

To: Brazos G RWPG Members

From: Kristi Shaw, P.E.

Project: Brazos G 2016 Plan

CC: David Dunn, P.E.

Date: 3/31/2014

Job No: 000000000176238

RE: Evaluation of Water Loss Reduction as a Water Management Strategy for Brazos G RWPG Consideration for the 2016 Brazos G Plan

The TWDB provided results of their 2010 Water Loss Audit on December 5, 2011 for regional water planning groups to consider when developing the regional water plans (Texas Administrative Code §357.34 (f)(2)D). Furthermore, water management strategy evaluations for the 2016 Brazos G Plan are to take into account anticipated water losses associated with each strategy when calculating the quantity of water delivered and treated, according to TWDB guidelines (Texas Administrative Code §357.34 (d)(3)A). Figure 1 summarizes the TWDB-compiled water loss audit data for Brazos G, which shows an annual water loss of 13.67 billion gallons¹ (or 16.1%) for the region based on 234 audits submitted from Brazos G municipal water user groups. The reported water losses include both real and apparent losses. Real Loss is water lost through distribution system leakage and line breaks; Apparent Loss includes water that was not read accurately by a meter, unauthorized consumption, including water taken by theft, and data analysis errors. The opportunity for water savings for Brazos G entities lies in water management strategies to reduce Real Loss, which amounts to 10.9 billion gallons annually in Brazos G.

Municipal water entities seeking infrastructure replacement programs to reduce water loss may be eligible for state supported programs, including State Water Implementation Fund for Texas (SWIFT), which has been allocated \$2 billion to make financing of water projects more affordable and provide consistent state financial assistance for development of water supply projects identified in the State Water Plan.

It is important to note that the water loss data provided by the TWDB are often inaccurate, and rely heavily on entity-reported information. HDR's evaluation is based on reported Main Line Miles, Service Connection Density, System Input Volume, and Real Loss values.

For the 2016 Brazos G Plan, HDR recommends that the Brazos G RWPG consider recommending infrastructure replacement programs for municipal entities that report real losses greater than 15% of water system input volume. Ninety-five (95) of the 234 reported entities, or 40%, report real losses exceeding 15%, as shown in Table 1. The real losses for these entities range from 15% to 99%.² For these entities, the water management strategy to consider recommending would consist of a water loss program targeting annual replacement of 5% of a utility's existing water main lines. This would replace the entire existing distribution system (100%) in 20 years. Note that this does not deal

¹ The statewide total water loss for Texas is estimated at about 16.7%.

² Ten entities report real losses exceeding 50%, which is likely erroneous data. HDR will review the data reported for these 10 entities and revise water loss recommendations accordingly.

with new distribution system infrastructure installed to accommodate growth and expansion of the system, but only with losses experienced from a utility's existing distribution system.

Some water losses are still expected to occur from the replaced system due to aging, pipe joints, minor connection leaks, and other factors (estimated at 5% of existing system input). For this reason, the full 20-year pipe replacement program is assumed to provide a total water savings to achieve an ultimate real loss of 5% from a utility's existing distribution system after 20 years.

This total water savings is divided by 20 years to calculate the annual water savings expected through annual replacement of 5% of the existing water supply mains. This assumes that losses are distributed uniformly over the existing distribution system. In early years of a main replacement program, however, areas with higher loss rates would be identified and likely replaced first, depending upon coordination with other utilities (sewer, electric, gas, telecommunications) and the municipality's plans for pavement replacement. Water savings, therefore, would actually be greater in the early years of the main replacement program because the larger loss areas of a system would be targeted and corrected earliest.

The cost of line replacement, at 5% of the utility's main lines annually, was estimated based on the Unified Costing Model Tool for Regional Water Planning with the following assumptions:

- Entities reporting < 32 connections per mile were assumed to be more rural in nature. The pipeline unit cost was assumed for 12" diameter replacement in soil in a rural environment at a cost of \$35 per linear foot³ (or \$184,500 per mile).
- Entities reporting > 32 connections per mile were assumed to be more urban in nature. Pipeline unit cost was assumed for 16" diameter replacement in soil in an urban environment at a cost of \$81 per linear foot³ (or \$427,680 per mile).

