non-profit organizations.

The Orange County Housing and Community Services Department (HCS) defines homelessness as not having a permanent address, sleeping in places not meant for habitation, not having ample food and medical attention or a place to change clothes or bathe. Per this definition, HCS 2011 OC Homeless Census & Survey estimates there are nearly 18,325 homeless in the County on an annual basis. The County's homeless population is comprised of about 75 percent individuals and 25 percent families, including an estimated 2,932 homeless children. For those 18,325 homeless, there are only about 3,357 available beds, including 1,156 emergency shelter beds and 2,201 beds in transitional housing facilities, according to the Orange County Ten-Year Plan to End Homelessness 2012.

The homeless population is comprised of subgroups, which include:

- 1. The economic homeless who lack financial resources to pay rent;
- 2. The situational homeless who have suffered economic or personal trauma and find themselves in personal disorganization; and,
- 3. The chronic homeless who are unable to care for themselves due to chronic illness, disability or debilitating substance abuse.

The City of Tustin's 2010-2015 Consolidated Plan states that, according to police reports and windshield surveys performed within the City of Tustin, most homeless persons migrate through Tustin to other parts of the County rather than stay for extended periods of time within the City. The City's Police Department estimates that there are 10-12 homeless persons residing in the City at any given time. Although there are no established areas where unsheltered homeless persons congregate in the City, there are several homeless services facilities in the City. The Village of Hope was completed on five acres at the Tustin Legacy site. The Village of Hope provides housing for a total of 192 homeless men, women and children. It includes dorm rooms, a child development center, playground, parent education center, vocational training classrooms, health care facility, donation warehouse, and support offices. There also is a cafeteria with an outdoor dining area, and vegetable gardens.

There are numerous factors that contribute to homelessness in Tustin and Orange County. The known causes of homelessness include unemployment, limited skills, and a breakdown in the family as a social and economic unit. Additionally, cutbacks in social service programs and the de-institutionalization of the mentally ill during the 1980s have contributed to the homeless population. A new trend, however, is emerging as a significant contributing element to homelessness: a fast-growing lack of affordable housing, which could exacerbate any of the above conditions, but may increasingly become a standalone cause of homelessness.

One of the shelters in Tustin, the 45-bed Sheepfold shelter provides shelter, food, clothing, job training, and job-referral services primarily to battered women and

children. Guests are admitted on a first-come, first-served basis. Usually all beds are fully occupied. The shelter services a large area including many portions of Orange, Riverside, and San Bernardino Counties.

Within the City of Tustin, there are a variety of Non-Profit Organizations (NPOs) that provide direct housing and related services to homeless persons. These include Village of Hope, an emergency/transitional home; Sheepfold, a feeding program affiliated with the United Way; Families Forward, a homeless provider; Olive Crest, transitional homes and services for abused and neglected children, a and Laurel House, an emergency shelter and transitional housing provider for homeless youth in the City.

A significant portion of the MCAS-Tustin is located within the City. The MCAS Tustin facility was identified by the U.S. Department of Defense for closure in July 1999. In accordance with the Base Closure Redevelopment and Homeless Assistance Act of 1994 (Redevelopment Act), the City of Tustin was formally recognized as the Local Redevelopment Authority (LRA) for the MCAS Tustin.

The Redevelopment Act provides a process that aims to balance the needs of the homeless with other development interests in the communities directly affected by closure of the installation. The Act requires the LRA to prepare a reuse plan and Homeless Assistance Plan (HAP), which is submitted to the federal Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). HUD reviews and determines whether the documents balance the needs of the homeless in communities in the vicinity of the installation with the need for economic development.

A Homeless Assistance Plan has been established for MCAS, Tustin that is consistent with the continuum of care model embodied in the Consolidated Plans for the Cities of Tustin and neighboring Irvine. The fundamental components of the continuum of care system implemented with the MCAS, Tustin Reuse Plan:

- Provide emergency shelter beds and intake assessment
- Offer transitional housing and services
- Provide opportunities for permanent affordable housing by the private sector.

In Tustin Legacy, four homeless service providers including the Salvation Army, Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter, Families Forward, and Human Options currently are operating 48 family units. The Orange County Rescue Mission operates a 192-unit transitional/emergency shelter (Village of Hope) and the Orange County Social Services Agency operates a 90 bed-facility for abused and neglected children and their families.

Numerous other agencies provide shelter and other services to the homeless in the nearby cities of Santa Ana, Irvine, and Orange.

Table HTM-15 provides a summary of zoning regulations pertaining to emergency shelters, transitional, and supportive housing, which are designated as permitted uses within the City of Tustin.

# TABLE HTM-15 SUMMARY OF HOMELESS ACCOMMODATION ZONING REGULATIONS

Housing Type	Permitted/ Conditionally Permitted	Zoning			
Transitional Home	Permitted	Planning Area 3 of MCAS Tustin Specific Plan			
Emergency Shelters	Permitted	Planning Area 3 of MCAS Tustin Specific Plan			
Supportive housing	Permitted	Planning Areas 1 and 3 of MCAS Tustin Specific Plan			
Community Care Facility for six (6) or fewer	Permitted	All residentially zoned properties			
Family care home, foster home, or group home for six (6) or fewer <sup>1</sup>	Permitted	All residentially zoned properties			

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Includes congregate care facility, single room occupancy hotel, and children's intermediate care shelter

Source: City of Tustin, MCAS Tustin Specific Plan

Table HTM-16 is a list of organizations in Tustin that provide homeless services.

# TABLE HTM- 16 EMERGENCY SHELTER/TRANSITIONAL HOUSING FACILITIES 2013 CITY OF TUSTIN

Facility	Services Provided
Sheepfold	Provides shelter, food, clothing, job training, and job-referral services to women with children.
Laurel House	Temporary housing for teenagers in crisis. The facility also provides food, informal counseling, and access to medical care and clothing.
St. Cecilia's	Distributes food supply to needy populations.
Red Hill Lutheran	Operates emergency food program where a person can receive food supply.
Tustin Presbyterian	Collects food supplies and distributes the food to various organizations involved in providing homeless services.
Aldersgate	Refers interested persons to Ecumenical Services Alliance in Santa Ana.
Village of Hope	Operates a food service program and 192 units transitional home at the Village of Hope operated by the Orange County Rescue Mission
Tustin Family Campus	90 beds intermediate care shelter for abused children and their parents operated by the Orange County Social Services Agency.
Salvation Army	Six (6) transitional units at Tustin Field I operated by Salvation Army
Salvation Army	Acquisition of 16 transitional units in Buena Park operated by Salvation Army. The City assisted in acquisition and contributed grant funds to acquire the units
Families Forward <sup>1</sup>	Fourteen (14) transitional units at Columbus Grove operated by Families Forward, formerly Irvine Temporary Housing in Irvine.
Human Options	Six (6) transitional units at Columbus Grove operated by Human Options
Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter	Six (6) transitional units at Columbus Grove operated by Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter.
Tustin Family and Youth Center	Distributes food supplies to needy populations.

Although these units are located in the City of Irvine, these units were negotiated as part of the base realignment/conveyance process which Tustin is the Local Redevelopment Agency.

Source: City of Tustin, 2013

## HOUSING STOCK CHARACTERISTICS

A housing unit is a dwelling intended for occupancy as separate living quarters. Single-family houses, apartments, condominiums, mobile homes, and single room occupancy (SRO) hotels are all types of housing units. This section examines housing unit growth, age, type, tenure (owner v. renter), and costs in Tustin.

#### **Housing Growth**

While Tustin has experienced significant growth in population and housing units since 1990, the growth rate between 2000 and 2010 was significantly less than during the previous decade. This change is attributed to the closure of MCAS Tustin and the demolition of military housing units. The loss of these units was offset by new construction in the early 2000's and the beginning of the redevelopment of MCAS Tustin for civilian uses, which includes the eventual construction of over 4,000 new housing units. Table HTM-17 compares the growth in housing units in Tustin to nearby cities and the County as a whole. It should be noted that much of the City's previous housing unit growth is attributable to annexations that occurred during the 1980s and 1990s.

# TABLE HTM- 17 HOUSING GROWTH TRENDS 1990 - 2010 TUSTIN AND SURROUNDING AREAS

	Numbe	r of Housing	Percent	Change	
Jurisdiction	1990 <sup>1</sup> 2000 <sup>2</sup> 2010 <sup>2</sup>		1990-00	2000-10	
Tustin	19,300	25,501	26,476	32%	3.8%
Anaheim	93,177	99,719	104,237	7%	4.5%
Garden Grove	45,957	46,703	47,755	1.6%	2.3%
Irvine	42,221	53,711	83,899	27%	56.2%
Santa Ana	75,000	74,588	76,896	-0.5%	3.1%
Orange County	875,072	969,484	1,048,907	1%	8.2%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 1990 Census Report.

#### **Housing Unit Type**

Table HTM-18 demonstrates the mix of housing types in Tustin. The distribution of housing units by type has changed over this period, with single-family homes steadily increasing and multifamily housing steadily decreasing as a proportion of Tustin's housing units. In 2013, Tustin's housing stock is comprised of equal proportions of single-family homes and multifamily housing, each making up 48.3 percent. Mobile homes make up the remaining 3.4 percent. The 2013 composition of housing units in the City includes approximately 35 percent single-family detached,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 2000 Census Report, 2010 Census Report.

13 percent single-family attached, 15 percent multi-family (2-4 units), 33percent multi-family (5+ units), and 3 percent mobile homes.

Compared to Orange County as a whole, Tustin has a significantly higher proportion of multi-family housing. According to 2013 Department of Finance Estimates, the County contained approximately 62.9 percent single-family detached/attached units and 33.9 percent multi-family units, whereas Tustin contained 48.3 percent multi-family units.

# TABLE HTM- 18 TUSTIN RESIDENTIAL UNIT MIX 1990 - 2013 CITY OF TUSTIN

							Percent	
		Number of Housing Units						
Housing Type	1990	%	2000	%	2013	%	2000-2013	
Single-Family Detached	5,351	27.7%	8,075	30.6%	9.454	35.1%	17.1%	
Single-Family Attached	2,530	13.1%	3,459	10.8%	3,564	13.2%	3.0%	
Multi-Family (2-4 units)	3,089	16.0%	3,836	12.8%	4,048	15.0%	5.5%	
Multi-Family (5+ units)	7,678	39.5%	9,223	43.0%	8,983	33.3%	-2.6%	
Mobile Homes	707	3.6%	908	2.9%	909	3.4%	0%	
Total	19,300	99.9%*	25,501	100.1%*		100%	N/A	

<sup>\*</sup> Totals do not equal 100% due to rounding error.

Source: California Department of Finance; Comprehensive Affordable Housing Strategy 2008-2018.

The overall rental vacancy rate for Tustin in 2011 was 5.6 percent, up considerably from 4.3 percent in the first quarter of 2007. Generally, a vacancy rate of 5 percent is considered to reflect a "tight" housing market. As shown in Table HTM-19, Department of Finance data for Tustin as of January 2013 show a vacancy rate of 4.8 percent for all housing types in Tustin (single- and multi-family, owner and rental).

# TABLE HTM-19 VACANCY RATES 2000-2013 CITY OF TUSTIN

	2000	2013
Total Occupied Units	23,831	25,662
Vacancy Rate	6.6%	4.8%

Source: California Department of Finance Comprehensive Affordable Housing Strategy 2008-2018.

#### **Housing Tenure**

The tenure (owner versus renter) distribution of a community's housing stock influences several aspects of the local housing market. Residential mobility is influenced by tenure, with ownership housing typically sustaining a much lower turnover rate than rental housing. Housing overpayment, while experienced by many households regardless of tenure, is far more prevalent among renters.

Ownership and rental preferences are primarily related to household income, composition, and age of the householder.

In 2011, 52.5% of the City's 24,945 occupied housing units were owner-occupied, with the remainder renter-occupied. Compared to the County as a whole, which had 60.3% owner-occupied units and 39.7% renter-occupied units, the City of Tustin had a relatively high proportion of renter-occupied units. This is significant because renters tend to have lower incomes than owners, and are more susceptible to housing cost increases. The tenure figures show a shift in the City of approximately 9% to more owner-occupied units from 1990 to 2000. Table HTM-20 is a summary of tenure in the City and the County.

## TABLE HTM- 20 TENURE 1990 AND 2011 CITY OF TUSTIN

	2000		2011	
Housing Tenure	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
City of Tustin				
Owner-Occupied	11,829	49.6%	13,112	52.5%
Renter-Occupied	12,002	50.4%	11,833	47.5%
Total Occupied Units	23,831	100.0%	24,945	100.0%
County of Orange				
Owner-Occupied	574,456	61.4%	595,444	60.3%
Renter-Occupied	360,831	38.6%	391,720	39.7%
Total Occupied Units	935,287	100.0%	987,164	100.0%
Source: U.S. Census Bureau: 2007-2011 American Community Survey.				

#### Age and Condition of Housing Stock

Housing age is a factor for determining the need for rehabilitation. Without proper maintenance, housing units deteriorate over time. Also, older houses may not be built to current housing standards for fire and earthquake safety.

Table HTM-21 shows the distribution of housing units by year built in Tustin through 2011. Reflecting the conversion of land from agricultural to residential use and the construction of housing on the MCAS Tustin base during the 1960s and 1970s, 27.4 percent of Tustin's units were built during the 1960s and 22.6 percent were built during the 1970s. As a result, potential rehabilitation and continued maintenance may be required for these units that are over 30 years in age. The City's rapid population growth in the 1990s is reflected in the number of housing units built during that period, a total of 5,855 units representing 22.2 percent of Tustin's total housing stock.

## TABLE HTM- 21 AGE OF HOUSING STOCK CITY OF TUSTIN

Time Period Units Built	Number of Units	% of Housing Stock
2005 or later	1,348	25.1%
2000 to 2004	1,236	4.7%
1990 to 1999	5,855	22.2%
1980 to 1989	3,122	11.8%
1970 to 1979	5,974	22.6%
1960 to 1969	7,236	27.4%
1950 to 1959	923	3.5%
1940 to 1949	268	1.0%
1939 or earlier	456	1.7%
Total	26,418	100%

Source: 2007-2011 American Community Survey

The overall City of Tustin housing stock is generally in good condition. According to the City's Code Enforcement staff and the Neighborhood Improvement Task Force (NITF) which is comprised of staff from various city departments, less than ten (10) percent of the City housing stock is in need of minor repairs. Only two (2) percent of the total housing units, particularly existing four-plexes within the City's southwest neighborhood, may be considered in need of substantial rehabilitation. To date the City has not identified any housing unit in need of replacement.

The City of Tustin takes a proactive approach toward housing conditions through the City's Housing Rehabilitation program (discontinued with the dissolution of redevelopment), Code Enforcement program and the Neighborhood Improvement Task Force (NIFT) program. Together, these programs allow the City to identify housing units in need of repair and provide needed assistance to maintain the City's housing stock in good conditions.

#### **Housing Costs**

Ownership Housing: Southern California, in line with the nation, is experiencing a recent significant increase in the volume of single-family and condominium sales, placing upward pressure on home prices. According to DataQuick, an on-line research firm, 34,380 homes sold countywide in 2012, an increase of 16.9% compared to 2011. In addition, the median price for all 2012 countywide sales was \$439,000, up 3.9% over 2011, and the highest annual median price since 2008. During 2012, the annual median home price, increased in 57 Orange County ZIP codes, was unchanged in six ZIP codes, and dropped in 20 ZIP codes. The median price change in Tustin was mixed, with a 5.9% increase reported in the 92780 ZIP code and a 4.6% decrease in the 92782 ZIP code. The decrease in the 92782 ZIP code may reflect a smaller percentage of new homes sold in 2012 compared with 2011. In 2012, the median new and resale home prices for zip codes in the City of Tustin ranged from \$360,000 to \$476,000. In comparison, the median resale home prices

for cities presented in Table HTM-22 ranged from \$200,000 to \$925,000. Overall, median new and resale home prices in Tustin were similar to those occurring throughout Orange County.

TABLE HTM- 22 NEW AND RESALE PRICE OF HOMES AND CONDOMINIUMS TUSTIN AND NEIGHBORING JURISDICTIONS 2012

Cite	Zip	Median Home	% Change
City	Code	Price-2012 1	from 2011
Tustin	92780	\$360,000	+5.9%
Tustin	92782	\$476,000	-4.6%
	92801	\$305,000	+3.4%
	92802	\$330,500	+0.2%
	92804	\$330,000	+4.8%
Anaheim	92805	\$314,000	+4.7%
	92806	\$370,000	+1.9%
	92807	\$430,000	+0.2%
	92808	\$479,000	+0.8%
	92840	\$325,000	-1.5%
	92841	\$355,000	-1.3%
Garden Grove	92843	\$320,000	+1.6%
	92844	\$290,000	-3.3%
	92845	\$420,000	-1.4%
	92602	\$555,000	-5.1%
	92603	\$925,000	+14.5%
	92604	\$477,500	-2.3%
	92606	\$550,000	+5.8%
Irvine	92612	\$485,000	+12.5%
	92614	\$451,500	+3.1%
	92618	\$613,750	+12.7%
	92620	\$575,000	-5.6%
	92865	\$400,000	-2.2%
	92866	\$458,000	+1.8%
Orange	92867	\$470,000	+4.7%
	92868	\$300,000	+6.2%
	92869	\$440,000	+4.0%
	92701	\$200,000	+22.5%
	92703	\$275,000	+7.8%
	92704	\$290,000	0.0%
Santa Ana	92705	\$589,500° <sup>2</sup>	+12.3%
	92706	\$365,000	0.0%
	92707	\$252,000	+7.2%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Data include all home sales, new and resale, and condominiums.