The annual cost of pipe replacement varies from \$18,480 to \$7,854,000 depending on the utility and number of water main line miles reported. The annual unit costs for a 10-year program amortized over 20 years range from \$20 per acre-foot of water saved to more than \$2.5 million/acft, based strictly upon the loss data and number of miles of pipe reported in data provided by the TWDB. Obviously the water loss data need to be reviewed individually for each utility for which this option might be considered as a water management strategy. Overall, as shown by this initial analysis, pipe replacement programs generally are expensive.

Note that the quality of much of these data, including System Input Volume (water supplied), is questionable and can lead to erroneous savings, annual replacement costs, and unit cost estimates. These data will need to be reviewed individually for each WUG for which this water management strategy is considered.

HDR requests that the Brazos G RWPG consider the methodology proposed by HDR, with the recognition that some data will need to be corrected in the final analysis.

³ The unit costs include installed cost of the pipeline and appurtenances, such as markers, valves, thrust restraint systems, corrosion monitoring and control equipment, air and vacuum valves, blow-off valves, erosion control, revegetation of rights-of-way, fencing and gates.

Region G 234 Audits Submitted		Billed Consumption 68,770,533,432 81.1%	Billed Metered 68,730,355,630 81.0%	Revenue Water 68,770,533,432 81.1%
Authorized Consumption 71,214,766,011 84.0%	Unbilled Consumption 2,444,232,579 2.9%	Unbilled Metered 732,300,997 0.9%	Unbilled Unmetered 1,711,931,582 2.0%	Non-revenue Water 16,058,754,134 18.9%
System Input Volume 84,814,159,505	Apparent Loss 3,486,636,482 4.1%	Unauthorized Consumption 195,052,528 0.2%	Customer Meter Accuracy Loss 2,893,259,955 3.4%	
Water Loss 13,672,505,378 16.1%	Systematic Data Handling Discrepancy 398,324,000 0.5%	Reported Breaks and Leaks 3,070,665,979 3.6%	Real Loss 10,949,177,116 12.9%	Unreported Loss 9,421,897,213 11.1%

Figure 1 – TWDB Water Loss Audit Summary for Brazos G (TWDB, December 2011)

Table 1 – Summary of Brazos G Water Loss Audit and Estimated Savings and Costs with Pipe Replacement Program