Source: Orange County Register, January 23, 2012

**Rental Housing:** According to Realfacts, the average rent for Tustin in the first quarter of 2013 was \$1,567. Studio and one-bedroom rental units had monthly rents between \$1,237 and \$1,340. Two-bedroom rentals had monthly rents of \$1,448 and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Includes Lemon/Cowan Heights

above while three-or-more bedrooms had monthly rents in excess of \$2,391. Table HTM-23 presents a summary of the rental rates.

# TABLE HTM- 23 AVERAGE RENTAL RATES 2013 – 1<sup>ST</sup> QUARTER CITY OF TUSTIN

Number of Bedrooms	Number of Units	Average Square Footage	Average Rent
Studio	200	521	\$1,267
1bd/1ba	2,303	732	\$1,340
2bd TH	194	1,079	\$1,695
2bd/1ba	625	976	\$1,448
2bd/2ba	1,924	1,021	\$1,828
3bd TH	20	1,516	\$1,845
3bd/2ba	210	1,172	\$2,391
Total	5,810	889	\$1,567

TH = Town house unit

Source: RealFacts.

When a household (adjusted for family size) pays more than 30% of its gross income for housing, it is considered an overpayment. Based on HUD's figures on affordability, households in the Very Low-income category have affordable rent of \$763 for one bedroom units to \$1,090 for a four-bedroom unit. In Tustin, the average rent for a one-bedroom unit is \$1,340 to \$2,391 for three-bedroom units. It is also important to note that many of the households in the Very-Low income category are large families, thus a one-bedroom unit at \$1,340 would not only be in excess of what they could afford, but would also be inadequate in size.

For households in the Low-Income category (51%-80% of County median) affordable rental rates are \$916 to \$1,308 per month for housing. The rental survey shows that only studio apartments are affordable to this group (see Table HTM-23). It is important to note, however, that the rental survey considered only large, investment-grade rental properties and did not report prices of smaller rental properties. According to City staff, smaller rental properties represent a large segment of the rental market and offer three-bedroom units that are affordable to low-income households.

In summary, the preceding information suggests that, while rental housing is available in the City at rents that are affordable to all income groups, certain types of rental housing, such as single-family homes and condominium/townhouses, are generally not affordable to the City's lower- income households. Perhaps most importantly, rental rates for units with two or more bedrooms are beyond the reach of the City's Very-Low and Low income households. This means that a Very-Low

<sup>\*</sup>Rental survey represents data only for large, investment grade rental properties. Smaller rental properties represent a large segment of the rental market and offer larger, more affordable units.

and Low income household consisting of three or more persons would have a difficult time finding affordable housing of adequate size. Table HTM-24 is an illustration of affordable net rents for 2013.

#### TABLE HTM- 24 AFFORDABLE NET RENTS 2013<sup>1</sup> CITY OF TUSTIN

Unit Size (No. of bedrooms)	≤Very Low (50%)	Low (51-80%)	Moderate (81120%)
1 Bedroom	\$763	\$916	\$1,679
2 Bedroom	\$872	\$1,046	\$1,918
3 Bedroom	\$981	\$1,178	\$2,159
4 Bedroom	\$1,090	\$1,308	\$2,398

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Based on HCDs Orange County Income Limits, 2013.

Source: Tustin Housing Authority.

#### Share of Region's Housing Needs

Section 65584 of the Government Code requires each locality's share of the existing and future housing needs to be determined by the appropriate council of governments. Each jurisdiction's allocation represents its fair share of the regional housing needs. The City of Tustin's current and projected housing needs are derived from the Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) prepared by the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG).

The components of the RHNA are divided between "existing needs" and future "construction needs." Existing needs were discussed earlier in the housing affordability section of this report. Construction needs are defined as the number of units that would have to be added to accommodate the forecasted growth in the number of households by October 2021, as well as the number of units that would have to be added to compensate for anticipated demolitions and to achieve an "ideal" vacancy rate. Construction need includes all income groups (from very low to upper) and not just those households that require assistance. The total need figure is then distributed among the four income groups. The allocations of housing needs by income group are adjusted to avoid Lower-Income "impaction" - the overconcentration of Lower-Income households in a jurisdiction.

SCAG's RHNA fair-share allocation for the 2014-2021 period is 1,227 units. The closure of the MCAS has presented the City of Tustin with a total of 947.7 acres available for residential re-use and development. Amongst other types of uses, the City plans to add a total of 4,210 housing units of mixed density and housing type throughout the area. The City of Tustin also created a Redevelopment Project Area for the MCAS-Tustin project. Based on former State Redevelopment Law requirements, at least fifteen (15) percent of the units constructed within a Redevelopment Project Area were required to be affordable to Very Low, Low, and

Moderate-income households. Accordingly, from the potential new units to be built on the MCAS site, the creation of a redevelopment project area would result in up to 445 units (253units plus 192 transitional housing units) being allocated for Very Low-income housing and an additional 379 units be created for Low- and Moderate Income households.

To meet its fair share of the region's housing needs during the 2014-2021 RHNA planning period, the City's allocation for new construction housing units is 1,227 (refer to Table HTM-25). Of these, 23.1% must be affordable to Very Low income households (earning less than 50% of the County median), 15.9% must be affordable to Low-Income households (earning between 50% and 80% of the County median), 18.3% must be affordable to the Moderate-Income households (earning between 80% and 120% of County median income) and 42.8% must be affordable to Above-Moderate Income groups (earning over 120% of County median income). Table HTM-25 is a summary of housing need distribution for the 2014-2021 RHNA planning period.

#### TABLE HTM- 25 2014-2021 HOUSING NEEDS CITY OF TUSTIN

Income Category	# of Units	% of Total
Very Low (<50% County Median)	283	23.1%
Low (50% - 80% County Median)	195	15.9%
Moderate (80% - 120% County Median)	224	18.3%
Above Moderate (120% County Median)	525	42.8%
Total	1,227	100%
Source: SCAG RHNA 2012		

#### ASSISTED HOUSING PRESERVATION ANALYSIS

State law (Chapter 1451, Statutes of 1989) requires all housing elements to include needs analyses and programs to address the potential conversion of Federal, State, and locally assisted housing developments ("units at risk") to market rate housing. For example, the federally subsidized loans provided too many low-income housing projects during the 1970s contained provisions that allow the owner to "prepay" the loans after 20 years, thereby removing the low-income subsidy from the project.

As part of the "units at risk" analysis, the State requires that local jurisdictions perform the following tasks:

- Needs Analysis: to include an inventory of units at risk of converting to market rate housing for period covered by the Housing Element; an analysis of the potential for loss of affordability controls; a cost analysis of preserving or replacing the at-risk units; identification of agencies willing to acquire and manage these projects; and, identification of funding sources available to preserve or replace them.
- Quantified Objectives: A quantification of the units to be conserved, and explanation of any difference between the number of units at risk and the number to be conserved.
- ° Housing Programs: A description of programs to preserve the units at risk.

Tustin has one project that contain units "at risk" of converting to unrestricted market rate rents. Tustin Gardens is a 101-unit Section 223(a) (7)/221(D) (4) project with a Section 8 contract for 100 units. In 2003, the owners of Tustin Gardens signed a five-year agreement with the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). This agreement serves as a one-year Section 8 contract that automatically renews for four additional one-year terms, provided that funds are available. The current contract expires on July 13, 2014. The project owners have indicated that they intend to renew the contract.

Projects financed under the Section 221(D) (4) market rate program alone have no binding income use restrictions. The conversion of this project would have an adverse impact for the elderly who may face substantial rent increase or possible displacement. Table HTM-26 lists all of the Federal, State, and locally assisted low-income housing projects located in the City of Tustin due to expire by 2021.

Table HTM-27 is an inventory of all units assisted under federal, state, and/or local programs, including HUD programs, state and local bond programs, and local inlieu fee, inclusionary, density bonus, or direct assistance programs. The inventory includes all units that are eligible to convert to market rate housing due to termination of subsidy contract, mortgage prepayment, or expiring use restrictions.

#### TABLE HTM- 26 AT RISK FOR CONVERSION IN 2006-2014 CITY OF TUSTIN

Project Name, Address (incl. zip)	Owner: Name, Address, Tel.#	Type(s) of Gov't Assistance	# of Section 8 Contracts (if applicable)	Type/Length of Affordability Controls (including Sec. 8)	Earliest Potential Conversion Date(s)	# of Units	Tenant Type (i.e., Elderly, Family)	Bedroom Mix	Date Built (if known)	Income Group
FEDERAL										
Tustin Gardens 275 E. 6th Tustin, CA 92780 213-204-2050	Goldrich & Kest 5150 Overland Ave. Culver City, CA 90230	HUD 221(D)(4) Section 8	100	40 yr. Loan at 8%	July 2014	100	Elderly	100 1-br	1979	100 very low

Source: Comprehensive Affordable Housing Strategy 2008 – 2018, City of Tustin.

#### **TABLE HTM-27** ASSISTED HOUSING INVENTORY Type/Length **Tenant** Owner: of **Earliest** Date Type(s) of Project Name, Type Condition Name, Affordability Potential # of **Bedroom** Built Gov't (i.e., Address (if Controls Conversion Address, Units Mix (if Elderly, (incl. zip) Assistance known) (including Tel.# Date(s) known) Family) Sec. 8) FEDERAL **Tustin Gardens** Goldrich & Kest HUD 221(D)(4) July/2013 101 Elderly 101 1-br 1979 Good ---5150 Overland Ave. E. 6th Section 8 100 Tustin, CA 92780 Culver City, CA 213-204-2050 90230 Kenyon Pointe RPK Development HUD 71 1964 Good January Family 17021-17121 2566 Overland Ave. 207/223(f) 2040 Kenyon Drive Suite 700 Tustin, CA 92780 Los Angeles, CA 90064 **STATE** Westchester Park Westchester Park, California Tax Income 150 Family 17-1br N/A Good Credit 93-2br (Orange Gardens) L.P. restricted. No 10/2029 1602 Nisson Rd. Allocation rent 40-3br Tustin, CA 92780 Committee restrictions

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

## TABLE HTM- 27 ASSISTED HOUSING INVENTORY

Project Name, Address (incl. zip)	Owner: Name, Address, Tel. #	Type(s) of Gov't Assistance	Type/Length of Affordability Controls (including Sec. 8)	Earliest Potential Conversion Date(s)	# of Units	Tenant Type (i.e., Elderly, Family)	Bedroom Mix	Date Built (if known)	Condition (if known)
Flanders Pointe 15520 Tustin Village Way Tustin, CA 92780	Tustin Affordable Housing Corp.	California Statewide Communities Development Authority, 1999	Income restricted. No rent restrictions	10/2029	49	Family	41-2br 7-2-br	1966	Good
Coventry Court 16000 Cambridge Way Tustin, CA 92782 714.389.1188	Meta Housing Corporation 1640 S. Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 425 Los Angeles, CA 90025	CTCAC	Regulatory Agreement	July 2067	153	Senior	80-1br 73-2br	2012	Excellent
LOCAL									
Tustin Grove Tustin, CA 92780	Tract 14934	Redevelopment Agency	DDA <sup>1</sup>	N/A	21	Family	21-3br	N/A	Very Good
Ambrose Lane Tustin, CA 92780	Tract 15707	Redevelopment Agency	DDA <sup>1</sup>	N/A	5	Family	5-3br	N/A	Very Good

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

## TABLE HTM- 27 ASSISTED HOUSING INVENTORY

Project Name, Address (incl. zip)	Owner: Name, Address, Tel. #	Type(s) of Gov't Assistance	Type/Length of Affordability Controls (including Sec. 8)	Earliest Potential Conversion Date(s)	# of Units	Tenant Type (i.e., Elderly, Family)	Bedroom Mix	Date Built (if known)	Condition (if known)
Heritage Place Tustin, CA 92780	Tustin Heritage Place, L.P.	County Revenue Bonds, Tax Credits, RDA Loans	Income restricted, Senior 62+	04/2057	54	Senior	42-1br 12-2br	2001	Very Good
Chatam Village (Hampton Square) 16331 McFadden Ave. Tustin, CA 92780	Fairfield Residential Corp.	Southern California Home Finance Agency	Income restricted. No rent restrictions	2026	210	Family	124-1br 86-2br	1969	Good
Tustin Field I Tustin, CA 92782	Various owners	Redevelopment Agency	Ownership income restricted.	45 years of initial purchase date	78	Family	27-2br 51-3br	2006	Excellent
Tustin Field II Tustin, CA 92782	Various owners	Redevelopment Agency	Ownership income restricted.	45 years of initial purchase date	40	Family	40-3br	2007	Excellent

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

## TABLE HTM- 27 ASSISTED HOUSING INVENTORY

Project Name, Address (incl. zip)	Owner: Name, Address, Tel. #	Type(s) of Gov't Assistance	Type/Length of Affordability Controls (including Sec. 8)	Earliest Potential Conversion Date(s)	# of Units	Tenant Type (i.e., Elderly, Family)	Bedroom Mix	Date Built (if known)	Condition (if known)
Arbor Walk Tustin, CA 92780	Various owners	Redevelopment Agency	Ownership income restricted.	45 years of initial purchase date	10	Family	10-3br	2006	Excellent
Cambridge Lane Tustin, CA 92782	Various owners	Redevelopment Agency	Ownership income restricted.	45 years of initial purchase date	50	Family	11-1br 13-2br 12-3br	2006-2007	Excellent
Camden Place Tustin, CA 92782	Various owners	Redevelopment Agency	Ownership income restricted.	45 years of initial purchase date	63	Family	22-2br 15-3br	2006-2007	Excellent
Clarendon Tustin, CA 92782	Various owners	Redevelopment Agency	Ownership income restricted.	45 years of initial purchase date	42	Family	42-3br	2006-2007	Excellent

### **TABLE HTM-27** ASSISTED HOUSING INVENTORY

Project Name, Address (incl. zip)	Owner: Name, Address, Tel. #	Type(s) of Gov't Assistance	Type/Length of Affordability Controls (including Sec. 8)	Earliest Potential Conversion Date(s)	# of Units	Tenant Type (i.e., Elderly, Family)	Bedroom Mix	Date Built (if known)	Condition (if known)
TOTAL					1,205				

N/A - Not available

<sup>1</sup> DDA - Disposition and Development Agreement Source: Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy 2008 -2018, City of Tustin

**Replacement/Acquisition and Rehabilitation Analysis:** The City of Tustin has identified the preservation of existing affordable housing units as one of the most cost-effective methods of maintaining the stock of affordable housing, therefore a high-priority program for the City. The City has identified 100 units of at-risk housing at Tustin Gardens with expiring use restrictions within the planning period, including 100 units of very low income housing.

Given the relative weakness of economic conditions and the housing market currently, the City will proceed to attempt to negotiate the extension of affordability restrictions on these units in advance of the specific expiration dates for these units. The amount of assistance provided will be negotiated based on the specific economics of each development and the potential availability of leverage financing, such as tax-exempt bonds and 4% tax credits. Funds were previously allocated to this program in prior planning periods. However, as a result of the dissolution of Redevelopment, the Low and Moderate Income Housing Funds, allocated to this program were recaptured by the State and transferred to the Orange County Auditor-Controller for distribution to the appropriate taxing entities.

**Local Rental Subsidy.** An option for preservation of at-risk units assisted by either project based Section 8 funds and/or bond financing would be a local rental subsidy to residents. This option could be used to retain the affordable status of the units, by providing assistance to residents when their affordable units convert to market rate. Rent subsidies using state, local (the use of HOME funds or other funding sources) can be used to maintain the affordability of these at-risk units. Rent subsidies can be structured to mirror the Section 8 program. There are several funding sources that could be used to provide subsidies to residents.

Under the project based Section 8 program, HUD pays owners the difference between what tenants can pay (defined as 30% of household income) and what HUD and the local Housing Authority estimate to be Fair Market Rent (FMR) on the unit. Section 8 assistance is only available to very low-income households earning less than 50% of the County median income. The 2013 HUD median income in Orange County is \$87,200. The analysis also assumes the average very low-income household has an actual income of 50% of the County median income, adjusted for household size.

The cost of providing subsidies for all 100 at-risk units with potential to expire during the planning period to maintain subsidized rents assumes that none of the at-risk units are preserved. The cost of providing subsidies is based on a comparison between fair market rents (FMR) and rents that are affordable for low and very low-income families. Affordability is defined as rents that do not exceed 30% of a household's monthly income. The 2013 FMRs for Orange County, which encompasses the City of Tustin, are shown in Table HTM-28.

#### TABLE HTM- 28 2013 FAIR MARKET RENTS ORANGE COUNTY

Efficiency*	1 Bedroom	2 Bedroom	3 Bedroom	4 Bedroom
\$1,126	\$1,294	\$1,621	\$2,268	\$2,525

\*Efficiency = Studio Apartment FMRs include utility costs

Source: U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development

Table HTM-29 indicates that affordable rents for very low income households would be approximately \$763 for a one bedroom unit, \$872 for a two bedroom unit, and \$981 for a three bedroom unit. To simplify the analysis, the one bedroom senior units at-risk in Tustin Gardens (100 one-bedroom units) are assumed to be comprised of one-person households.

#### TABLE HTM- 29 Affordable Rents City of Tustin 2013

Unit Size (No. of Bedrooms)	Very Low 50% AMI	Low 80% AMI	Moderate 120% AMI
1 Bedroom	\$763	\$916	\$1,679
2 Bedrooms	\$872	\$1,046	\$1,918
3 Bedrooms	\$981	\$1,178	\$2,159
4 Bedrooms	\$1,090	\$1,308	\$2,398

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development published 2013 very low income limits, adjusted proportionally for 60% of percentage of AMI category. Gross rents are calculated assuming an occupancy standard of 1 person per bedroom plus one. Rents are calculated assuming 30% of gross income spent on rent, including utilities.

Source: Tustin Housing Authority

The costs of providing a rental subsidy for all 100 at-risk units affordable to very low income households is shown in Table HTM-30 to be approximately \$53,100 per month and \$637,200 annually. Actual subsidies required would vary from this estimate, as some households earn below the assumed 50% of the County median and therefore require higher subsidies, while other households may be comprised of a different number of persons and therefore, the assumed baseline affordable rent may be higher or lower, depending on household size.

#### TABLE HTM- 30 COST OF PROVIDING RENTAL SUBSIDY FOR VERY LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS

Unit 1 Bedroom	FMR \$1,294	Affordable Rent <sup>1</sup> \$763	No. Units \$100	Differen ce \$531	Total Monthly \$53,100	<b>Annual</b> \$637,200
2	\$1,621	\$872	\$0	\$749	\$0	\$0
Bedroom TOTAL					\$53,100	\$637,200

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Affordable rent includes all utilities

Sources: County of Orange Section 8 Program; Tustin Housing Authority.

### CONSTRAINTS TO THE DEVELOPMENT, IMPROVEMENT AND MAINTENANCE OF HOUSING

This chapter examines the various constraints to housing development in Tustin. These include governmental constraints and non-governmental constraints

#### GOVERNMENTAL CONSTRAINTS

Sections 65583(a) (4) of the Government Code require the Housing Element to include an analysis of potential and actual governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement or development of housing for all income levels. The following analysis fulfills this requirement.

#### Land Use Controls

The State Planning and Zoning Law (Sec. 65860) requires consistency of the zoning ordinances with the General Plan. The existing Land Use Element of the General Plan establishes single-family, multi-family and planned residential districts. The zoning ordinance is consistent with the Land Use Element in that areas of the City are designated for Single-Family, Multi-Family, Specific Plan and Planned Community Districts. An analysis of residential development potential will be provided in the Housing Element.

As shown in Table HTM-31, the City's existing General Plan allows a range of residential densities, from a range of 1 – 7 dwelling units per acre in the Low Density Residential designation up to 25 dwelling units per acre in the High Density Residential designation, which corresponds to the R-3 Multiple Family Residential District in the Zoning Code. Up to 10 units per net acre are permitted in the MHP (Mobile Home Park) District. The Zoning Code standards in the residential zones establish a front yard setback requirement of a range between 15 and 20 feet, the side yard setback requirement is 5 feet for interior side yards and 10 feet for corner lots, and the rear yard setback requirement ranges between 5 and 25 feet.

#### TABLE HTM- 31 GENERAL PLAN RESIDENTIAL LAND USE CATEGORIES CITY OF TUSTIN

		Effective Dwelling Unit per	Density
Designation	Description	Acreage	Range
Low Density Residential	Detached single-family dwellings	5.61	1-7
Medium Density Residential	Multi-family dwellings including	15.0	8-15
	duplex, condominiums, townhomes,		
	and apartments.		
High Density Residential	Multi-family dwellings including	21.53	15-25
	duplex, condominiums, townhomes,		
	and apartments.		
Mobile Home Park	Mobile homes	6.31	1-10
Planning Community (PD)	Low, medium, and high-density	1	1
, ,	residential developments.		
MCAS Tustin Specific Plan	Low, medium, and medium high-	2	2
	density residential developments.		

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Maximum density in dwelling units per acre is prescribed by individual Planned Community Documents. Effective dwelling units per acre for low, medium, and high density residential are 4.485, 11.834, and 17.39, respectively.

Source: City of Tustin General Plan, Land Use Element, 2001.

According to the General Plan build-out table (Table LU-3) in the Land Use Element, a total of 29,821 dwelling units are anticipated within the City limits. The Department of Finance (DOF) reports there are 26,958 dwelling units (as of January 2013) within the City.

As developed through the adoption of AB 2348, Statutes of 2004, a metropolitan city of Tustin's size is allowed to use "default" density standards of at least 30 dwelling units per acre as determined in the Government Code Section 65583.2 to accommodate the City's share of regional housing need for lower income households.

The General Plan Land Use Element's policy plan provides goals for future land development within the City. These goals and policies are reflections of the direction and images the City seeks for the future. The goals and policies include:

- 1. Achieve balanced development;
- 2. Ensure that compatible and complementary development occurs;
- 3. Revitalize older commercial, industrial, and residential development;
- 4. Promote economic expansion and diversification;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Low Density (1-7 du/ac), Medium Density (8-15 du/ac), Medium High Density (16-25 du/ac) In Neighborhood D, the maximum density on an individual parcel may exceed 25 units per acre as long as the total dwelling units allocated to Neighborhood D is not exceeded.

- 5. Coordinate development with the provision of adequate public facilities and services;
- 6. Strengthen the development character and mixture of uses in the Old Town/First Street area; and
- 7. Promote an integrated business park character for the Pacific Center East

Some suggest that low-income housing could be developed in the absence of land use controls related to density. It is true that the reduction or absence of land area requirements per housing units would result in lower land costs per unit, if all factors were constant. However, an analysis of development costs shows that the value of the land is related to its potential yield. For example, an acre of land that was authorized for four (4) dwelling units will be priced at a lower value than an acre of land authorized for six (6) dwelling units. The same analogy holds for multifamily sites whereby the land costs are related directly to the potential yield in terms of unit density. Tustin has a high percentage of multi-family units where only 35.1% of the housing stock is devoted to single-family detached units and 61.5% to attached and multi-family units. (The remaining percentage consists of mobile homes).

Current land use controls restrict development in single-family residential zones to one dwelling unit on parcels less than 10,000 square feet in the E-4 zone and parcels less than 7,200 square feet in the R-1 zone. However, the Planned Community District has authorized residential subdivisions with single-family lots of less than 5,000 square feet, which has significantly increased density potential to approximately 8-13 units per acre. In addition, the provisions for Second Residential Unit adopted in 2003 allow a second unit to be constructed without discretionary permit approval provided that the site complies with criteria contained in the Zoning Ordinance.

Within the multi-family district (R-3), a 35-foot height limitation and maximum 65% lot coverage precludes the development of high-rise housing projects. In the interest of protecting adjoining single-family lot owners, multi-family structures above 20 feet in height require a conditional use permit when the structures are within 150 feet of single-family residentially zoned lots. There are approximately 20 properties with an R-3 zoning designation that abut Single Family Residential (R-1) zoning comprised of a variety of older apartment units and several parcels within Old Town Tustin that are adjacent to the First Street commercial zoning areas. While these height limits may place some restrictions on housing development, these limits are designed to maintain compatibility of land use intensity and are commonly used by local governments as a development tool to further this ideal. When designed properly with features such as limited windows and door openings along the walls facing single family zoned properties or using stepped building heights and design

to minimize intrusion to the privacy of existing residents, Conditional Use Permits to allow such development projects have been granted. Although, it should be noted that this restriction would not impact areas where future residential development are targeted within this planning period, since the City's RHNA quantified objective identified preservation of existing units and new construction units at Tustin Legacy where the 20 foot limitation would not be applicable.

Conversely, within Planning Area D of the MCAS Tustin Specific Plan, a 150 foot height limitation up to 180 foot, if approved by the Community Development Director, would be allowed. This provides for layering products (i.e. stacked flats, podium style, etc.) with mixed use developments, thereby providing opportunities for the development of higher density residential products. Projects are also able to take advantage of the Planned Community District application process where special considerations are needed.

Parking requirements for residential uses are typically two (2) spaces per dwelling unit. In multiple family residential districts, additional one (1) space for each four (4) units is required for guest spaces. Carports for multi-family units are permitted which would reduce development costs in contracts to the provision of garages. Furthermore, affordable and senior housing development meeting the State Density Bonus Law would be eligible to use the reduced parking standards under the State Law.

Table HTM-32 is a summary of the City's residential zoning regulations.

#### TABLE HTM- 32 Summary of Residential Zoning Regulations City of Tustin

Zoning	Minimum Lot Area	Lot	Building Height	Front Yard	Interior Side Yard	Corner Side Yard	Rear Yard	Parking
R-A Residential Agricultural District	7,200 square feet	40 percent	30 feet	20 feet	5 feet	10 feet	5 feet, but no less than 1,000 feet clear and unobstructed on open space.	2 car garage per dwelling, 3 car garage per dwelling with five or more bedrooms
E-4 Residential Estate District	10,000 square feet	40 percent	30 feet	20 feet	10% of lot width	10% of lot width	20 percent lot depth	2 car garage per dwelling, 3 car garage per dwelling with five or more bedrooms
R-1 Single-Family Residential District	7,200 square feet	40 percent	30 feet	20 feet	5 feet	10 feet	5 feet, but no less than 1,000 feet clear and unobstructed on rear 1/3 of lot.	2 car garage per dwelling, 3 car garage per dwelling with five or more bedrooms
R-2 Duplex Residential District	3,500 square feet	40 percent	30 feet	20 feet	5 feet	10 feet	-	2 car garage per dwelling; one of which shall be garage space
R-2 Duplex Residential District (single structure)	3,500 square feet	50 percent	35 feet	20 feet	5 feet	10 feet	10 feet	2 car garage per dwelling; one of which shall be garage space
R-3 Multiple Family Residential District	1,750 square feet	65 percent	35 feet	15 feet	5 feet	10 feet	10 feet	2 assigned covered spaces per unit, plus one unassigned open space per 4 units
R-4 Suburban Residential District	3,000		2 stories or 35 feet	20 feet	5 feet	10 feet	25 feet	2 assigned covered spaces per unit, plus one unassigned open space per 4 units

### TABLE HTM- 32 Summary of Residential Zoning Regulations City of Tustin

Zoning	Minimum Lot Area	Lot Coverage	Building Height	Front Yard	Interior Side Yard	Corner Side Yard	Rear Yard	Parking
MPH Mobile Home Park District	Minimum 5 acre site for mobile home park. Travel trailer shall not exceed 10% of total spaces in mobile home park.	75 percent	30 feet	Trailer park-none. Individual lot-5 feet (measure from curb to actual structure, hitch excluded).				2 spaces per mobile home lot, plus 1 guest space for each 10 mobile home lots.
P-D Planned Development District	10,000	To be determined with adoption of P-D District	To be determined with adoption of P-D District	To be determined with adoption of P-D District	To be determined with adoption of P-D District	To be determined with adoption of P-D District	To be determined with adoption of P-D District	2 assigned covered spaces per unit, plus one unassigned open space per 4 units

Source: City of Tustin, Zoning Code, 2012.

#### Housing for Persons with Disabilities/Reasonable Accommodation

The City of Tustin recognizes the importance of addressing the housing needs for persons with disabilities. The City's Zoning Code defines "family" as "an individual or two (2) or more persons living together as a single housekeeping unit in a dwelling unit." This definition accommodates unrelated persons living together in a dwelling unit; thus, the City's definition for a family would not constrain the development and rehabilitation for persons with disabilities.

The City requires each development to comply with Title 24 of the California Code. All multi-family complexes are required to provide accessible parking spaces based upon the prescribed State code requirements. For development of special needs housing such as housing for the disabled, senior housing, etc., parking requirements would be determined based upon parking demand analysis which by nature would allow for lower parking ratio in comparison to those required for multiple family residential units. In addition, an off-street parking ordinance adopted by the City allows for the reduction in parking due to an American with Disabilities Act (ADA) upgrade. The Community Development Director is authorized to allow the reduction in the number of required parking spaces when the site is brought up to ADA standards. This provision provides incentives to property owners to provide reasonable accommodation to the disabled.

The City also requires new multi-family housing units and apartment conversions to condominiums to comply with State specifications pursuant to SB 520 for accommodation of the disabled.

A Residential Care facility serving six (6) or fewer persons is a permitted use in all residential districts. The City's Zoning Ordinance does not contain maximum concentration requirements for a residential care facility serving six (6) or fewer persons.

The City recognizes the need of disabled persons to retrofit their residences to allow for mobility such as wheelchair ramps, widened doorways, grab bars, and access ramps. When these improvements meet development standards, only a building permit is required. In 2011, the City amended the Zoning Code to remove governmental constraints to reasonable accommodation for the disabled. The amendment provides a process in which deviations from the development standards associated with physical improvements to accommodate the disabled would be accommodated with administrative approval and without the need of a public hearing.

#### **Homeless Accommodation**

Homelessness is a statewide concern that affects many cities and counties. Throughout the country, homelessness has become an ongoing problem. Factors

contributing to homelessness include the general lack of housing affordable to Low and Moderate income persons, increases in the number of persons whose incomes fall below the poverty level, reductions in public subsidy to the poor, and the deinstitutionalization of the mentally ill. The issue of homelessness is considered regional in nature. Nomadic tendencies of homeless persons make it difficult to assess the population accurately.

According to the 2009 Orange County Homeless Census and Survey, the County has 8,333 homeless individuals of which an estimated 5,724 are unsheltered, 962 are in emergency shelters and 1,647 are in transitional shelters. The Census and Survey estimated that 21,479 people in Orange County experience homelessness annually. Of these individuals, 3,578 are identified as chronically homeless, 1,904 as severely mentally ill, 68 are suffering from HIV/AIDS, 475 are victims of domestic violence and 2,683 suffer from chronic substance abuse.

Within the City of Tustin, Police reports and windshield surveys indicate limited numbers of persons on the street and have shown that there are no established areas where homeless persons congregate in the City and that most persons migrate through Tustin to other areas within Orange County, rather than stay for extended periods of time. The Orange County Partnership, a non-profit organization whose purpose is to strengthen public and private agencies serving the homeless and those at risk of homelessness, reported that in 2009 there were 10 homeless persons who identified Tustin as the city of last known permanent address. The McKinney-Vento Homeless Education Assistance Act reported 55 homeless children and youth enrolled in the Tustin Unified School District during 2006-07.

SB 2 defines the following: "Emergency Shelters" as housing for homeless purposes intended for occupancy of less than six (6) months, where no person is denied occupancy because of inability to pay. "Transitional housing" is rental housing for stays of at least six (6) months where the units are re-circulated to another person after a set period. "Supportive Housing" has no limit on the length of stay, provides supportive services and is occupied by low-income persons with disabilities and certain other disabled persons.

SB 2 requires the city to identify the needs for emergency shelters in its Housing Element and to designate zoning districts adequate to accommodate the need. In those districts, emergency shelters must be allowed without a conditional use permit or other discretionary approvals. The city may apply certain written, objective development and management standards, such as number of beds and length of stay, if no zoning district exists that meets this standard. Alternatively, a community may require a conditional use permit for emergency shelters if they already have enough shelters to satisfy the need; or have entered into partnership agreement with up to two other communities to develop an emergency shelter that

will meet their collective needs. Supportive and transitional housing must be treated as a residential use of property, subject to only to same restrictions that apply to other housing of the same type in that zone.

With the closure of the Marine Corps Air Station (MCAS) Tustin, the City was provided with opportunity to address homeless accommodation. As part of the conveyance process and under the Base Closure Community Redevelopment and Homeless Assistance Act of 1994 (The "Redevelopment Act"), the City of Tustin as, the Local Redevelopment Agency (LRA) was required to consider the interest of the homeless in buildings and property on the base in preparing the Reuse Plan (MCAS Tustin Specific Plan/Reuse Plan). In developing the Reuse Plan, one criteria the Secretary of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) utilized to determine the adequacy of the Reuse Plan was whether the Plan considered the size and nature of the homeless population in the communities, in the vicinity of the installation, and availability of existing services in such communities to meet the needs of the homeless in such communities.

At the time of the preparation of the Reuse Plan, it was estimated that there was a total net homeless need of 411 persons in the City of Tustin and City of Irvine (A portion of the MCAS Tustin is located within the City of Irvine jurisdiction). A large portion of this homeless need was identified as necessary to support emergency transitional housing for youth and individuals. The local homeless need as described in both Tustin and Irvine's Consolidated Plans also indicated a gap in the continuum of care in the areas of vocational and job training/educational opportunities, some emergency and transitional housing units for individuals and families, support services, and affordable ownership units. Accordingly, the Homeless Assistance Plan for MCAS Tustin was adopted to addresses the problem of homelessness by utilizing the continuum of care model promulgated by HUD for accommodating the needs of the homeless in a manner which is consistent with the Consolidated Plans approved for the cities of Tustin and Irvine.

The fundamental components of the continuum of care system implemented with the MCAS Tustin Reuse Plan:

- Provides emergency shelter beds;
- Offers transitional housing and services which enable homeless persons to progress to self-sufficiency; and
- Provides opportunities for permanent affordable housing by the private sector.

As a result, the adopted MCAS Tustin Specific Plan provided sites and designated land uses to accommodate the identified homeless needs. The following sites were set aside in implementing the homeless accommodation at Tustin Legacy (formerly MCAS Tustin):

- An approximate five (5) acre transitional/emergency shelter site was setaside for accommodation of the homeless at MCAS Tustin. The City acquired a site from the Department of Navy; initially ground leased the site, and ultimately conveyed the site to the Orange County Rescue Mission at no cost and facilitated the construction of Village of Hope, a 192 unit transitional housing facility, without the need for a Conditional Use Permit. The project has been completed.
- A four (4) acre site was recommended by the City of Tustin and deeded directly by the Department of Navy at no cost to the Orange County Social Services Agency for the development of an abused and neglected child and emancipated youth facility with 90 beds capacity. The project is complete.
- A total of 50 transitional housing units were originally included in the Base Reuse Plan. Based on further negotiations with non-profit homeless providers, a total of 32 new transitional housing units were constructed and conveyed at no cost to non-profit homeless providers at Tustin Legacy. These units are dispersed throughout the Tustin Legacy community to allow integration into the community. The sites are designated as residential sites and the units were constructed in conjunction with market rate units subject to only those restrictions that apply to other residential uses. The units are transparent since the units are developed identical to those of market rate units in terms of size, materials, locations, etc. No special or other entitlement applications were required for the creation of these units other than those typically required for development of residential units at Tustin Legacy. In addition to the homeless accommodation on-site at Tustin Legacy, the City also facilitated the purchase of a 16 unit transitional housing facility off-site for one of the homeless providers. subsidized the creation of these units through the use of housing set aside funds and Federal HUD Homeless Assistance funds.