Utility Name	Retail Pop Served 20,606,300	Main Line Miles Av = 46.6	Service Connection Input Volume (gallons)	Real Loss (gallons)	Total Water Savings Needed to Achieve 5% Real Loss (gallons)	Annual Water Savings Needed to Achieve 5% Real Loss (gallons)	Amount of Pipe to Be Replaced Annually to Achieve 100% Replacement in 20 years	Annual Cost (\$)	Cost of 10 Year Program (\$)	Amortized Annual Cost of 10 Year Program (\$)	Unit Cost (\$ per foot saved)
LEE COUNTY WSC	10,000	700	5	290,230,140	44,235,160.00	15%	29,723,653	1,466,162.65	35,00	\$6,468,000	\$64,680,000
CITY OF TERUCAINA	307	12	14	10,141,000	1,584,28,33	16%	1,077,078	53,863,92	0.60	\$110,880	\$118,668
BLOCK HOUSE MUD	5,055	17	129	243,333,330	38,269,160.00	16%	26,102,544	1,305,126.18	0.85	\$363,528	\$36,140
CITY OF FLORINCE	1,148	4	110	54,917,356	8,655,487,73	16%	5,905,980	295,289,00	0.20	\$85,536	\$7,395
CITY OF WOODWAY	8,733	81	47	807,365,385	127,598,208,20	16%	87,227,939	4,361,396,95	4.05	\$17,72,104	\$7,898
WOODROW OSCEOLA WSC BLANTON WELL PLANT 1	2,046	100	7	59,030,396	9,586,470,71	16%	6,634,951	331,747,55	5.00	\$924,000	\$9,240,000
NORTH HAMILTON HILL WSC	51	3	9	3,000,000	490,000,00	16%	340,000	17,000,00	0.15	\$27,720	\$27,720
H & H WSC	1,933	48	11	44,526,238	7,294,788,50	16%	5,068,477	253,423,33	2.40	\$433,520	\$61,358
CITY OF MOUNT CALM	310	10	10	10,963,710	1,793,440.00	17%	1,250,305	62,515,23	0.50	\$92,400	\$40,302
439 WSC	6,459	60	36	324,142,000	55,305,900,00	17%	39,098,800	1,954,940,00	3.00	\$12,833,040	\$17,896
STEELE CREEK HARBOR	468	12	13	5,722,424	976,383,80	17%	690,263	34,513,13	0.60	\$110,880	\$822,067
PENELOPE WSC	198	2	47	6,057,300	1,038,356,26	17%	735,459	36,773,46	0.10	\$42,768	\$21,712
CITY OF ABBOTT	356	5	44	20,346,530	3,518,100,00	17%	2,500,774	125,038,68	0.25	\$106,920	\$1,069,200
BLAIR WSC	966	290	1	15,616,000	2,711,650,00	17%	1,935,750	96,787,50	14.50	\$2,679,600	\$26,796,000
MULTI-COUNTY WSC	3,576	400	3	85,789,710	15,115,000,00	18%	10,825,565	541,277,50	20.00	\$3,696,000	\$36,960,000
LEROY TOURS GERALD WSC	1,557	35	14	48,008,710	8,582,256,00	18%	6,179,815	308,980,73	1.75	\$323,400	\$3,234,000
CITY OF MALONE	264	2	63	9,973,873	1,787,970,63	18%	1,289,277	64,463,85	0.10	\$42,768	\$18,090
ARMSTRONG WSC	2,526	90	9	105,319,000	18,882,860,00	18%	13,671,010	680,850,50	4.50	\$831,600	\$83,160,000
ROBERTSON COUNTY WSC	2,670	270	4	108,337,448	19,563,165,60	18%	14,283,293	711,914,66	13.50	\$2,494,800	\$24,948,000
ROSS WSC	2,388	69	12	76,044,140	13,897,560,00	18%	10,195,480	509,774,48	3.45	\$637,560	\$63,756,000
SANTO SUD	2,550	103	8	77,414,100	14,470,464,75	19%	10,589,760	529,987,98	5.15	\$951,720	\$95,172,000
CENTRAL WASHINGTON COUNTY WSC	2,049	96	7	59,704,950	11,197,540,00	19%	8,212,293	41,614,63	4.80	\$887,040	\$88,704,000