In addition to the homeless accommodation, the City also encourages support services to support the community of continuum of care model to end the cycle of homelessness and to provide participants with tools to once again become contributing members of the community as follows:

 Private sector opportunities are provided to create a balanced mix of housing types on the base. Through inclusionary Zoning standards in the MCAS Tustin Specific Plan, a total of 879<sup>2</sup> affordable units or 20.8 percent of total authorized units at Tustin Legacy are required to allow participants

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Includes 32 transitional housing units set aside for non-profit homeless providers.

with opportunity to achieve self-sufficiency. Specific affordable housing requirements would be established at the time of development project approval to ensure conformity with the Housing Element of the City's General Plan and any provisions of California Community Redevelopment Law.

- The Navy will be transferring a child care facility at the former MCAS Tustin to the City of Tustin, which will provide opportunities for access for all to mainstream child care facilities, including early child care and education programs, Head Start, etc.
- Adult education and training opportunities will be provided by the South Orange County Community College District within the educational village.

#### Emergency Shelters, Transitional Housing, and Supportive Housing

SB 2 defines "Emergency Shelters" as housing for homeless purposes intended for occupancy of less than six (6) months, where no person is denied occupancy because of inability to pay. In the City of Tustin, emergency shelters are designated as permitted uses within Planning Area 3 of the MCAS Tustin Specific Plan. Planning Area 3 is a five (5) acre site that had been a no cost conveyance to the Orange County Rescue Mission for the development of an emergency/transitional shelter that is known as Village of Hope. The City facilitated the development of the Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope and waived permits fees as this was a public/private partnership. The project consists of 192 units available for emergency and transitional needs.

As of April 30, 2013, the Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope was at 90% capacity, with a total of 173 homeless individuals consisting of homeless single men, single women, single women with children, single men with children, and two parent families. The largest homeless sub-population on the Village of Hope campus is single women with children. The Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope priority is to serve Tustin homeless population prior to taking any other referrals from other cities or the County. The Tustin Police Department actively refers individuals to the Village of Hope upon encounter. The Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope also provides a food service program of approximately 550 meals daily to the Armory.

Based upon the available data obtained from the Orange County Partnership and McKinney Vento Homeless Education Assistance Act, approximately 34-55 individuals reported either Tustin as their last known permanent address or enrolled within the Tustin Unified School District. This means that the City of

Tustin is accommodating 137-158 homeless persons beyond its jurisdictional boundaries thereby accommodating a regional need. The City interviewed the Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope representative and the City was told that there are generally 5 vacant units and a minimum of five (5) percent vacancy is available at any given time. The Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope also indicated that the shelter has met above and beyond the City's conservative estimate of 55 homeless persons and that the shelter could accommodate the year-round needs and seasonal fluctuation in the amount of available beds.

Transitional housing is defined as rental housing for stays of at least six (6) months where the units are re-circulated to another person after a set period. This housing can take several forms, including group housing or multi-family units, and often includes supportive services component to allow individuals to gain necessary life skills in support of independent living. The Tustin's Zoning Code accommodates transitional housing within several zoning districts depending on the project's physical structure: 1) transitional housing operated as a residential care facility is permitted/conditionally permitted depending on the number of occupants in residential districts; and 2) transitional housing operated as rental apartments, it is permitted by right as a multi-family residential uses where multifamily housing is permitted.

Supportive housing is defined as permanent (no limit on the length of stay), provides supportive services and is occupied by low-income persons with disabilities and certain other disabled persons. Services may include assistance designed to meet the needs of the target population in retaining housing, career counseling, mental health treatment, and life skills. The Tustin's Zoning Code permits supportive housing as a residential use, provided supportive services are ancillary to the primary use.

Within the City of Tustin, the following emergency shelters, transitional, and supportive housing are designated as permitted uses as follows:

TABLE HTM 33
SUMMARY OF HOMELESS ACCOMMODATION
ZONING REGULATIONS

Housing Type	Permitted/ Conditionally Permitted	Zoning
Transitional Home	Permitted	Planning Area 3 of MCAS Tustin Specific Plan
Emergency Shelters	Permitted	Planning Area 3 of MCAS Tustin Specific Plan
Supportive housing	Permitted	Planning Areas 1 and 3 of MCAS

		Tustin Specific Plan
Community Care Facility for six (6) or fewer	Permitted	All residentially zoned properties
Family care home, foster home, or group home for six (6) or fewer <sup>1</sup>	Permitted	All residentially zoned properties

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Includes congregate care facility, single room occupancy hotel, and children's intermediate care shelter

Source: City of Tustin, MCAS Tustin Specific Plan

The following are transitional homes that have been provided in the City at Tustin Legacy.

- 1. A 192 beds transitional home at the Village of Hope operated by the Orange County Rescue Mission.
- 2. A 90 beds intermediate care shelter for abused children and their parents operated by the Orange County Social Services Agency.
- 3. Six (6) units at Tustin Field I operated by Salvation Army.
- 4. Acquisition of 16 units in Buena Park operated by Salvation Army. The City assisted in acquisition and contributed grant funds to acquire the units.
- 5. Fourteen (14) units at Columbus Grove operated by Families Forward, formerly Irvine Temporary Housing.<sup>3</sup>
- 6. Six (6) units at Columbus Grove operated by Human Options.
- 7. Six (6) units at Columbus Grove operated by Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter.

With the exception of the transitional homes, these units are transparent and dispersed throughout the Tustin Legacy community consistent with the City's goals and policies to provide adequate supply of housing to meet the need for a variety of housing types and the diverse socio-economic and to promote the dispersion and integration of housing for all socio-economic throughout the community.

#### **Building Codes**

As required by State law, the City of Tustin has adopted the 2010 Construction Codes which includes "2010 California Building Code" and the "2010 California Mechanical Code" published by the International Conference of Building Officials, the "2010 California Residential Code," the "2008 California Energy Code," and the "2010 California Green Building Code.". Other codes adopted by the City include

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Although these units are located in the City of Irvine, these units were negotiated as part of the base realignment/conveyance process in which Tustin is the Local Redevelopment Agency.

the "2010 California Plumbing Code," the "2010 California Electrical Code," the "2010 California Historical Building Code," and the "2010 California Existing Building Code." While the codes are intended to protect the public from unsafe conditions they result in an increase in the cost of housing in various ways. The codes establish specifications for building materials and incorporate seismic safety standards that add to construction costs.

The technical details of construction, requirements for state licensed contractors to perform the work, plan check, permit processing and field inspections all contribute to the increased cost of housing. In general, in states and counties where building codes have not been adopted, the cost of housing is less than comparable housing costs in California. Where individuals are permitted to construct shelters to their own specifications and within the limits of their individual construction skills, there will be a much greater proportion of low-income housing available than in those areas which adopt and enforce uniform building codes. It is noted; however, in those areas that have not adopted and enforced building codes, the low-cost housing may resulted in the creation of substandard building conditions and practices conditions that threaten the health and safety of the residents.

Unquestionably, building codes are a governmental constraint to the construction of low-income housing. The question to be resolved is the conflicting values between health and safety and low-cost shelter. Originally in 1988, the City of Tustin adopted the State Historical Building Code as required by State law. The State Historical Building Code requires relaxation of Uniform Building Code requirements for historic structures. This will reduce rehabilitation costs and may encourage rehabilitation of housing units which have historic value and preserve much needed housing units in the Old Town Area.

#### **Site Improvements**

The restricted and limited ability to tax property in an amount equal to the cost of services and public improvements has shifted site improvement costs to the developer who passes them on to the housing consumer. The philosophy is expressed that no new development should impose a financial liability upon the existing community residents. The voters have expressed this conviction through the adoption of growth control measures and Proposition 13.

An increased awareness of environmental amenities creates a public demand for improvements of not only the building site but of the surrounding environment which consists of drainage channels, landscaped parkways, arterial roads to serve the area, recreation facilities, preservation of open space, school facilities, and recreation amenities, all of which add to the cost of housing.

Site development standards and requirements in the City of Tustin include clearing and grading the land; dedication and improvement of public right-of-way to include paving, curbs and gutters, sidewalks, drainage, street trees, streetlights and

fire hydrants. On-site improvements include the under grounding of cable TV, water, sewer, gas, telephone and electric utilities. Subdivisions and multifamily developments are required to provide landscaping, drainage, perimeter walls, covered parking, landscaping, irrigation systems, and to submit materials and project design for review to assure architectural compatibility. Applicable multifamily structures are required to provide housing and parking accommodations for the disabled pursuant to State law. The review process is used to facilitate the land use and development compatibility objectives of the City and provide developers the opportunity to explore project alternatives, which could decrease development costs in the long run by avoiding costly mistakes.

In the development of subdivisions, the developer is required to dedicate and improve roadways to serve the area; to provide or improve area drainage channels; to extend water, sewer and other utilities to the site; to dedicate land or pay in-lieu fees for parks and open space for private use in multiple-family projects; and to dedicate land or pay in-lieu fees for public facilities such as schools and fire stations. Developers are allowed to construct private streets or to modify street standards to reduce construction costs, and this encourages and will encourage affordability of housing units in former MCAS Tustin. An additional cost of site development results from the installation of noise attenuation devices and materials as required by State law. Perimeter walls and/or berms are required for subdivisions to reduce the noise levels from external surface sources such as railroads, freeways and arterial highways for sites that are located within 65 dB (CNEL) Noise Levels. Some of these costs can be reduced by the use of special State and Federal grant funds to produce low- and moderate-income housing units.

Significant public facilities will be needed to accommodate the new and proposed housing development at the former MCAS Tustin. According to the MCAS Tustin Reuse Plan/Specific Plan, water, sewer, storm drainage, electrical, natural gas, and telephone and cable backbone systems that serve future housing sites will need to be constructed. All housing sites will also have to pay their proportionate share for new backbone utilities, roads, and traffic improvements required in conjunction with development of the MCAS Tustin site and as mitigation for the adopted Final Joint Environmental Impact Statement/Environmental Impact Report for the Disposal and Reuse of MCAS-Tustin and its Addendum.

#### **Fees and Exactions**

By law, the City's building and development fees are restricted to the costs of performing the services. The building and planning fee schedules of the City of Tustin were last revised in 2008. These fees still remain considerably below those of surrounding communities in the County. These fees may be and have been waived by the City Council for projects where extraordinary benefits are derived such as low-income housing projects, but are typically required to offset City expenses.

The fee schedule adopted by the City of Tustin has a minimal impact upon the cost of housing within the City. The argument can be made that the cost of inspecting and serving new developments exceeds the fees and revenues that are exacted for these developments. This is justified as a public service to protect the public health, safety and welfare of the future inhabitants and is partially borne by the general revenues of the City. Additional revenue sources are increasingly important since the passing of Proposition 13. Recognizing that housing for the elderly and low-income families is a community objective, the park land dedication ordinance provides the option to the Council to waive these fees for qualifying projects. The City might also consider exploring fast-tracking (preferential scheduling) or fee waivers for critical projects such as those providing affordable housing or housing which addresses special housing needs.

In addition to the City's fees, a considerable amount of school fees are also applicable to residential projects. The respective school district should explore waiving all or portion of the school fees for affordable housing projects.

The City, in conjunction with the preparation of the 2009 Housing Element also prepared the Affordable Gap and Leveraged Financing Analysis (Appendix A of the Housing Element Technical Memorandum attached hereto). The analysis evaluated development costs to arrive to per unit affordability gap in producing affordable units. Table 12 and Table 13 of the analysis summarize average per unit development processing and impact fee of \$29,277 to \$37,530 per unit for owner housing prototype and \$25,586 per unit for rental housing prototype (See Appendix A for specific development processing fees and analysis).

In response to the recent economic downturn, the City Council also adopted an economic stimulus program which allowed the payment of specific development fees for construction of new residential units to be deferred until either prior to final inspection or issuance of certificate of occupancy. This program provided direct and indirect assistance to developer of residential units in that reduced on-hand cash flow were required at time of permit issuance.

#### **Processing and Permit Procedures**

The City recognizes that the myriad of agencies and permit approvals required for a development results in a time-consuming and expensive process. The value of land increases when entitled for development and all necessary permits have been obtained for construction. State law establishes maximum time limits for project approvals and City policies provide for the minimum processing time necessary to comply with legal requirements and review procedures.

The Community Development Department serves as the coordinating agency to process development applications for the approval of other in-house departments such as Police, Public Works/Engineering, and Parks and Recreation. These departments work together to simultaneously review projects to ensure a timely response to developers and act as the City's Design Review Committee.

Pre-application conferences with the Community Development Department provide the developer with information related to standards and requirements applicable to the project. For the more complicated development projects in the Special Management Areas, Specific Plans provide a standard Design Review Process. Application packages are provided to developers and include the processing chart and copies of pertinent information such as street improvement construction standards, subdivision and landscape requirements that aid developers in the preparation of their plans.

All projects are processed through plan review in the order of submission. Recognizing that profit margins are reduced and risks are increased by processing delays, the City has assigned priority to plan review and permit issuance for lowincome housing projects. Additionally, contracts for plan check services provide additional staff to process projects in a timely fashion. If a complete application is submitted, plans are simultaneously reviewed by all Design Review Committee members and plan checking departments rather than one agency reviewing plans at a time. The Design Review application does not require a public hearing or Planning Commission approval. The Tustin City Code authorizes the Community Development Director to approve development plans when findings can be made that the location, size, architectural features and general appearance of the proposed development will not impair the orderly and harmonious development of the area. In making such findings, the Zoning Code provides items to be considered such as height, bulk, setbacks, site planning, exterior materials and colors, relationship of the proposed structures with existing structures in the neighborhood, etc. This code provision affords the developers with tools to design their projects and thus increase certainty of project's design review and approval. Project application which complies with all the development standards prescribed by the district in which the project is located would not be required to go through any other discretionary approval.

For Tustin Legacy, developments under the former Master Developer footprint (approximately 800 acres) are subject to the Legacy Park Design Guidelines to ensure compatibility of products proposed by vertical builders. The design guidelines present minimum design criteria for the achievement of functional, quality, and attractive development expected at the Tustin Legacy. The guidelines are intended to complement the MCAS Tustin Specific Plan district regulations and to provide staff, builders, design professionals, and other users with a concise document when dealing with Design Review process to avoid ambiguity.

Together the Zoning Code, Design Review provisions, the Legacy Park Design Guidelines, and the "one-stop" processing system provide certainty to developers seeking approval for the development of residential projects.

Additionally, for projects of significant benefit to the low-income community, such costs can be waived by the City Council.

#### Workload

Another governmental constraint is the number of staff and amount of staff time available for processing development projects. Since the workload is determined by outside forces (economy and market for housing), a shortage of staff time may occur during strong economic conditions which could lead to increased processing time for development projects.

#### MARKET CONSTRAINTS

The availability of housing is affected by the interrelationships within the market place of price, income of buyer, and interest rates. The non-governmental constraints upon the maintenance, improvement or development of housing in the City relate primarily to low- and moderate-income families. High-income families have the option of selecting housing accommodations that meet their preferences. Since environmental amenities such as hillsides with views and beach access attract high-value developments, high-income families gravitate to the foothills and beach communities. The provision for housing opportunity to all income segments is further emphasized in the East Tustin development whereby single-family attached and detached homes are proposed for moderate- and higher-income households. Additionally, multi-family projects such as apartments and condominiums in East Tustin are provided for the low- and moderate-income groups. The same is true at the former MCAS Tustin area, where provisions for affordable units are required at an average of 20.9 percent. Market rate homes are proposed to accommodate diverse populations from all income levels.

#### **Financing**

Interest rates can have an impact on housing costs. Some mortgage financing is variable rate, which offers an initial lower interest rate than fixed financing. The ability of lending institutions to raise rates will cause existing households to overextend themselves financially, and create situations where high financing costs constrain the housing market. An additional obstacle for the first-time homebuyer is the minimum down-payment required by lending institutions.

Even if Tustin homebuyers are able to provide a 3 percent down-payment and obtain a 3.6 percent 30-year loan (average loan rate for FHA or VA guaranteed loans for May 2013), monthly mortgage payments on median priced single-family detached homes in the City place such homes out of the reach of moderate and lower-income households in the City. At a 3.6 percent interest rate, monthly mortgage payments on median priced condominiums and townhouses can place such units out of reach of Tustin's low and very low income households (see Tables HTM-22 and HTM-23).

The greatest impediment to homeownership, however, is credit worthiness. According to the Federal Housing Authority, lenders consider a person's debt-to-income ratio, cash available for down payment, and credit history, when determining a maximum loan amount. Many financial institutions are willing to significantly decrease down payment requirements and increase loan amounts to persons with good credit rating.

Persons with poor credit ratings may be forced to accept a higher interest rate or a loan amount insufficient to purchase a house. Poor credit rating can be especially

damaging to lower-income residents, who have fewer financial resources with which to qualify for a loan. The FHA is generally more flexible than conventional lenders in its qualifying guidelines and allows many residents to re-establish a good credit history.

#### Profit, Marketing and Overhead

According to the Comprehensive Affordable Housing Strategy<sup>4</sup>, minimum developer profit is estimated at 12 percent of development costs, based on input from developers and the Building Industry Association. This level is considered a baseline profit or "hurdle rate," representing the minimum necessary for the deal to proceed. In the past, due to high market demand in communities like Tustin, developers were able to command for higher prices and realized greater margins for profit. As demand increased and prices rose, this profit margin was impacted by the escalating costs of land resulting from a shrinking supply of land. Marketing and overhead costs also add to the price of homes. The Comprehensive Affordable Strategy 2008 estimated developer overhead is at 4 percent of total development costs.

The factor having the greatest impact on the price of land is location. To a lesser degree, the price of land is governed by supply, demand, yield, availability, cost of the infrastructure, and the readiness for development as related to governmental permits.

Within the developed infill areas of the City, there is a scarcity of land available for residential development. The supply of land is largely limited to the former MCAS Tustin area since the East Tustin Specific Plan area has been built out. Land zoned for commercial or industrial development may not be appropriate for residential development. The development of additional housing accommodations within the urbanized area will require the demolition and/or redevelopment of existing structures, since there are very few vacant lots remaining.

The unavailability of land within the developed areas of the City and the price of land on the fringes are constraints adding to the cost of housing and pricing housing out of the reach of low- and moderate-income families.

#### **Cost of Construction**

One important market-related factor in the actual cost for new housing is construction costs. These costs are influenced by many factors such as the cost of labor, building materials, and site preparation. According to Marshall & Swift estimates, the cost of residential wood frame construction averages \$96.30 per

<sup>4</sup> City of Tustin Comprehensive Affordable Housing Strategy, David Rosen and Associates, 2008

square foot. Therefore, the costs attributed to construction alone for a typical 2,200 square foot, wood frame home would be at minimum \$211,860.

A reduction in amenities and quality of building materials (above a minimum acceptability for health, safety, and adequate performance) could result in lower sales prices. Additionally, pre-fabricated, factory built housing may provide for lower priced housing by reducing construction and labor costs.

An additional factor related to construction costs is the number of units built at the same time. As the number of units developed increases, construction costs over the entire development are generally reduced, based on economies of scale. This reduction in costs is of particular benefit when density bonuses are utilized for the provision of affordable housing. Although it should be noted that the reduced costs are most attributed to a reduction in land costs; when that cost is spread on a per unit basis.

This page intentionally left blank.

#### ENERGY CONSERVATION

As the price of power continues to rise, households have through necessity been devoting more of the household income to energy cost. This condition has further eroded the affordability of housing. No relief is in sight, as one representative from Southern California Edison reinforced in a news article: "higher rates are necessary to assure reliable supplies of electricity in the years ahead." The City can explore possible partnership with utility companies to promote energy rebate programs.

There are energy conservation measures the City of Tustin can promote and others that are mandated by State laws. The State of California has adopted energy conservation standards for residential building in Title 25 of the California Administrative Code. Title 25 applies to new residential construction or an addition to an existing housing unit.

Active solar systems for water heating can be encouraged but they are still rather expensive and can only be used as a back-up to an electric or gas system. They are cost efficient in the long run but pose a short-term impact to affordable housing. Permits for solar systems can be approved ministerially by the Community Development Department, and permits are issued same-day whenever possible. The City can also explore and streamline permits processing for approved green building.

Other energy conservation method could be contributed to site and building design. For an example through proper lots placement at subdivision and buildings' orientation, maximum day lighting can be achieved. Light-colored "cool roofs" can also be applied to new homes or roof replacement projects to promote energy savings.

Water-efficient landscapes, efficient irrigation, and use of permeable paving materials also would contribute to energy saving. This can be achieved through updates to the City's landscape and irrigation guidelines.

This page intentionally left blank.

## SUMMARY OF PREVIOUS HOUSING ELEMENT PROGRAMS

To develop appropriate programs to address the housing issues identified in this Housing Element Update, the City of Tustin has reviewed the housing programs adopted as part of its 2009 Housing Element, and evaluated the effectiveness of these programs in delivering housing services.

By reviewing the progress in implementation of the adopted programs, the effectiveness of the last element, and the continued appropriateness of these identified programs, a comprehensive housing program strategy has been developed.

The following section reviews the progress in implementation of the programs, the effectiveness of the 2009 Element to date, and the continued appropriateness of the identified programs. The results of the analysis provided the basis for developing the comprehensive housing program strategy for the future planning period, as well as goals for the planning period in progress.

### PROGRESS IN IMPLEMENTING THE 2009 GOALS AND OBJECTIVES

Table HTM-35 presents a comparison of the quantified objectives of the previous element and actual achievements since 2006. Table HTM-34 contains a list of projects by program area during the 2006 - 2014 period.

The 2007 SCAG Regional Housing Need Assessment indicated a new construction need in Tustin by 2014 of 2,381 units, of which 512 units were for very low income households, 410 for low income, 468 for moderate income and 991 above moderate income.

TABLE HTM- 34
SUMMARY TABLE EFFECTIVENESS OF HOUSING ELEMENT PROGRAMS, 2006-2014

	New Constructi on		Rehab/Pr	reservation	Housing Assistance		
Income Group	Goal	Actual	Goal <sup>1</sup>	Actual	Goal <sup>1</sup>	Actual	
Very-Low	512	362	198	166	2,079	2,329	
Low	410	127	200	135	35	0	
Moderate	468	189	72	4	15	0	
Above Moderate	991	1,424	0	0		0	
Total	2,381	2,102	470	305	2,129	2,329	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Although goals were not allocated to specific income group, the City attempted to utilize RHNA percentages to fulfill RHNA objectives.

Source: The City of Tustin, Housing Element, 2009; Effectiveness of Housing Element Programs, 2008.

#### **REVIEW OF PAST PERFORMANCE**

State law establishes an eight-year cycle regulating housing element updates. In compliance with the SCAG cycle, the Tustin Housing Element was updated in 1989 at which time it was found to be in compliance with State law, and was updated again in 1994. In 1997, the City of Tustin initiated a comprehensive General Plan update, and the Housing Element was again updated to accommodate the MCAS Reuse Plan and to ensure consistency with other General Plan Elements, as well as to address recent changes in State law. These amendments were adopted on January 16, 2001. In 2002 and 2009, the City updated its Housing Element and was certified by The State's Housing and Community Development Department in compliance with State's Law.

#### **Review of Past Housing Element Objectives**

Tables HTM-33 and HTM-34 summarize the performance of the 2009 Element's goals and objectives. Table HTM-35 provides program by program review of the previous Housing Element, containing a discussion on the effectiveness and continued appropriateness of each program. The time period covered in this analysis is 2006-2014.

The following discussion is a brief highlight of the progress, effectiveness and appropriateness of the past Housing Element Objectives.

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
1.1 Available Sites Continue to utilize Planned Community Districts and Specific Plans to authorize and encourage mixed-use developments (see Zoning Studies Program).  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.8, 1.11	Community Development Department, Redevelopment / Successor Agency, City Council	City General Fund; Redevelopment Agency Funds; City and Agency staff time involved	Assist in the development of new affordable owner and rental housing through development in MCAS – Tustin and infill areas. The City supports applications for the creation of new mixed-use developments particularly when the projects involve affordable housing.	Tustin Field I (includes units constructed during the previous planning period): 22 Very Low 22 Low 44 Moderate  Tustin Fields II (includes units constructed during the previous planning period): 11 Very Low 10 Low 19 Moderate  Columbus Square: 61 Very Low 101 Low 80 Moderate  Columbus Grove: 12 Very Low 30 Moderate	The City has entered into agreement with several developers at the Tustin Legacy for implementing the affordable housing component of the Specific Plan and has secured units for low income households.	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
1.2 Mobile Homes	Community	City General	As received	No applications	Continue to maintain	On-going program. This
Continue to maintain the City's mobile home park zone and process conditional use permit applications as received for manufactured homes.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.3	Development Department, City Council	Fund; processing fees (recoverable)		received	existing mobile home parks.  This program is critical in preserving the existing City housing stock. The City will continue this program to maintain the City's existing mobile home parks.	program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
1.3 Secondary Residential Units Continue to provide opportunities for affordable secondary residential dwelling units in the Single-family Residential District lots where feasible through existing Zoning Ordinance provisions.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.7, 1.13	Community Development Department, City Council	City processing fees (recoverable)	5 units	No unit processed	The Zoning Code allows second units to be developed within Single Family zoned properties without the need for any discretionary actions.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.  Process applications as received in a timely manner.
1.4 Deed Restrictions Require appropriate deed restrictions to ensure continued affordability for low- to moderate-income housing constructed or rehabilitated with the assistance of any	Community Development Department, Redevelopment /	1) Tax-Exempt Mortgage Revenue Bonds	All affordable housing creating during the planning period will be required to	2008: 6 units rehabilitated 2009: 7 units rehabilitated	Deed restrictions secured in 2012 ensures affordability for 55 years.  Created restricted units as	Continue. This program has been successful and the City will continue to require appropriate deed restrictions to ensure

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
public or Redevelopment Agency funds as may be legally required.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1	Successor Agency, City Council	2) Redevelopme nt Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds	record deed restriction to ensure continued affordability for a minimum of 45 years.	2010: 4 residential units rehabilitated 2010: 153 new units (Coventry Court Apartments) 2012: 262 new units (Legacy Villas and St. Anton)	follows: Tustin Field I – 78 units Tustin Field II – 40 units Arbor Walk – 10 units Cambridge Lane – 50 units Camden – 63 units Clarendon – 42 units Coventry Ct. – 153 units Legacy Villas – 37 units Anton Legacy – 225 units	continued affordability for low- to moderate-income households.
<b>1.5 Pre-application Conferences</b> Continue to utilize procedures for pre-application conferences and processing procedures to expedite permit processing.  Housing Element Policies: 1.11	Community Development Department	City General Fund; City processing fees (recoverable)	Continue			Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
1.6 Permit Processing for Low- to Moderate Income Housing Ensure that processing of permits for low- to moderate-income housing is fast-tracked with low- to moderate-income housing	Community Development	City General Fund; City processing fees (recoverable)	Continue		The City prioritized permits for Coventry Court senior affordable rental project by fast tracking the permitting and inspection process.	Continue. Consistent with State Law, the City will continue to prioritize affordable housing projects to ensure that permits are fast-tracked.

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
permits being given priority over other permit applications.  Housing Element Policies: 1.11						
1.7 Permit Coordination Continue the services of the City's Community Development Department as a central clearinghouse with individuals assigned the responsibility of expediting development permits required from various departments and agencies.  Housing Element Policies:.1.11	Community Development	City General Fund; City processing fees (recoverable)	Processing of approximately 10 new residential projects annually, 50 projects by 2014	2006: 754 new residential projects and 417 residential additions/alterations 2007:307 new residential projects and 643 residential additions/alterations 2008: 96 new residential projects and 978 residential additions/alterations. 2009: 44 new residential	Processed permits for new residential units and addition/alteration of existing residential properties. Total 2,292 new residential projects and 1,736 residential additions/alterations	The City's Community Development Department has demonstrated to be the appropriate department to act as the central clearinghouse. Each project received is assigned to a planner responsible for coordinating and expediting permit processing among various agencies and departments. The City will continue this program accordingly.

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
				projects and 551 residential additions/ alterations.  2010: 8 new residential projects and 148 residential additions/ alterations.  2011: 62 new residential projects and 431 residential additions/ alterations.  2012: Processed 95 new residential projects and 359 residential additions/ alterations/ alterations/ alterations/		
1.8 New Owner Housing using Tax	Redevelopment	Redevelopment	Assist 79 units by	14 units for Very Low Income		During the past planning

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
Increment Financing Provide housing set-aside tax increment funds generated from the Redevelopment Projects, where available, to assist in providing housing accommodations for lowand moderate-income households in rehabilitation or new construction projects.  Housing Element Policies: 1.6, 1.12, 3.2, 4.2	/ Successor Agency	Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds	2014	households 2 unit for Low Income households 4 unit for Moderate households assisted through housing rehabilitation program		period, the Redevelopment Agency provided assistance using the housing set-aside tax increment funds.  The program deleted in response to the passage of AB1X 26 and 27 in June 2012 and subsequent State Supreme Court actions in August 2012, eliminating the Redevelopment Agency.

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
1.9 Housing for the Disabled Require new multi-family housing units and apartment conversions to condominiums to comply with State specifications pursuant to SB 520 for accommodation of the disabled. The City will conduct analysis, add procedures, and/or undertake appropriate amendments to existing standards by complying with Chapter 11 of the California Building Code (requires portion of multi-unit dwellings to be accessible dwelling units) to ensure accommodation for the disabled. Housing Element Policies: 1.13, 1.15	Community Development Department	State and Federal programs; City's General Fund.	Refer individuals to agencies providing supportive housing that accommodates independent living. Add procedures and/or undertake appropriate amendments to existing standards to ensure compliance with SB 520.  Implement requirements of SB 520 on a continuous basis.			Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element
1.10 Transitional Housing Encourage the continuation of the Sheepfold homes and Laurel House in Tustin, which provide housing facilities for battered homeless women and children. These homes are located in single-family neighborhoods and provide a much-needed service for homeless women and children. In addition,	Various Non- Profit Organizations, Redevelopment / Successor Agency, Community Development	Variety of private funds; CDBG funds	Promote, assist, and facilitate the development of emergency and transients' shelters through continued support of the County Homeless		The City allocated the following amounts of CDBG funds to organizations that provide services to homeless individuals:  2008: \$15,000	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element

			Results			
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
explore additional program options to assist in the provision and funding for other programs such as transitional housing and single room occupancy housing.  Housing Element Policies: 1.15, 1.16	Department		Assistance Program  Support local agencies that provide homeless services by providing financial assistance of approximately \$5,000-\$10,000 annually.  Consider the adoption of a Single Room Occupancy Ordinance to facilitate the development of SRO units.		2009: \$15,000 2010; \$15,000 2011; \$19,213 2012; \$15,435	
<b>1.11 Temporary Housing for Homeless</b> The City will support countywide efforts to assist approved homeless providers as part of the MCAS Tustin Reuse effort.	County of Orange, Redevelopment Agency	CDBG funds, HUD SHP funds	emergency	<ul> <li>192 beds at the Village of Hope</li> <li>6 new units at Tustin Field I (Salvation</li> </ul>	Village of Hope emergency/transitional housing was completed in 2008. Total of 48 transitional	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
Housing Element Policies: 1.14, 1.15			Legacy (OC Rescue Mission).  The City plans to assist 200 individuals by means of integrating counseling, education, jobtraining and other techniques to stop the cycle of homelessness.  Provide 24 units of transitional housing for families (Salvation Army)  Provide 6 units of transitional housing for women and children	Army).  • Acquisition of 16 units in Buena Park (Salvation Army).  14 new units at Columbus Grove (Irvine Temporary Housing)  6 new units at Columbus Grove (Human Options)  6 new units at Columbus Grove (Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter).  14 new units at Columbus Grove (Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter).	homes were conveyed to Salvation Army, Human Options, Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter, and Irvine Temporary Housing at no cost before 2008.  City approved increase of beds from 60 to 90 beds for Orange County Social Services (Orangewood).  City provided CDBG funding support to non-profit organizations.	
			(Human Option-Dove	• 90 beds for Orange County		

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
			Housing)  • Provide 6 units- in long-term 12- 24 months- transitional housing for families with children (Orange Coast Interfaith Shelter  • Provide 14 units of transitional housing to families with children who are homeless due to a short or temporary financial hardship (Families Who Care, formerly Irvine Temporary Housing).)	Social Services (Orangewood)		

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
			Provide for a 60- unit expansion of Orangewood Transitional Housing for children (to be operated by the County of Orange.			
1.12 Implementation Program  The Redevelopment Agency will review Implementation Plan for each project area and Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy as required by Redevelopment Law and adjust as necessary.  Housing Element Policies: 1.12, 3.2	Redevelopment / Successor Agency	Redevelopment Fund	Review within legal time frames	Midreview of the Town Center and South Central Redevelopment Project areas Third Five-Year Implementation Plan (FY 2005-06 to FY 2009-10) was completed in June 2008.  Five-Year review of the Town Center & South Central Redevelopment Project areas	As a result of the passage of AB1X 26 and 27 and the State Supreme Court's ruling in December 2011, the Successor Agency to the Redevelopment Agency began the dissolution of the program. With the dissolution of the Redevelopment Agency, the City will experience adverse effects on implementing programs due to a lack of funding.  On March 15, 2011, the City Council established a Housing Authority to	

		Results					
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete	
Program	Agency	Source	Objective	Implementation Plan (FY 2005-06 to 2009-10) was completed in 2010.  The Second Five- Year Implementation Plan (FY 2008-09 through FY 2012- 13) for the MCAS Tustin Redevelopment project area was adopted by the City Council and Redevelopment Agency on August 15, 2008.  The City adopted a Comprehensive Housing	assist the City in increasing, improving and preserving its supply of affordable housing. On August 1, 2012, the Successor Agency to the Tustin Community Redevelopment Agency transferred the former Agency's housing assets to the Housing Authority. As a result of increased foreclosure activity, the City Council approved an Affordable Housing Default Revolving Fund in order to cure homeowner defaults under the City and Agency's Affordable Housing Program. The Fund ensures the City has the opportunity to exercise its option rights to purchase the home prior to		
				Affordability Strategy in conjunction with the housing	the home being sold in a Trustee's Sale and the City losing affordable housing supply. The State of		

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
				element in June 2008.	California department of Finance denied the transfer of redevelopment funds to the Default Revolving Fund and the Fund was dissolved. The loss of a funding source will make it difficult to purchase homes prior to foreclosure, resulting in a reduction in the City's affordable housing supply.	
1.13 Housing Opportunities for all Economic Segments  Monitor the implementation of the affordable housing program adopted as a part of the East Tustin Specific Plan.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.8, 1.9, 1.10	Private Developers in East Tustin, Community Development Department	City General Fund; Staff time	Monitor 174 affordable units in East Tustin	174 units in East Tustin monitored	The City initiated contact with the Irvine Company. The dissolution of Redevelopment eliminated a major funding source available to preserve these units at risk of their affordability expiring. The Irvine Company has notified the City that the affordability will expired on November 15, 2013.	The City will continue to monitor existing affordable units in East Tustin during the 2013-2021 planning period until affordability expires.
<b>1.14 Bonding Programs</b> Issue Redevelopment tax-exempt bonds, as necessary, to accomplish Five-Year	Redevelopment / Successor Agency	State and Municipal Bonds; Private	Complete analysis of available programs on as		On Mar 2, 2010, \$26,170,000 in Tax Allocation Housing Bonds,	Modify. Program will utilize housing revenue Bond financing resources

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
Quantified Objectives with such issuance conditioned on having projects ready to move forward. Also utilize other housing revenue bond financing resources and Low Income Housing Tax Credits on new construction and acquisition/rehabilitation projects that help meet the City's affordable housing needs.  Housing Element Policies: 1.12, 3.3		Activity Mortgage Bonds Revenue issued by California Statewide Communities Development Authority and others; California Low- Income Housing Tax Credits; variety of other sources	needed basis.		Series 2010 were issued by the Redevelopment Agency to finance low- and moderate-income housing activities throughout the City, and in particular, to support housing activities in the Town Center, South Central, and MCAS Tustin Project Areas and existing debt obligations for housing affordability projects. No tax-exempt bond was issued 2012.	and Low Income Housing Tax Credits on new construction and acquisition/rehabilitation projects that help meet the City's affordable housing needs.
1.15 Economic Integration within Sphere of Influence Request that the Orange County Planning Commission and the Environmental Management Agency (EMA) notice the City of Tustin of any proposed development activities within Tustin's sphere of influence.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.4, 1.5	County of Orange	City General Fund; Staff time	Ongoing request to both agencies.			Continue. This is an ongoing effort to ensure coordination between the County and the City within the Tustin's sphere of influence.
<b>1.16 Senior Citizen Housing</b> Continue to identify sites that are suitable for	Redevelopment / Successor Agency;	Redevelopment Agency Housing Set-	Preservation of 100 at-risk units at Tustin Gardens.	100 units (Tustin Gardens)	Maintaining contact with Tustin Gardens, Coventry Court and monitoring	Continue. The City will monitor projects on an ongoing basis.