CITY OF CEDAR PARK	57,553	320	59	3,776,235,000	714,615,800,00	19%	525,802,050	26,290,102,50	16.00	\$6,842,880	\$68,423,800
STEPHENS REGIONAL SUD	3,132	250	6	102,711,939	19,998,858,43	19%	14,863,111	743,155,57	12.50	\$2,310,000	\$23,100,000
DOG RIDGE WSC	4,428	6	246	186,828,620	36,473,560,00	20%	27,468,559	1,373,840,66	0.30	\$128,304	\$128,304
WEST BELL COUNTY WSC	3,800	67	19	205,272,242	40,539,375,92	20%	30,276,261	1,513,813,04	3.35	\$61,190,800	\$11,151,151
CITY OF ASPENMONT	1,000	60	10	79,228,000	15,845,413,67	20%	11,884,014	594,200,68	3.00	\$554,400	\$54,544,000
WOODROW OSCEOLA WSC PLEASANT VWW	1,278	100	4	36,200,396	7,326,304,39	20%	5,516,585	275,829,23	5.00	\$924,000	\$9,240,000
CITY OF MEADA	10,080	85	32	43,814,000	89,787,530,00	21%	67,886,830	3,394,841,50	4.25	\$7,097,907	\$7,097,907
CITY OF CONANCHE	4,482	250	7	163,388,857	34,416,432,78	21%	26,222,000	1,311,001,00	13.50	\$2,310,000	\$23,100,000
CITY OF HASKELL	3,106	48	31	162,137,500	34,355,488,67	21%	26,243,615	1,312,160,73	2.40	\$443,520	\$44,352,000
CITY OF TASCA	875	9	69	61,052,334	13,057,887,39	21%	10,005,366	500,268,29	0.45	\$192,456	\$19,245,600
ELM CREEK WSC	4,170	225	6	143,569,010	31,125,350,00	22%	23,946,900	1,197,344,98	11.25	\$2,079,000	\$20,790,000
POST OAK SUD	2,500	350	2	113,056,010	24,589,326,53	22%	18,938,777	946,828,83	17.50	\$3,234,000	\$32,340,000
CHALK BLUFF WSC	3,438	47	24	119,987,818	26,438,32,57	22%	20,439,042	1,021,952,08	2.35	\$434,280	\$43,428,000
FILES VALLEY WSC	3,024	206	5	47,783,005	44,737,937,92	22%	34,746,755	1,737,77,75	10.30	\$128,304	\$128,304
CEDAR SHORES WATER CORPORATION	4,086	83	16	112,125,569	25,234,185,16	23%	19,627,907	981,395,34	1.95	\$360,360	\$36,036,000
HILTOP WSC	855	35	8	26,262,000	5,926,441,00	23%	4,613,311	230,655,55	0.50	\$92,400	\$9,240,000
JONAH WATER SUD	13,988	390	13	589,370,000	133,798,000,00	23%	104,311,500	5,215,575,00	19.50	\$3,603,600	\$36,036,000
FORT BELKNAP WSC	6,156	750	3	186,025,000	42,284,630,00	23%	32,933,30	1,649,169,00	37.50	\$6,980,000	\$69,300,000
CEGO DURANGO WSC	870	119	3	50,968,397	11,73,738,00	23%	9,183,316	459,165,81	5.95	\$1,099,560	\$10,995,600
WHITE ROCK WSC 2 FOREST GLADE	636	7	30	9,379,100	2,177,773,47	23%	1,708,818	85,440,92	0.35	\$64,680	\$6,648,000
CITY OF TOLAR	1,632	39	14	46,288,000	11,068,000,00	24%	8,751,200	437,560,00	1.95	\$32,456	\$3,245,600
CITY OF CARBON	954	10	32	28,117,551	6,730,324,48	24%	5,324,747	266,237,35	0.50	\$92,400	\$9,240,000
EAST BELL WSC	660	17	13	16,075,150	3,879,332,42	24%	3,075,530	1,53,779,00	0.85	\$157,080	\$15,708,000
CITY OF MERREL	3,500	475	2	108,330,154	26,326,241,30	24%	20,880,234	1,044,011,68	23.75	\$4,389,000	\$43,890,000
CITY OF GOREE	2,842	29	42	10,972,700	2,687,438,50	24%	971,235,00	1,424,060	1.45	\$620,136	\$62,013,60
	321	10	10	10,972,700	2,687,438,50	24%	2,138,804	106,940,18	0.50	\$92,400	\$9,240,000
											\$71,787