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
senior citizens housing projects. These sites will be promoted for private development and applications will be made for any available subsidy funds.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.13, 1.15	Community Development Department	Aside Funds; HELP; Low- Income Housing Tax Credits; Private Activity Bonds issued by California Statewide and others		240 units (Coventry Court)	affordability.	
1.17 Senior Services Program Continue a comprehensive transportation program, case management, information and referral, and shared housing program.  Housing Element Policies: 1.15, 2.3	Parks and Recreation Department	City General Funds	Assist 850 elderly annually	2006: 824 persons assisted  2007: 400 persons assisted  2008: 328 persons assisted  2009: 449 persons assisted  2010: 483 persons assisted  2011: 370 persons assisted	Assisted approximately 400 elderly annually by providing meals and opportunities for social interaction.	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
1.18 Recycling Single-Family Uses in R-3 Zones Into Multiple-Family Units Continue to encourage developers to consolidate individual lots into larger cohesive developments. Density bonuses may be considered as an incentive to consolidate lots.  Housing Element Policies: 1.11	Community Development Department	City General Fund and Redevelopment Agency Funds; Staff time	Respond to all requests for density bonus per City codes.		Continue support of application as received.	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
1.19 Ongoing Review of Housing Element Programs From the date of adoption of the Housing element, prepare an annual report to the Planning Commission assessing previous years' accomplishments toward meeting Housing Element objectives. Submit the Annual Report to the State HCD.  Housing Element Policies: all policies	Community Development Department	City General Fund; Staff time	On-going. Prepare Annual Report to the Planning Commission and the City Council annually.		The City submitted annual reports to HCD on or before the April 1st deadline.	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
1.20 Consolidated Plan The City of Tustin shall prepare an update of the Consolidated Plan that provides a comprehensive assessment of housing needs, a housing development plan incorporating Federal, State and local public and private resources, and a one-year implementation	Community Development Department	Variety of local, State, and Federal funding; City General Fund and Redevelopment	Prepare Consolidated Plan in 2010. Prepare Action Plan annually		Prepared Consolidated Plan for FY 2010-2015. Action Plans prepared annually. City Council adopted the 2010-2015 Consolidated Plan and subsequent Action Plans.	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
plan.  Housing Element Policies: 1.15, 1.16, 1.18, 2.1, 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4, 5.1, 5.2, 5.3, 5.4, 5.5		Agency Funds Staff time				
1.21 Zoning Studies  To facilitate the new construction goals of the 2007 Regional Housing Needs Assessment, the City intends to undertake zoning studies to consider new programs to encourage and promote affordable housing and recommend appropriate amendments for actions by the Planning Commission and the City Council. These studies include:  (1) Creation of zoning provisions which will accommodate mixed uses in portions of the City, particularly in the Old Town Commercial Area;  (2) Examine potential increases in residential density as part of the "Town Center - A New Beginning" implementation study as it specifically impacts the Center City Study Area (a portion of which is within the Town Center and South Central Redevelopment Project areas), the Southern Gateway Study Area (a large portion of which is	Community Development Department, Redevelopment / Successor Agency	City General Fund, Redevelopment Agency funds	Initiate Zoning Studies and complete any proposed amendments.  Adopt Reasonable Accommodation Ordinance	Density Bonus Ordinance adopted in 1999	In 2008, the City completed the Market Analysis and conducted community meetings to gather input for the opportunity sites (Town Center A New Beginning). In the fall of 2010, the "Neighborhoods of Tustin Town Center: A Strategic Guide for Development's" Study was completed.  In response to the "Neighborhoods of Tustin Town Center: A Strategic Guide for Development's" recommendations, a RFP was released seeking proposals from Environmental consulting firms for the preparation of	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
within the South Central Project Area), and the West Village Area generally located west of the SR-55 Freeway between McFadden Avenue and Main Street to assist the City in accommodating its housing needs; (3) Provide relaxation of certain development standards and incentives for projects which include affordable housing units upon City Council's approval; (4) Provide a process for individuals with disabilities to make requests for reasonable accommodation to relief from various land use, zoning, or other building rules, policies, and/or procedures of the City.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.11					a Program EIR that supports proposed General Plan amendments, amendments to the Tustin City Code, a proposed Overlay District Zoning, and other zoning modifications. As a result of the passage of AB1X 26 and 27 and the State Supreme Court's ruling on both bills, Redevelopment funding was no longer available to support this activity and the project is on hold. Staff are reviewing other options and funding sources to initiate the recommendations brought forth in the Strategic Guide. RFPs for an Engineering Feasibility Study Report that would consider the feasibility of the Guide's recommendations for Red Hill Avenue and McFadden Avenue were released in 2011. This study was funded by CDBG and the	

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
					work was completed in 2012. Staff is reviewing the alternatives presented and researching possible construction funding sources.  In 2011, the City Council adopted Reasonable Accommodation Ordinance to ensure equal access to housing and to facilitate the development of housing for individuals with disabilities in accordance with the federal Fair Housing Amendments Act, California's Fair Employment and Housing Act, and to implement the	
					State's required program identified in the City's Housing Element.	
<b>1.22 Private Streets</b> The City of Tustin has adopted standards for private streets in new residential	City of Tustin	None necessary	Continue		Private street standards were implemented in the following residential	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
developments. To reduce construction costs, developers may be permitted to install private rather than public streets, wherever feasible.					developments: Columbus Grove & Square, Tustin Fields I & II.	element.
Housing Element Policies: 1.17						
1.23 Building Codes The State of California has determined that the over-riding value is the protection of the health and safety of residential occupants. Continue to adopt the Uniform Building Code pursuant to the state directives and where local amendments are proposed to reflect local climatic, geologic or topographic conditions, and minimize, wherever possible, impacts on provision of housing.  Housing Element Policies: 5.4	City of Tustin, Community Development Department	City General Fund; Staff time	On-going		2010 California Building Codes adopted	On-going program. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
1.24 Site Improvements  The requirement for the developer to construct site improvements often result in passing these costs on the housing consumer. These costs are reflected in the cost of housing that eliminates an even greater proportion of the population from financially qualifying for the purchase of housing. The financing of public improvements by a	Community Development Department, Redevelopment Agency	Developer funded	Evaluate the use of special assessment district funding at the MCAS-Tustin and its use in other developing areas.		Created assessment districts at Tustin Legacy.  Bonds were issued for a Community Facilities District Annexation Area at Tustin Legacy in the fall of 2010.	The City will continue this program in the 2013-2021 housing element.

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
special assessment district or community facility district on a per parcel benefit basis may enable a greater proportion of the market to qualify for housing. Assessment district financing has been implemented in the East Tustin area and is being used to pay for public improvements. The City will assess opportunities to utilize these public improvement financing techniques in newly developing areas such as MCAS Tustin and determine whether they are financially feasible. In creating any new assessment districts, an evaluation should be completed of the developer's activity to advance pay off bonds at the close of escrow.						
Housing Element Policies: 1.11						

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
1.25 Fees, Exactions, and Permit Procedures  Consider waiving or modifying various fees or exactions normally required where such waiver will reduce the affordability gap associated with providing housing of the elderly and for very-low and low-income households.  Housing Element Policies: 1.11	Community Development Department, Redevelopment Agency	City General Fund; Redevelopment Agency Set- Aside Housing	On-going. Defer development impact fees during the economic downturn.	Construction/Bus iness License. Fee Waiver: 500 plan check/permit fees 5,350 renewed Business License. 1,045 new Business License.	The City Council adopted a policy in 2008 to temporarily defer the payment of specific development impact fees to prior final inspection or issuance of Certificate of Occupancy.  On July 19, 2011, The City Council approved a policy for construction and business license fees waivers. The policy applied to new and renewal business licenses and building plan check and permit fees for new improvements and additions to existing developments. A total of \$400,000 in building permit fee waivers and \$350,000 business license fee waivers were authorized and issued.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
1.26 Environmental Constraints	Community	General Fund;	On-going	6 Negative	Negative Declarations	Continue. This program

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
Continue to alleviate the necessity of delays in processing, and mitigating requirements incorporated into the development plans by requiring program environmental impact reports (EIR) on all major development projects whenever possible.  Housing Element Policies: 1.11	Development Department, Redevelopment Agency	Private developer cost recoverable		Declarations adopted	were issued in relation to projects determined to be within the scope of the completed Final Program EIS/EIR for MCAS Tustin and/or are code amendments and do not have a negative impact on the environment.	will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
Promote Density Bonus Program Promote Density Bonuses to facilitate the construction of affordable housing. Under State law, applicants may file for density bonuses when projects incorporate units for very low, low, moderate-income units or senior citizens.  Housing Element Policies: 1.11	Community Development Department	General Fund, Redevelopment Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds	Process all requests for density bonuses. Update Density Bonus Ordinance in compliance with AB 2280 (Saldana and Cabalero).		The City amended Tustin City Code Article 9, Chapter 1, governing incentives for the development of affordable housing to comply with the California Government Code Section 65915. The City staff also initiated recent amendment to the density bonus ordinance to bring the code up to date and make the ordinance consistent with more recent amendments to the statute. The amendment was completed in 2010.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

		Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
					In November 2012, The City granted Density Bonuses to two new apartment developments: Legacy Villas (157 bonus units) and Anton Legacy Apartments (33 bonus units). Legacy Villas is a 533-unit complex with 37 moderate income units. Anton Legacy Apartments is a 100% affordable development with 225 rental units: 88 very low income; 73 low income; and 64 moderate income.	
<ul><li>1.28. MCAS-Tustin Redevelopment Project Area.</li><li>Implementation of redevelopment project area for MCAS-Tustin site.</li><li>Housing Element Policies: 1.2; 1.6; 1.8</li></ul>	Tustin Community Redevelopment / Successor Agency	Redevelopment Agency funds	Process entitlements for MCAS Tustin.		Since the City has adopted the MCAS Tustin Project Area, the program has been modified to facilitate the implementation of the Specific Plan and Redevelopment Project Area.	Delete. This Project Area has been eliminated in response to the passage of AB1X 26 and 27 in June 2012 and subsequent State Supreme Court actions in August 2012, eliminating the Redevelopment Agency.
<b>1.29. Granny Flats</b> Support the development of granny flats on	Community Development	General Fund	Support applications as	2011: 1 granny flat/ guest		Continue. This program will be included in the

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
single family zoned lots.  Housing Element Policies: 1.1, 1.11, 1.14,	Department		received. Five (5) granny flats are anticipated.	quarter was completed in 2011		2013-2021 housing element
Goal 2: Equal Housing Opportunity						
2.1 Fair Housing The City shall continue to provide housing counseling services to assure equal housing opportunities within the City. The City allocates approximately \$15,000 annually for handling tenant/landlord disputes, housing discrimination cases, counseling, tenant rights, fair housing education, and education within the City. The City will continue to promote the fair housing educational resources offered by adding the services on the City's webpage, Code Enforcement brochure, and the Community Development directory.  Housing Element Policies: 2.1, 2.2, 2.4	Community Development Department, City's Contractor	CDBG funds	Assist approximately 400 Tustin residents annually, 3,000 residents by 2014.	2006: 215 inquiries/ complaints processed  2007: 227 inquiries/ complaints processed  2008: 248 inquiries/ complaints processed  2009: 242 inquiries/ complaints processed  2010: 150 inquiries/	1,033 inquiries/complaints processed	Continue. The City's Fair Housing services contractor works with the City to provide the community with workshops, trainings, walk-in clinics, and counseling to assist Tustin residents.

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
2.2 Shared-Housing	TLC, Parks and	CDBG funds	Continue	complaints processed; 246 workshop attendants  2011: 169 inquiries/ complaints processed; 191 workshop attendants	On-going.	Continue. This program
Continue to provide coordination and support to a home sharing program funded in part by Community SeniorServ, formerly known as Feedback Foundation, Inc., as part of TLC (Transportation Lunch and Counseling) and the Orange County Housing Authority.  Housing Element Policies: 2.3	Recreation Services Department, and Community Development Department	CS 2G Tullido	Commune		The city continues to provide coordination and support to a home sharing program funded in part by Community SeniorServ, Inc. as part of the TLC (Transportation Lunch and Counseling) and the Orange County Housing Authority.	will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
<b>2.3 Housing Referral Program</b> Continue to provide housing referral services to families in need of housing assistance and information. This program consists of three	Police Department; Parks and Recreation	City General Fund, CDBG Funds	• 7,500 referrals to social agencies by 2014		On-going; to assist referrals, the Housing Section of the City's website has been updated	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
<ul> <li>City departments disseminating information to the public at all times.</li> <li>The Police Department refers homeless people to different agencies that provide shelters and food for various segments of the population.</li> <li>The Parks and Recreation Services Department provides housing information and social service information to the senior citizen population.</li> <li>The Community Development Department and Redevelopment Agency provide housing and social service information to all segments of the population during regular city hall business hours. The Community Development Department also serves as a clearinghouse for the Community</li> </ul>	Department; Community Development; Redevelopment / Successor Agency		• 50 referrals for shared housing by 2014		to include affordable rental opportunities and senior housing resources.	
Development Block Grant Program and represents the City at Housing Authority and OCHA Advisory Committee Meetings.						
City departments utilize the following documents and also make these documents						

				Results		
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
available to the public:						
Directory of Senior Citizen's Services prepared by the Area Agency on Aging Senior Citizen's Office						
Social Service Assistance Booklet prepared by Connection Plus						
Orange County Housing Directory prepared by OCHA and the OCHA Advisory Committee.						
Housing Element Policies: 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, 2.5						
Ongoing Review of Housing Element Programs	See Program 1.19					
Consolidated Plan	See Program 1.20					
Goal 3: Ownership Housing						
<b>3.1 Condominium Conversions</b> Continue to require developers converting apartments to condominiums to process a conditional use-permit, provide relocation assistance, and/or to provide incentives and	Community Development Department, City Council, Redevelopment	City General Fund, Redevelopment Agency Housing Set-	Impose requirements where applicable.		No units converted	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
assistance for purchase of the units by low- to moderate-income households.	/ Successor Agency	Aside Funds				
Housing Element Policies: 3.1, 3.2, 3.3						
3.2 State Home-Ownership Assistance The City's Redevelopment Agency provides a First Time Homebuyers program utilizing housing set-aside funds. The Redevelopment Agency also applies for and will explore the use of other funding opportunities such as HELP, HOME funds, and other State and Federal programs.  Housing Element Policies: 3.1, 3.3	Redevelopment / Successor Agency	Redevelopment Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds; State and Federal sources	Assist 30 First time homebuyers by 2014		No assistance provided	Modify. The Housing Authority will explore the use of other funding opportunities such as HELP, HOME funds, and other State and Federal programs.
<b>Bonding Programs</b>	See Program 1.14					
Ongoing Review of Housing Element Programs	See Program 1.19					
Consolidated Plan	See Program 1.20					
New Owner Housing using Tax Increment Financing	Redevelopment / Successor					Delete.

				Results		
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
Goal 4: Affordable Housing Preservatio	n					
4.1 Replacement Housing Ensure rehabilitation or construction of an equal number of replacement units when low and moderate income residential units are destroyed or removed from the market as part of a specific redevelopment project pursuant to California Community Redevelopment law.  Housing Element Policies: 2.5	Redevelopment / Successor Agency	Redevelopment Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds; Private developers	The Redevelopment Agency continues to monitor housing units demolished within the redevelopment project areas. Currently, the City has exceeded its replacement housing obligations within the Town Center and South Central redevelopment project areas and has a surplus of 446 units.		In accordance with California Community Redevelopment Law, the Agency currently has a surplus of replacement units. The Agency did not demolish any housing units during the planning period.	Delete. The program is deleted in response to the passage of AB 26 and 27 in June 2012 and subsequent State Supreme Court actions in August 2012, eliminating the Redevelopment Agency.
<b>4.2 Housing Rehabilitation</b> <sup>1</sup> Allocate available Redevelopment Agency funds to finance public improvements and rehabilitation of residential units in target areas.	Redevelopment / Successor Agency	CDBG and Redevelopment Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds	The City plans to Rehabilitate 162 units by 2014.	20 units total	2006: 2 units 2007: 1 unit 2008: 6 units	Delete. The program is deleted in response to the passage of AB1X 26 and 27 in June 2012 and subsequent State Supreme

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
Housing Element Policies: 1.2, 5.1, 5.2					2009: 7 Units 2010: 4 units	Court actions in August 2012, eliminating the Redevelopment Agency.
4.3 Housing Authority Contract with the Orange County Housing Authority, where necessary, for the development and operation of federally assisted low- and moderate-income housing programs.  Housing Element Policies: 1.5, 1.16, 1.17	Orange County Housing Authority, Redevelopment / Successor Agency	HUD, CDBG, Redevelopment Agency Housing Set- Aside Funds	Continue			Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
4.4 Rental Assistance Encourage the availability of Section 8 rental assistance certificates and voucher certificate program assistance funds through the Orange County Housing Authority by participating in the application process i.e. advertise, promote on website, at library, senior center etc. when applications are available; offering City Hall as the application and information center for Section 8 vouchers, engaging and participating with the County's housing advisory committee to ensure priorities are given to Tustin residents, and promote Section 8 program to apartment owners to	County of Orange Housing Authority	HUD	Issue 200 certificates/vouchers annually-1,200 by 2014.	2006: 347 vouchers issued 2007: 336 vouchers issued 2008: 322 vouchers issued 2009: 332 vouchers issued 2010: 326 vouchers issued	The OC Housing Authority issued over 300 vouchers annually.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
expand Section 8 housing inventory within the City of Tustin. To encourage the maintenance of existing and establishment of new certificates, support the County's efforts to obtain continued Federal funding.  Housing Element Policies: 4.1, 4.2				2011:349 vouchers issued 2012: 375 vouchers issued		
4.5 Affordable Senior Housing Project and Senior Board and Care Facility To maintain 74 units of affordable housing for Seniors located at 17432-17442 Mitchell Avenue (20 units) and 54 units of affordable senior apartments at 1311 Sycamore Avenue (Heritage Place).  Housing Element Policies: 5.1, 5.2, 5.3, 5.4	Community Development Department	None necessary	Maintain 74 units of affordable Senior Housing.	74 units		Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.
4.6 Preservation of Assisted Housing Tustin has four low-income housing projects with a total of 277 units "at risk" of conversion to market rate during the planning period. If project owners choose to convert the projects to market rate housing, coordinate the provision of financial and administrative resources to preserve these units as affordable housing.	Community Development Department, Redevelopment / Successor Agency	CDBG      Redevelopm ent Housing Set-Aside Funds, State and Federal Funds      Low Income	Pursuant to Government Code Section 65583.1(c), preserve at minimum 230 of 277 units currently identified as "at- risk" (100 units at Tustin Gardens; 60 units at Rancho Alisal; 54 units at		Annual Monitoring: The Agency annually mails letters to homeowners requesting documentation verifying continuing compliance with the affordability covenants they entered into with the City when they purchased their	Modify. The City will encourage owners to maintain affordable units and monitor the remaining affordable units.  Financial assistance aspect of this program is cancelled in response to the passage of AB1X 26 and 27 in June 2012 and

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

					Results	
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete
a) Monitor Units at Risk: Maintain contact with owners of at risk units as potential conversion dates approach to determine whether Section 8 contracts or affordability covenants have been renewed or are planned to be renewed. Discuss with the owner of the "at risk" projects the City's desire to preserve the units as affordable.		Tax Credits, Private Activity Mortgage Revenue Bonds  • Variety of other sources	Rancho Maderas; and 16 units at Rancho Tierra) for the time frames required by applicable Government Code Section 65583.1.(c)(2)(C)(i) or Health and		Affordable unit.  Affordable Units at risk of Foreclosure: The Agency prepared monthly foreclosure reports to all City operating departments in order to monitor and keep City sensitive to the	subsequent State Supreme Court actions in August 2012, eliminating the Redevelopment Agency.
b) Rent Subsidy: Provide a Rent Subsidy program for at-risk units at Irvine Company Apartments: Rancho Alisal; Rancho Maderas; and Rancho Tierra, preserving, at minimum, 130 units.			Safety Code section.		implications on property conditions and blight as a result of the foreclosure activity associated with the more recent economic downturn in the	
c) Nonprofits: Work with a nonprofit affordable housing developer to apply for 4% Tax Credit/Bond Financing for the acquisition and rehabilitation of Tustin Gardens, preserving 100 at-risk units.					residential and commercial markets.  On March 15, 2011, the City Council established a Housing Authority to assist the City in	
d) Rent buy-down: Rent buy-down program for at-risk units at Irvine Company Apartments; Rancho Alisal; Rancho Maderas; and Rancho Tierra, preserving, at minimum, 130 units.					increasing, improving and preserving its supply of affordable housing.  As a result of increased foreclosure activity, the	

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

			Results					
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete		
<ul> <li>e) Tenant Education. Work with tenants of at risk units in danger of converting. Provide tenants with information regarding potential tenant purchase of buildings including written information and any related workshops. Act as a liaison between tenants and nonprofits potentially involved in constructing or acquiring replacement housing. If existing staff is not able to provide adequate staffing for this program, provide outside consultants to support the program.</li> <li>f) Reserve Fund. Earmark development housing set-aside funds to assist priority purchasers with the down -payment and closing costs associated with purchasing projects at risk. Continue to monitor other potential funding sources, such as State grants and HUD funds.</li> <li>Housing Element Policies: 4.1, 4.2, 4.3, 4.4</li> </ul>					City Council approved an Affordable Housing Default Revolving Fund in order to cure homeowner defaults under the City and Agency's Affordable Housing Program. The Fund ensures the City has the opportunity to exercise its option rights to purchase the home prior to the home being sold in a Trustee's Sale and the City losing affordable housing supply. The State of California Department of Finance denied the transfer of redevelopment funds to the Default Revolving Fund and the Fund was dissolved. The loss of a funding source will make it difficult to purchase homes prior to foreclosure, resulting in a reduction in the City's affordable housing supply.			

		Results						
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete		
					The dissolution of Redevelopment eliminated a major funding source available to preserve units at risk of their affordability expiring. Staff is exploring other funding options.			
4.7 Temporary Housing Assistance for Extremely Low Income Households Assist in the provision of temporary and emergency housing assistance to prevent homelessness for the extremely low income households as well as coordination with regional, state and federal assistance programs for assisting these households in the percentage of their incomes that are applied to rent (i.e. increase in allocation of Section 8 existing rental certificates, its).  Housing Element Policies: 1.4, 1.5, 1.6, 1.14	Redevelopment Agency and Community Development Department		Promote, assist, and facilitate programs to prevent extremely low income households to become homeless by providing links and program information on City's website.		In accordance with AB 987, the Agency maintains a list on the City's website of all affordable ownership units and affordable rental units in the City of Tustin. In addition, links to other affordable housing sites were also provided on the website.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element		
Mobile Homes	See Program 1.2							
Deed Restrictions:	See Program 1.4							
Tax Increment Financing	See Program 1.8					Delete.		

	Results					
Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete	
See Program 1.10						
See Program 1.19						
See Program 1.20						
	See Program 1.10 See Program 1.19 See Program	Agency Source  See Program 1.10  See Program 1.19  See Program	Agency Source Objective  See Program 1.10  See Program 1.19  See Program	Agency Source Objective Units  See Program 1.10  See Program 1.19  See Program	Responsible Agency     Funding Source     Objective     Units     Effectiveness       See Program 1.10     See Program 1.19       See Program 1.19     See Program 1.19	

Goal 5: Neighborhood Conservation

				Results				
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete		
5.1 Enforcement of Building and Housing Codes Continue to enforce building and housing codes to ensure health and safety, rectify Code violations and thereby improve the overall character of the community. Enforcement will include identifying substandard housing units and those that are otherwise identified as a threat to the health and safety of occupants. Actions will be taken pursuant to the law to demolish, rebuild, or correct the code violations. This program includes notification of taxing agencies upon failure to gain code compliance from the property owner to allow City to recover enforcement cost.  Housing Element Policies: 5.3, 5.4	Community Development Department	City General Fund and CDBG	Investigate 150 substandard housing cases annually and 900 cases by 2014.	2006: 406 code enforcement cases 2007: 500 code enforcement cases 2008: 715 code enforcement cases 2009: 403 code enforcement cases 2010: 457 code enforcement cases 2011: 422 code enforcement cases 2012: 249 code enforcement cases	Code enforcement cases total 3,152  Code enforcement cases dropped in 2009 due to loss of code enforcement staff.  Code enforcement cases dropped in 2012 due to the use of tear-away notices for minor property maintenance, trash can replacement, and business license issues.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.		
5.2 Cultural Resources District There are a large number of structures in the City that were constructed before and after the turn of the century. Continue to utilize the City's Cultural Resources Overlay District to safeguard the heritage of the City by preserving neighborhoods and structures	Community Development Department	CDBG, City General Fund, State grants	Rate historic structures where applicable and process certificates of appropriateness as received.	2006: 19 Certificates issued 2007:19 Certificates issued 2008: 23	A total of 89 Certificates of Appropriateness were issued for improvements to the properties located within the Cultural Resources District.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.		

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

		Results					
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete	
that reflect the City's heritage and past. Through the District, promote the public and private enjoyment, use and preservation of culturally significant neighborhoods and structures. Continue to require that any alteration of a designated resource or construction improvements in the District conform to the requirements of the Cultural Resources Overlay District. Owners of historic landmarks or properties within the District are required to obtain a certificate of appropriateness before beginning any type of exterior construction, alteration, or demolition. A certificate of appropriateness certifies that the proposed changes are consistent with the design guidelines and are appropriate within the district context.				Certificates issued 2009: 17 Certificates issued 2010: 23 Certificates issued 2011: 15 Certificates issued 2012: 11 Certificates issued			
Ongoing Review of Housing Element Programs	See Program 1.19						
Consolidated Plan	See Program 1.20						
<b>Building Codes</b>	See Program 1.23						

		Results					
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete	
Goal 6: Environmental Sensitivity							
6.1 Energy Conservation Require all new construction to be subject to State energy conservation requirements (Title 24) as a condition for the issuance of a building permit.  Housing Element Policies: 6.2	Community Development Department	None necessary	Require all new units within planning period.	2006: 754 units 2007: 307 units 2008: 415 units 2009: 296 units 2010: 61 units 2011: 92 units 2012: 367 units	2,292 new units required to meet state standards during 2006-2012.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.	
6.2 Energy Rebate Program Partner with Utility Companies to promote energy rebate programs. No fee or discounted permits for energy efficient projects over and above the Title 24 requirements may be explored. Examples include installation of photovoltaic systems, tank-less water heater, natural gas recharge connection, electric vehicle recharge connection, wind power generator, etc.  Housing Element Policies: 6.6	Community Development Department		Seek available grants to partner with utility companies to promote energy rebate programs.	2011: 28 homeowners and 2 nonresidential projects applied and \$16,707 were rebated.  2012: 148 homeowners and 22 non-residential projects applied and of \$44,293 were rebated.	The City obtained approval of funds for reimbursement of permit and plan check fees of improvements that meet the energy savings standards. The funding amounts were as follows: 2011: \$70,000	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element	

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

			Results					
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete		
6.3 Solar Energy and Conservation Require that environmental analysis and subdivision plans address energy conservation measures and solar access. With the passage of AB 32, the City in anticipation with the State mandates will set thresholds within its CEQA checklist and require developers.  Housing Element Policies: 6.2, 6.3	Community Development Department			2011: 6 permits for photovoltaic systems issued 2012: 40 permits for photovoltaic systems issued	CEQA checklist has been updated to include greenhouse gas emissions.  Supported photovoltaic systems installation in residential and commercial buildings.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.		
6.4 Building Orientation Promote energy efficiency by orienting homes to maximize natural day lighting. The City will work with potential developers during the conceptual review level (Design Review) by promoting building siting that maximizes natural day lighting.  Housing Element Policies: 6.2, 6.3	Community Development Department					Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.		
6.5 Water Efficiency Promote water-efficient landscapes, efficient irrigation, and use of permeable paving materials. Through educational materials and trainings, the city will promote water efficiency methods to its residents. Landscape beautification which results in	Community Development Department		Promote water efficient program by conducting workshops and providing education materials on the City Website,		In response to Assembly Bill 1881, the City in coordination with the League of Cities Orange county Division and the Orange County Water District prepared and adopted the Water	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.		

CITY OF TUSTIN
TECHNICAL MEMORANDUM

HOUSING ELEMENT OCTOBER 1, 2013

		Results					
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete	
water conservation could be encourage through planting of drought tolerant plants, installation of drip irrigation, installation of rain detector/sensor irrigation, etc. Incentives such as over-the-counter permit plan check, discounted fee, or waiver of permit fee could be considered.  Housing Element Policies: 6.4			public counter and at schools.  Adopt program by 2014.		Efficient Landscape Ordinance. The City's website also has been updated with information and guidelines to achieve water efficiency. The City adopted an ordinance addressing synthetic turf landscaping, including material, installation and maintenance, to promote reduced irrigation needs and quality landscaping.		
6.6 Green Building Streamline processing for approved green building. Housing Element Policies: 6.2, 6.3, 6.5	Community Development Department		Explore green building and sustainable building design to help conserve energy consumption. A fee waiver, discounted permit fees, or rebate may be considered in promoting Green Building Program.		No Green Building program adopted.	Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.  Continue to evaluate Green Building Program.	

				Results			
Program	Responsible Agency	Funding Source	Objective	Units	Effectiveness	Continue/Modify/Delete	
			Evaluate and adopt Green Building program by 2014.				
Ongoing Review of Housing Element Programs	See Program 1.19					Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.	
Consolidated Plan	See Program 1.20					Continue. This program will be included in the 2013-2021 housing element.	

# TABLE HTM- 36 PROGRESS TOWARDS OBJECTIVES 2006-2014 CITY OF TUSTIN

		CITY OF	TUSTIN				
Unit Type/Description	Quantified Objectives	Accomplishments <sup>1</sup>	Extremely Low	Very Low	Low	Moderate	Upper
NEW CONSTRUCTION	,		<u> </u>	<u> </u>		<u> </u>	11
MCAS Tustin Housing Units							
Neighborhood D	891						
Neighborhood G	1,214						
Units Constructed	1,176	2,102	282	80	127	189	1424
Units Approved/Under Construction	990						
Preservation	230						
Granny Flats	5						
New Owner Housing	79						
Second Unit	5						
Recycling of SFD to MFD in R-3 district	8						
Subtotal	4,598	2,102	282	80	127	189	1,424
RHNA	2,381	2,381	256	256	410	468	991
Difference	1,985	(279)	26	(176)	(283)	(279)	433
REHABILITATION							
Single and Multi-Family Rehab							
Single Family	54	12		8	2	2	
Multi-Family	108	16		6	8	2	
Multi-Family Rental Acquisition/Rehab/Conv ersion/Resale	31						
Total Rehabilitation	193	28		14	10	4	
PRESERVATION							
Tustin Gardens	100	100		100			
Rancho Alisal	72	72		8	64		
Rancho Maderas	54	54		6	48		
Rancho Tierra	51	51		38	13		
<b>Total Preservation</b>	277	277		152	125		
OTHER AFFORDABLE HOUSING							
1st Time Homebuyer and/or Foreclosure Negotiated Purchase	30						
Section 8 Rental Voucher Assistance	1,500	2,047		2,047			
Shared Housing Referrals	75						
Homeless Housing	242						
·				· ·			

#### TABLE HTM- 36 PROGRESS TOWARDS OBJECTIVES 2006-2014 CITY OF TUSTIN

Unit Type/Description	Quantified Objectives	Accomplishments 1	Extremely Low	Very Low	Low	Moderate	Upper
Partnership Program							
Emergency Shelter	282	282	282				
<b>Total Other Programs</b>	2,129	2,634	282	2,213	135	4	

Number of Units.

Sources: (1) Effectiveness of Housing Programs 2006-2014, City of Tustin; (2) Five Year Implementation Plan for the Town Center and South Central Redevelopment Project Areas for Fiscal Years 2005-2006 to 2009-2010

# APPENDIX A AFFORDABILITY GAP ANALYSIS

# City of Tustin Affordability Gap and Leveraged Financing Analysis

# 1.0 Executive Summary

The City of Tustin retained David Paul Rosen & Associates (DRA) to prepare an affordability gap analysis and evaluation of leveraged financing options for new residential development in Tustin. The "affordability gap" methodology determines the difference between the supportable mortgage on the unit at affordable rents and sales prices and the actual development cost of the unit. The gap analysis provides planning-level estimates of the typical per unit subsidized required to make different types of housing affordable to households at alternative income levels.