Table 1 – Summary of Brazos G Water Loss Audit and Estimated Savings and Costs with Pipe Replacement Program (concluded)

Utility Name	Retail Pop Served 20,686,300	Main Line Connection Density/mm Av = 46.6	Service Density/mm Miles	System Input Volume (gallons)	Real Loss (gallons)	Total 20 Year Water Savings Needed to Achieve 5% Real Loss (gallons)	Annual Water Savings (mi) to Be Achieved 5% Real Loss in 20 years	Annual Cost to Achieve 100% Replacement in 20 years	Cost 10 Year Program (\$)	Amortized Annual Cost of Program (\$)	Unit Cost (\$ per a/cft saved)
BRUSHY CREEK MUD	19,630	63	100	1,087,000,000	266,990,000,000	25%	212,640,000	10,632,000,000	3.15	\$1,347,192	\$3,455
WHITE ROCK WSC	240	6	13	6,130,000	1,522,780,00	25%	1,216,250	60,814,00	0.30	\$55,440	\$24,857
ROCKY CREEK WATER SYSTEM	3,132	38	27	81,986,666	20,423,677,74	25%	16,328,844	816,442,22	1.90	\$351,120	\$3,512,000
CITY OF KOSE	4,487	19	13	17,071,700	4,380,960,22	26%	176,325,26	0.95	0.95	\$175,560	\$1,755,600
CITY OF CALDWELL	4,104	45	42	244,203,061	64,015,917,32	26%	51,801,764	2,590,089,21	2.25	\$962,280	\$9,622,800
TRI COUNTY SUD	4,075	430	4	197,983,124	54,192,758,29	27%	44,283,602	2,214,680,11	21.50	\$3,973,200	\$48,918
MORTON VALLEY WSC	500	55	4	25,765,000	7,222,587,50	28%	5,983,338	296,666,88	2.75	\$508,200	\$5,082,000
CENTRAL BOSQUE WSC	990	60	5	45,014,100	12,708,194,29	28%	10,489,169	522,955,46	3.00	\$52,944,00	\$2,944,000
CITY OF JAYTON	285	20	14	32,596,575	9,303,474,37	28%	7,673,646	383,682,28	1.00	\$184,800	\$1,848,000
CITY OF ROCKDALE	5,955	60	41	325,718,180	95,963,980,00	29%	79,078,071	3,953,903,55	3.00	\$1,283,040	\$12,830,400
CITY OF GEORGETOWN	51,000	360	58	4,929,642,860	1,421,956,880,00	29%	59,024,932,85	1,180,498,657	18.00	\$7,698,240	\$76,982,400
CITY OF ROSCOE	1,271	20	27	53,338,776	17,121,050,21	32%	14,424,111	721,205,57	1.00	\$1,184,800	\$1,184,800
CITY OF OGLESBY	828	30	9	35,101,400	11,180,666,76	32%	9,425,487	471,274,84	1.50	\$277,200	\$27,720,000
KEMPNER WSC	14,908	360	14	1,527,656,720	500,038,950,00	33%	423,656,014	21,182,800,70	18.00	\$3,326,400	\$33,326,400
TUSCOLA-TAYLOR COUNTY WCID 1	714	10	38	48,210,000	15,820,000,00	33%	13,409,500	670,475,00	0.50	\$21,380,00	\$8,696,000
CEDRON CREEK RANCH WATER SUPPLY	283	9	11	7,716,162	2,584,631,83	33%	2,198,824	109,941,19	0.45	\$83,160	\$831,600
CITY OF MUNDAY	1,300	16	23	84,210,530	28,210,530,00	34%	24,000,004	1,200,000,18	0.80	\$147,840	\$1,478,000
GAUSE WSC	1,015	24	14	22,671,895	7,688,950,00	34%	6,551,455	327,572,76	1.20	\$221,760	\$22,176,00
SHACKELFORD WSC	2,616	220	4	71,637,760	24,383,720,00	34%	20,805,432	1,040,271,60	11.00	\$2,032,800	\$20,328,000
CITY OF CISCO	3,851	150	10	200,073,367	68,346,076,94	34%	58,312,349	2,915,617,43	7.50	\$1,386,000	\$13,360,000
CONANICHE COUNTY WSC REATILE	948	189	2	21,402,010	7,303,300,00	34%	4,239,200	311,989,98	9.45	\$17,746,360	\$17,746,360
SHILOH WSC	565	21	9	16,668,032	5,633,903,85	34%	4,815,504	240,775,21	1.05	\$1,940,400	\$1,940,400
CITY OF RULE	636	11	30	26,985,000	9,138,956,00	35%	7,834,200	391,710,00	0.55	\$1,016,640	\$1,016,640
PRARIE HILL WSC	2,004	523	1	63,663,366	22,346,064,94	35%	19,168,437	958,421,83	26.15	\$4,832,520	\$48,322,520
SOUTHWEST MILAM WSC	8,925	575	5	43,500,940	15,228,780,00	36%	13,489,733	6,673,486,65	28.75	\$53,330,000	\$53,330,000
JARRELL SCHWERTNER WSC	4,350	210	7	209,554,400	77,351,400,74	37%	66,878,673	3,343,933,67	10.50	\$1,940,400	\$15,940,400
BELL MILAM FALLS WSC	4,568	170	11	220,115,688	83,139,703,31	38%	72,138,925	3,606,946,24	8.50	\$1,570,800	\$15,708,000
STAFF WSC OLDEN AREA	1,569	40	14	31,608,700	12,096,16,03	38%	10,511,581	5,579,075	2.00	\$369,600	\$3,696,000
MURRAY HILL WATER SYSTEM	1,278	35	12	50,059,093	19,495,086,13	38%	16,982,231	847,611,57	1.75	\$32,400	\$32,400,000
CHAPPELL HILL WSC	657	9	24	28,000,000	10,790,226,32	39%	9,390,526	469,554,32	0.45	\$83,160	\$831,600
MARLOW WSC	480	29	7	25,549,74	9,988,963,16	39%	8,711,399	435,569,47	1.45	\$267,560	\$2,675,600
CITY OF WEINERT	177	9	11	16,070,226	6,328,702,38	39%	6,526,166	2,708,30	0.45	\$83,160	\$831,600
LAKESHORE WATER SYSTEM	1,428	27	18	28,009,812	12,103,984,65	42%	10,663,125	533,156,25	1.35	\$249,480	\$249,480,000
NORTH MILAM WSC	1,348	154	4	63,068,815	26,652,715,40	42%	23,499,225	1,174,961,23	7.70	\$1,422,860	\$14,229,000
LCRA LOMETA REGIONAL WATER SYSTEM	2,769	223	4	146,131,935	66,822,693,78	45%	59,291,057	2,984,554,85	11.15	\$2,060,520	\$20,605,200
W & H WATER SUPPLY	135	2	23	6,392,000	3,101,074,27	47%	3,900,526	1,486,612,21	0.10	\$18,480	\$18,480,000
RRA TRUSCOTT GILLILAND WATER SYSTEM	202	90	1	11,975,600	5,713,935,70	48%	5,115,156	285,757,79	4.50	\$831,600	\$831,600
CITY OF LUEDERS	300	12	15	22,738,154	11,138,027,70	50%	10,301,120	515,056,00	0.60	\$11,085,800	\$5,870,000
MUSTANG VALLEY WSC	3,000	150	4	143,115,000	77,058,440,00	54%	69,887,690	3,494,384,50	7.50	\$1,386,000	\$13,860,000
HOG CREEK WSC	297	49	5	50,511,281	27,870,609,61	55%	25,345,046	1,267,252,28	2.45	\$452,760	\$4,527,600
CITY OF HARRICK HEIGHTS	26,700	171	56	2,986,930,000	1,718,400,000,00	57%	1,568,923,500	78,446,175,00	8.55	\$3,656,640	\$36,566,640
BRANDON IRINE WSC	2,069	54	13	172,315,000	109,886,583,08	63%	100,985,833	5,047,791,65	2.70	\$498,960	\$4,989,600
CADE LAKES WSC	444	12	12	23,717,720	15,615,970,00	66%	14,451,384	721,569,20	0.60	\$110,380	\$8,108,800
CITY OF LUEDERS	546	80	3	54,686,296	42,456,663,20	77%	39,707,248	1,985,362,42	4.00	\$739,200	\$57,392,000
WESTBOUND WSC CISCO SOURCE	2,400	850	1	24,490	24,120,00	98%	1,144,78	42,50	57,834,000	\$187,071,666	
CHAT WSC	864	83	3	33,221,895	33,219,778,52	98%	31,529,684	1,576,484,19	4.15	\$766,920	\$13,265,920
BLUESONNET WSC	-	51	0	39,756,000	38,885,860,00	99%	36,910,060	1,845,503,00	2.55	\$471,240	\$4,712,400
Total (Entities Evaluated for Water Loss Program)				23,423,463,745	7,078,118,029		5,906,944,841	285,347,242	611	\$128,019,936	\$1,280,199,360
											\$190,884,922