The per unit affordability gaps calculated in this report are based on housing prototypes that are 100% affordable to households at each of the income levels modeled (or in the case of the leveraged financing analysis, at the mix of income levels necessary to meet the requirements and/or competitive standards of the leveraged financing programs). However, the results can be used in estimating subsidy requirements for mixed income housing developments as well. Under the assumption that the market rate units are financially feasible without subsidy, the subsidy requirement for a mixed income development can be estimated by multiplying the number of affordable units by the appropriate per unit affordability gap. The results of the gap analysis provide a useful tool to the City of Tustin and Tustin Redevelopment Agency for capital planning purposes. DRA recommends that the subsidy provided to any individual housing development be determined based on analysis of the specific economic conditions pertaining to that project.

The first step in the gap analysis establishes the amount a tenant or homebuyer can afford to contribute to the cost of renting or owning a dwelling unit based on established State and Federal standards. Income levels, housing costs and rents used in the analysis are defined below using 2007 published data for Tustin.

The second step estimates the costs of new housing construction in Tustin. For this purpose, DRA, in collaboration with City staff, formulated five prototypical housing developments (one rental development and four owner developments) suitable for the Tustin market today. DRA estimated the cost to develop these housing prototypes in Tustin under current housing conditions using information on actual recent housing developments provided by Tustin and Orange County area developers.

The third step in the gap analysis establishes the housing expenses borne by the tenants and owners. These costs can be categorized into operating costs, and financing or mortgage obligations. Operating costs are the maintenance expenses of the unit, including utilities, property maintenance and/or Homeownership Association (HOA) fees, property taxes, management fees, property insurance, replacement reserves, and insurance. For the rental prototype examined in this analysis, DRA assumes that the

landlord pays all but certain tenant-paid utilities as an annual operating cost of the unit paid from rental income. For owner prototypes, DRA assumes the homebuyer pays all operating and maintenance costs for the home.

Financing or mortgage obligations are the costs associated with the purchase or development of the housing unit itself. These costs occur when all or a portion of the development cost is financed. This cost is always an obligation of the landlord or owner. Supportable financing is deducted from the total development cost, less any owner equity or downpayment, to determine the gap between the supportable mortgage on the affordable units and the cost of developing those units.

For the rental housing prototype, the gap analysis calculates the difference between total development costs and the conventional mortgage supportable by net operating income from restricted rents. For owners, the gap is the difference between development costs and the supportable mortgage plus the buyer's down payment. Affordable housing costs for renters and owners are calculated based on California Redevelopment Law definitions and occupancy standards. Household income is adjusted based on an occupancy standard of one person per bedroom plus one.

The gaps for the owner prototypes are summarized in Table 1. The gaps have been calculated for the following three income levels:

		Income Limit	Affordable Housing Cost
1.	Very Low Income	50% of Area Median Income (AMI), adjusted for household size	30% of 50% AMI
	Low Income  Moderate Income	80% of AMI, adjusted for household size 120% of AMI, adjusted for household size	30% of 70% AMI 35% of 110% AMI

Depending upon the source of subsidy for ownership housing, the gaps may vary. For example, Federal HOME funds do not require deduction of a utility allowance in the calculation of affordable mortgage payment. However, under California Redevelopment Law, owner affordable housing expense is defined to include monthly utility costs. This increases the ownership gaps. The affordability gaps shown in Table 1 include utility allowance deductions.

The gaps for the rental prototype, without non-local leveraged financing, are summarized in Table 2. The gaps have been calculated for the following three income levels:

ı	Income L'imit	Affordable Housing Cost
1. Very Low Income	50% of Area Median Income (AMI), adjusted for household size	30% of 50% AMI
2. Low income	80% of AMI, adjusted for household size	30% of 60% AMI
3. Moderate Income	120% of AMI, adjusted for household size	30% of 110% AMI

DRA produced, under separate cover, a comprehensive review of Federal, State, and private sources of funding that might be used to subsidize affordable rental and ownership housing in Tustin. For ownership housing, per unit mortgage assistance, as available, generally reduces the gap on a dollar for dollar basis. For rental developments, the use of the Low Income Housing Tax Credit Program and/or tax-exempt bonds is more complicated, because of the formulas for calculating tax credits and the specific income targeting required.

Therefore, for the rental prototype, we have examined the following leverage scenarios:

- 9% Low Income Housing Tax Credits (Federal only)<sup>1</sup>;
- 2. 4% tax credits with tax-exempt bonds; and
- 3. 4% tax credits, tax-exempt bonds, and the Multifamily Housing Program (MHP) of the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD).

The assumptions and findings are described in the following section. The sources and uses for each leveraged rental scenario are summarized in **Table 3**.

Since Orange County was designated as a Difficult to Develop Area (DDA) by HUD in 2007, projects in the County are eligible for a 130% basis boost for the calculation of Federal tax credits but are not eligible for State tax credits.

Table 1
Homeowner Per Unit Subsidy Requirements
City of Tustin
2008

Prototype/Unit Bedroom Count	Very Low Income <sup>2</sup>	Low Income <sup>3</sup>	Moderate Income <sup>4</sup>
Prototype/Critic become Cook			
Owner Prototype #1"			
Attached Townhome		4000 400	410E E00
Two Bedroom	\$366,000	\$322,400	\$195,500
Three Bedroom	\$387,800	\$339,400	\$198,400
Four Bedroom	\$426,800	\$374,600	\$222,300
Average	\$393,500	\$345,500	\$205,400
Owner Prototype #2 <sup>6</sup>			
Stacked Flat Condominium		4040.000	£107.100
One Bedroom	\$258,600	\$219,900	\$107,100
Two Bedroom	\$259,000	\$215,500	588,600
Three Bedroom	\$267,100	\$218,800	\$77,800
Four Bedroom	\$290,500	\$238,300	\$86,000
Average	\$268,800	\$223,100	\$89,900
Owner Prototype #37			
High Density Condominium	A . CT FOO	\$368,800	\$256,000
One Bedroom	\$407,500	•	\$262,100
Two Bedrooom	\$432,500	\$389,000	\$352,600
Three Bedroom	\$542,000	\$493,700 6517.200	\$364,800
Four Bedroom	\$569,400	\$517,200 \$442,300	\$308,900
Average	\$487,900	\$442,200	4300,300
Owner Prototype #4 <sup>4</sup>			
Mixed Use, Ground Floor Retail			
One Bedroom	\$491,700	\$453,000	5340,200
Two Bedrooom	\$537,400	\$493,900	\$366,900
Three Bedroom	\$595,000	\$546,600	\$405,600
Average	\$541,300	\$497,800	<b>\$</b> 370,900

Source: David Paul Rosen & Associates

# Notes to Table 1:

- <sup>1</sup> Per unit subsidy requirements are calculated as per unit total development cost less affordable home purchase price, based on an occupancy standard of one person per bedroom plus one, per California Redevelopment Law. Affordable home purchase price is calculated based on monthly affordable housing expense, inclusive of mortgage principal and interest, property taxes and insurance, utilities and homeowners association (HOA) dues. Calculations are based on the following assumptions: 30-year mortgage interest rate of 8 percent; average property tax rate of 1.20 percent; property insurance costs of \$50 per month; HOA dues of \$175 per month; and a utility allowance calculated based on County of Orange, Housing and Community Services Department utility allowance schedule, effective October 1, 2006.
- <sup>2</sup>Very low income owner affordable housing is cost calculated as 30 percent of 50 percent of AMI, adjusted for household size. Average very low income affordable home purchase price is \$70,764.
- <sup>3</sup> Low income owner affordable housing cost is calculated as 30 percent of 70 percent of AMI, adjusted for household size. Average low income affordable home purchase price is \$116,457.
- <sup>4</sup> Moderate income owner affordable housing cost is calculated as 35 percent of 110 percent of AMI, adjusted for household size. Average moderate income affordable home purchase price is \$249,723.
- <sup>5</sup> Owner Prototype #1 average unit size is 1,296 square feet. Average per unit development cost is 5468,663. Per unit development costs are adjusted by unit size/bedroom count.
- Owner Prototype #2 average unit size is 1,142 square feet. Average per unit development cost is \$339,591. Per unit development costs are adjusted by unit size/bedroom count.
- <sup>7</sup> Owner Prototype #3 average unit size is 1,350 square feet. Average per unit development cost is \$558,617. Per unit development costs are adjusted by unit size/bedroom count.
- Owner Prototype #4 average unit size is 1,515 square feet. Average per unit development cost is \$608,112. Per unit development costs are adjusted by unit size/bedroom count.

Table 2
Tenant Per Unit Subsidy Requirements
Rental Housing Prototype: Stacked Flat Apartments
City of Tustin
2008

# Renter Prototype Stacked Flat Apartments

Unit Bedroom Count	Very Low Income <sup>2</sup>	Low Income <sup>3</sup>	Moderate Income <sup>4</sup>	
One Bedroom <sup>5</sup>	\$311,300	\$294,600	\$211,400	
Two Bedroom <sup>6</sup>	\$348,000	\$329,300	\$235,600	
Three Bedroom <sup>7</sup>	\$3,21,800	\$301,000	\$197,000	
Four Bedroom <sup>8</sup>	\$402,000	\$379,600	\$174,800	
Averag <b>e</b>	<b>\$</b> 345,775	\$326,125	\$204,700	

Source: David Paul Rosen & Associates.

# Notes to Table 2:

- ¹ Tenant per unit subsidy requirements are calculated as per unit total development cost less per unit tenant supported debt. Tenant supported debt is calculated based on tenant monthly operating income which equals: affordable monthly rent, inclusive of utilities, less a monthly per unit operating cost of \$300, property taxes assumed at an average annual rate of 1.20 percent; and a 3 percent vacancy rate. Tenant supported debt calculations are based on a 30-year mortgage interest rate of 8 percent and a debt coverage ratio of 1.25. Affordable monthly rents are based on household income, adjusted for household size assuming an occupancy standard of one person per bedroom plus one, per California Redevelopment Law.
- <sup>2</sup> Very low income renter affordable housing cost is calculated as 30 percent of 50 percent of AMI, adjusted for household size. Average very low income affordable monthly rent is \$847.
- <sup>3</sup> Low income renter affordable housing cost calculated as 30 percent of 60 percent of AMI, adjusted for household size. Average low income affordable monthly rent is \$1,033.
- <sup>4</sup> Moderate income renter affordable housing cost calculated as 30 percent of 110 percent of AMI, adjusted for household size. Average moderate income affordable monthly rent is \$1,963.
- <sup>5</sup>One bedroom unit is 750 square feet. Per unit total development cost is \$321,075.
- \* Two bedroom unit is 950 square feet. Per unit total development cost is \$362,224.
- <sup>7</sup> Three bedroom unit is 1,050 square feet. Per unit total development cost is \$382,799.
- Four bedroom unit is 1,250 square feet. Per unit total development cost is \$423,947.

# Table 3

# Average Per Unit Subsidy Requirements Rental Housing Prototype: Stacked Flat Apartments Leveraged Financing Scenarios City of Tustin 2008

	Renter Prototype Stacked Flat Apartments
Leveraged Financing Scenarios	
9% Tax Credits	\$57,000
4% Tax Credits, Tax-Exempt Bonds	\$140,100
4% Tax Credits, Tax-Exempt Bonds, Multi-Family Housing Program (MHP)	\$109,600

Source: David Paul Rosen & Associates.

This page intentionally left blank.

# APPENDIX B REFERENCES

This page intentionally left blank

# **REFERENCES**

#### A. Documents

- 1. 2000 Census Report. U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census.
- 2. 2010 Census Report. U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census.
- 3. 2007-2011 American Community Survey. U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census.
- 4. Comprehensive Housing Affordability Strategy for Fiscal Years 2007-2008 to 2017-2018, David Paul Rosen & Associates (DRA).
- 5. Marine Corps Air Station (MCAS) Tustin Specific Plan/Reuse Plan, Adopted February 2003, Amendments through June 2007.
- 6. California State Department of Finance, 2013, E-5 Population and Housing Estimates.
- 7. Orange County Projections 2010 Modified, Center for Demographic Research at California State University, Fullerton.
- 8. Orange County Ten Year Plan to End Homelessness, 2012, County of Orange.
- 9. Southern California Association of Governments, Regional Housing Needs Assessment, 2012.
- 10. City of Tustin, Zoning Ordinance.
- 11. City of Tustin, General Plan, as amended through November 2012.
- 12. City of Tustin 2010-2015 Consolidated Plan.
- 13. City of Tustin Comprehensive Annual Financial Report For the Year Ended June 30, 2011.
- 14. City of Tustin Consolidated Annual Performance and Evaluation Report, September 26, 2012.
- 15. Market Overview Report for City of Tustin, Realfacts.
- 16. Third Five-Year Implementation Plan for The Town Center and South Central Redevelopment Project Areas (FY 2005-06 to 2009-2010), Tustin Community Redevelopment Agency, December 2004.
- 17. Final Environmental Impact Statement/Environmental Impact Report (EIS/EIR) for the Disposal and Reuse of MCAS-Tustin (Program EIS/EIR for MCAS-Tustin), January 16, 2001.

- 18. Response to Comments, Final Volume 2 and 3 of Final Environmental Impact Statement/Environmental Impact Report (EIS/EIR) for the Disposal and Reuse of MCAS-Tustin.
- 19. City Council Staff Reports for St. Anton and Irvine Company projects, November 6, 2012.
- 20. State of California, Department of Housing and Community Development, Website.
- 21. Orange County Client Management Information System Year End Progress Report, Orange County Housing Partnership, December 2007
- 22. Orange County Department of Education, Division or School and Community Services, McKinney-Vento Homeless Education Assistance Act, 2006-07.
- 23. 2013 State Income Limits, State Department of Housing and Community Development.
- 24. Marshall & Swift
- 25. State of California Government Code Sections 65580 et seq.

#### B. Persons and Organizations

- Elizabeth A. Binsack, Community Development Director Community Development Department, Tustin (714) 573-3031
- Jerry Craig, Program Manager Tustin Successor Agency (714) 573-3121
- 3. Justina Willkom, Assistant Director Planning Community Development Department, Tustin (714) 573-3115
- 4. Scott Reekstin, Principal Planner Community Development Department, Tustin (714) 573-3016
- 5. Edmelynne Hutter , Associate Planner Community Development Department, Tustin (714) 573-3174

- 6. Lieutenant Steve Lewis Tustin Police Department (714) 573-3271
- 6. Ben Savill Community Housing Advisory Council Regional Center of Orange County
- 7. John Luker Orange County Rescue Mission Village of Hope (714) 247-4300

This page intentionally left blank.

# APPENDIX C MAJOR EMPLOYERS IN TUSTIN

This page intentionally left blank.

# TABLE H- 1 LIST OF MAJOR EMPLOYERS IN TUSTIN, CA 2011

Company/Address	No. Emp.	Product/Service
		·
Young's Market Co LLC	2,100	Distributor
14402 Franklin Ave Tustin, CA 92780		
Tustin Unified School District	1,728	Education
300 South C St. – Tustin 92780		
Lamppost Pizza Corp	1,4001	Corporation
3002 Dow Ave, Tustin, CA	1 204	) ( )
Ricoh Electronics, Inc	1,384	Manufacturer
1100 Valencia Ave Tustin, 92780	900	Distributor,
Tosiba America Medical Systems 2441 Michelle Dr Tustin, 92780	900	Medical Equipment
Rockwell Collins - (714) 317-8102	600	Manufacturer
14192 Franklin Ave. – Tustin, 92780	000	Manufacturei
Costco Wholesale	450	Wholesale Trade
2700 Park Ave. – Tustin 92780; 2655 El Camino Real, Tustin, CA	430	vviiolesale IIaac
Cherokee International	350	Power Supplies
2841 Dow Ave. – Tustin, 92780	350	1 ower supplies
City of Tustin	300	Government
300 Centennial Way – Tustin 92780		Government
Raj Manufacturing Inc	260	Manufacturing
2692 Dow Ave, Tustin, CA		8
Cash Plus Inc	250	Financial Services
3002 Dow Ave, Tustin, CA		
Kleen Impressions	250	Cleaning Services
17300 17th St # J Pmb 388, Tustin, CA		
Ricoh Business Solutions	250	Business Services
1123 Warner Ave Tustin, CA 92780		
Southern California Pipeline	235	Construction
15991 Red Hill Ave, Tustin, CA		
Home Depot	203	Retail
2782 El Camino Real – Tustin, 92780		
Health South Tustin Rehab Hospital	200	Medical
14851 Yorba St, Tustin, CA	200	**** 1 1 5 1
Logomark, Inc.	200	Wholesale Trade
1201 Bell Ave. – Tustin 92780	2001	D + 11
Red Robin Gourmet Burgers <sup>2</sup>	$200^{1}$	Retail
3015 El Camino Real, Tustin, CA	200	Manufacturar
SMC Corporation of America 14191 Myford Rd. – Tustin 92780	200	Manufacturer
Straub Distributing Company <sup>3</sup>	200	Wholesale Trade
2701 Dow Ave. – Tustin, 92780	200	vviiolesale Trade
Tustin Toyota	200	Automotive Dealer
36 Auto Center Dr, Tustin, CA		12dionionve Deuter
SOURCE: City of Tustin Comprehensive Annual Financial Report For the Year		
Ended June 30, 2011		
<sup>1</sup> The employee count appears to include those employed at locations outside of Tustin.		
<sup>2</sup> Red Robin Gourmet Burgers was located at 3015 El Camino Real in 2011 and has		
relocated to 2667 Park Avenue.		
<sup>3</sup> Straub Distributing Company was located in Tustin in 2011, but is no longer doing		
business in Tustin.		<u> </u>

This page intentionally left blank.